Popes and the Papacy: A History

Part I

Professor Thomas F. X. Noble

THE TEACHING COMPANY ®

Thomas F. X. Noble, Ph.D.

Professor of History, Notre Dame University

Thomas Noble is the Robert M. Conway Director of the Medieval Institute and Professor of History at the University of Notre Dame. He assumed his current position in January of 2001 after teaching for 20 years at the University of Virginia and 4 years at Texas Tech University.

Professor Noble earned his B.A. in history at Ohio University and his M.A. and Ph.D. in medieval history at Michigan State University, where he studied with the distinguished medievalist Richard E. Sullivan. During his years as a graduate student, Professor Noble held a Fulbright-Hays Fellowship, which took him to Belgium for a year and gave him the opportunity to study with François-Louis Ganshof and Léopold Génicot. Subsequently, he has been awarded two fellowships by the National Endowment for the Humanities, two research grants by the American Philosophical Society, and a visiting fellowship in Clare Hall (University of Cambridge).

Professor Noble's research interests are concentrated in the late antique and early medieval periods (A.D. 300–1000). He has worked on religious history, the history of Rome and the papacy, and the age of Charlemagne. His first book, *The Republic of St. Peter* (1984; Italian translation, 1997) explored the origins of papal temporal rule. Dr. Noble has also edited four volumes and has written more than a dozen articles on Roman and papal history as a preparatory to a history of the papacy from its origins to 1046. Shortly, Dr. Noble will complete a long monograph, *Images and the Carolingians*, itself preceded by six articles, which explores controversies over religious art in the 8th and 9th centuries, set against the background of late-antique and Byzantine art discourse. In 2004, Houghton-Mifflin published the fourth edition of his successful coauthored textbook, *Western Civilization: The Continuing Experiment*.

Dr. Noble has been a member of the Institute for Advanced Study (Princeton) and the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study (Wassenaar). In 2002, he was elected a Fellow of the Societa Internazionale per lo Studio del Medioevo Latino (Florence) and, in 2004, was elected a Fellow of the Medieval Academy of America. Dr. Noble currently serves on the editorial boards of *Speculum* and *Church History* and has held offices and/or served on committees in the American Academy of Religion, the American Catholic Historical Association, the American Historical Association, and the Medieval Academy of America.

Professor Noble has taught courses in Western civilization for more than 25 years, along with surveys of medieval Europe and Church history. He has also taught advanced courses in late antiquity and Carolingian history. In 1999, Professor Noble was presented with the Alumni Distinguished Professor Award at the University of Virginia, that institution's highest award for teaching excellence, and a Harrison award for outstanding undergraduate advising. Dr. Noble has supervised 11 dissertations, and his Ph.D. students now teach at colleges and universities across the country.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Table of Contents

Popes and the Papacy: A History
Part I

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Popes and the Papacy: A History

Scope:

The papacy is the oldest continuously functioning institution in the world. Indeed, in all the world's history, only a few institutions can trace so long an unbroken history. This fact alone commands attention. And if anyone wonders whether that story still matters, we have only to think about the rapt attention that the world lavished in 2005 on the death of Pope John Paul II and the election of his successor, Benedict XVI. Four million people streamed into Rome, and many people waited up to 30 hours to pay their respects to John Paul. Media outlets all over the globe devoted almost continuous coverage to the solemn events that marked the passing of one pontificate and the inception of another.

What, then, is papal history? At its core, it is four histories. The first is the history of an idea, the idea of the *Petrine Office* and of the *ecclesiology*—that's a theologian's word for the theory of Church government—that flows from that office. Second, it is the history of an institution. The Catholic Church has one pope at a time (albeit sometimes, there have been two or more men claiming to be legitimate pope!), but the papacy is an institution that transcends time. Americans are familiar with separating presidents from the presidency. So, too, we shall learn to distinguish between popes and the papacy. Third, it is the serial biography of 265 men, some holy and some wicked, some efficient and some incompetent, some learned and some simple, some visionary and some blinkered. There were also more than 30 antipopes from 217 to 1447, and we will meet some of them, as well. Fourth, the history of the popes and the papacy is, in some ways, a mirror of the history of Western civilization itself. At every great moment and turning point, the popes were there as participants, promoters, or critics. Viewing Western civilization through a papal lens will open for us unique perspectives on the end of the Roman Empire; the evangelization of Europe; the Crusades; the Renaissance; the Reformation; the Enlightenment; the great movements of modern times, such as industrialization, urbanization, science, and mass politics; and finally, the world wars and the collapse of communism.

Papal history has tended to be written in huge volumes, sometimes many-volume collections, or in highly specialized studies in many languages. As a result, the suggested readings at the end of each lecture in this course often refer to chapters in larger works, as well as to particular studies. Books that themselves contain rich bibliographical information are marked with an asterisk (*) in the bibliography.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture One
What Is Papal History? When Did It Begin?

Scope: This lecture provides some opening, orienting reflections on two basic issues. First, the lecture establishes the four basic themes that will, in differing measures, inform every lecture in the course. That is, the lecture seeks to define papal history in four ways: as an idea, as an institution, as a series of biographies, and as a vantage point for the whole history of Western civilization. Second, the lecture examines the first evidence we have, and the oldest evidence the Roman Church itself has always adduced, for the beginnings of the story. I refer to Christ's words to Peter in the 16th chapter of Matthew's Gospel: "For you are Peter and upon this rock I will build my church." What might these words have meant when they were spoken? How were those words interpreted down to the middle of the 3rd century? How did a persecuted Church survive at the very heart of the Roman world? What support can archaeology and other historical sources bring to our understanding of the first two centuries of papal history? What is at stake, historically and theologically, in how we answer these questions, for not everyone, let alone all Christians, answers these questions in the same way?

Outline

I. The papacy is the oldest continuously functioning institution in the world.

- **A.** Consider that when George Washington took office as the first president of the United States, the 250th pope was reigning and that Pope Benedict, elected in 2005, is the 265th pope.
- **B.** The demise of the papacy has often been predicted and—as we shall see—occasionally seemed imminent.
- **C.** One interesting subject that we will follow is precisely why the papacy has proved so durable.

II. To study the history of the papacy is actually to follow four histories at once. Perhaps in this complexity lies some of the explanation for the papacy's longevity.

- **A.** First, the history of the papacy is the history of an idea: the *Petrine idea*.
  - **1.** This idea takes its name from Peter, the leader of the apostles and, supposedly, the first pope.
  - **2.** The *Petrine Office*—the office that comes down from Peter—is the term used by specialists in *ecclesiology* (the theory of Church government and organization).
- **B.** Second, the history of the papacy is the history of an institution.
  - **1.** Peter had no staff or departments to help him, but gradually, the papacy became one of the most sophisticated and impressive institutions in the world.
  - **2.** The history of any institution must be both bound to and separated from the people who at any moment make up that institution.
- **C.** Third, the history of the papacy is the serial biography of 265 men from Peter to Benedict XVI.
  - **1.** Of some of these men, particularly in early times, we know very little.
  - **2.** Many popes were remarkable, interesting, impressive, and memorable characters, while others were regrettable or forgettable. We will offer some thoughts on why a particular pope might command our attention, but we cannot talk about more than a few of them in any detail.
  - **3.** Sometimes the institution and the men have collided: Between 217 and 1449, some three dozen *antipopes* have laid claim to the papal office.
- **D.** Fourth, the history of the papacy is almost the history of Western civilization in microcosm.
  - **1.** The popes have patronized architects, artists, and builders.
  - **2.** The popes contributed powerfully to the political and legal culture of Europe.
  - **3.** The popes have put their imprint—now approving, now disapproving—on every significant intellectual movement in the last two millennia.
  - **4.** The world is more secular and less Catholic today than formerly, but no figure compares to the pope in prestige and influence.

III. Now, to the beginnings of the history itself: We must start with Peter. Who was he?

- **A.** Only a few details can be pinned down with some certainty.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1. He was a fisherman named Simon from Bethsaida who moved with his family to Capernaum. He was born circa 4 B.C.
2. He had a brother, Andrew, and was married. Tradition accords him a daughter, Petronilla, but this is shaky.
3. He met Jesus in about 28 A.D., and on an early occasion, Jesus asked who people said *he* (Jesus) was. Simon said Jesus was the son of the living God, and Jesus announced that God alone had revealed this to Simon: "You are Simon, the son of John; you will be called Cephas which is rendered Peter" (John 1:42).
4. The Gospels provide a somewhat obscure account of Peter's dawning awareness of Jesus' identity and significance.
5. In Matthew's Gospel (16:16–18), Jesus assigned Peter a leader's role, once again for recognizing his identity: "You are Peter and upon this rock I shall build my church and the gates of Hell shall not prevail against it. I will entrust to you the keys of the kingdom of heaven…."

B. Peter did exercise some sort of leadership among Jesus' early followers.
1. Jesus put direct questions to Peter alone among the apostles.
2. The accounts of the Resurrection of Jesus feature Peter.
3. Peter is the first apostle reported to have performed a miracle. He explained the Pentecost event to the crowds, took the lead in electing Matthias to replace Judas Iscariot, and passed judgment on Ananias and Saphira.
4. Paul (Galatians 2:7–9) recognized Peter as special leader for Jesus' Jewish followers, but in the Acts of the Apostles (15:7), Peter calls himself the leader of Jew and Gentile alike.

IV. We have encountered at the beginning a person and, perhaps, an idea and an institution.

A. Peter was an unlettered fisherman portrayed as a man of both deep faith and cowardice, a bumbler, but also a man of courage and decency.

B. But the first faint stirrings of the Petrine idea are present, even if opaque.

V. Popes belong in Rome, we assume. How did Peter get there?

A. Roman tradition makes Peter the first bishop of the city; hence, the first pope.

B. His dates are given as 42 to 67, but this is unlikely because Peter was probably in Antioch and Corinth at some point during that time and in Jerusalem in 49.

C. Peter did not found the Roman community, and there is no good evidence that that community had a bishop—an "overseer"—in the 1st century.

D. Peter may well have been martyred—traditionally crucified upside down—in the persecutions of Nero between about 64 and 67.

VI. Powerful traditions about Peter grew up in Rome very early, but none of them has any direct basis in New Testament writings.

A. A stone in the Mamertine prison supposedly has the imprint of his head. The Church of Nereus and Achilleus has the *fasciola* of Peter—his leg wrappings or bandages. There is the "Quo vadis?" church (San Sebastiano) on the Appian Way, where it is said that Jesus appeared as Peter fled persecution in Rome and Jesus asked Peter, "Quo vadis?" ("Where are you going?"). The "Separation Church" near St. Paul's Outside the Walls is where Peter and Paul separated. Peter's chains are said to be in San Pietro in Vincoli, and a stone with imprints of his knees is found at Santa Francesca Romana.

B. Another tradition says that Peter was crucified in the circus of Nero on the Vatican Hill.

C. It remains for us to explore how the historical Peter and a batch of traditions that surely have some foundation even if they cannot be proved (or disproved!) turned into "the papacy."

Recommended Reading:

Brown, Donfried, and Reumann, *Peter in the New Testament.*

Shotwell and Loomis, *The See of Peter*, pp. 3–207.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Questions to Consider:

1. What interpretations of Peter's role in the early Church will the New Testament support?
2. What can the *historian* learn from the early legends of Peter?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Two
The Rise of the Petrine Idea

Scope: Papal history changed dramatically in the period between about 300 and 500. Emperor Constantine made Christianity a legal religion. He ended almost two centuries of sporadic persecution and showered favors on the bishops of Rome, the popes. The sources available for the study of papal history expanded exponentially. From those sources, we can catch a first glimpse of an impressive institutional structure coming into being, refining itself to do its work, and assuming new and weighty responsibilities. From those sources, too, we can begin to observe the popes reflecting on the papal office itself. They began to stress Christ's words to Peter and to derive specific rights and obligations—their own and others'—from those words. Popes began to spell out a claim, a claim that was much contested, to primacy in the Church. And they began to define their relationships to the imperial regime and to secular authority more generally.

Outline

I. This lecture focuses on the crucial period from about 300 to 500.

- **A.** The Emperor Constantine (reigned [r.] 306–337) granted the Church legal status and permitted it to function openly.
- **B.** The importance and prestige of the popes rose dramatically in this period.
- **C.** A free and important papacy, however, encountered problems that would, in some cases, last for centuries.
- **D.** Slowly but surely, the popes began to define and reflect on the nature of their office and the powers it entailed.

II. Before we examine this history, however, we must say something about the extremely obscure 2nd and 3rd centuries.

- **A.** We have very few sources, and most of these are late and hard to evaluate.
- **B.** Tradition says that Peter and his successors were bishops of Rome.
- **C.** Perhaps we should clarify what a bishop is: *Episcopus* (Επίσκοπος) means "overseer," "supervisor," "elder."
  - **1.** Bishops emerged as the key Church officials in a particular town or area, with responsibilities for worship, teaching, and recruiting.
  - **2.** By about 150, sources spoke of "monarchical bishops," suggesting that bishops had come to be significant figures in the cities of the Roman world.
- **D.** Pope Clement (r. 88–97) encountered a controversy in Corinth—as had St. Paul!—and wrote to admonish and encourage the community there.
- **E.** Pope Victor (r. 189–198) attempted to impose his will in the matter of the date for celebrating Easter. He had only limited success.
- **F.** In 180, Irenaeus of Lyon spoke of Rome as "the great and illustrious church to which on account of its commanding position every church, that is, the faithful everywhere, must resort." To Irenaeus and others, Rome's "commanding position" derived from its "double apostolicity," the city's ties to Peter and Paul.
- **G.** Pope Urban I (r. 222–230) met a contested election, and Hippolytus set himself up as the first antipope.
  - **1.** This conflict hints at the emerging importance of the office.
  - **2.** It also suggests the presence of factions, contending groups, and arguments.
- **H.** A critical figure was Pope Stephen I (r. 254–257), who was the first, as far as we know, to assert vigorously the Petrine doctrine of Roman authority.
  - **1.** He insisted that he held the "chair of Peter" (*cathedra Petri*) in succession to Peter.
  - **2.** This assertion inaugurates the idea that each pope is Peter's successor.
- **I.** Yet many early popes were martyred, the Roman community was frequently disrupted, and the Church could not function smoothly.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

III. Things changed dramatically with Constantine.

A. There can never be a satisfactory or definitive explanation of why Constantine decided to legalize Christianity, then to convert.

B. Constantine issued the Edict of Milan in 313, making Christianity legal (*religio licita*).

C. Constantine was not merely neutral.

1. He ordered the construction of St. Peter's and St. Paul's basilicas, and he gave the Lateran Palace to Pope Sylvester.

2. He initiated a long series of imperial decrees on behalf of the Church, conferring tax and military exemption, for example.

3. Constantine also intervened in two doctrinal disputes, one involving Donatism and the other, Arianism.

a. Donatism, named for Bishop Donatus, arose in Africa. When Constantine granted legal status to Christianity, most Christians wanted to welcome back those who knuckled under during times of persecution, but the Donatists objected to this forgiveness.

b. Arianism was the great Trinitarian heresy of antiquity. Arius was a priest from Egypt who, in an attempt to preserve monotheism, taught that Jesus Christ was slightly subordinate to God the Father. Arians were declared heretics.

D. Subsequent emperors regularly attempted to impose their will in doctrinal controversies.

1. Emperor Constantius II (r. 337–361), an Arian, bullied Pope Liberius (r. 352–366); Emperor Zeno (r. 474–491) pressured Pope Felix III (r. 483–492) over Monophysitism, the belief that Jesus had only a divine nature.

2. Popes and emperors alike wished to achieve unity in basic teachings but had different political perspectives.

3. Pope Gelasius I (r. 492–496) wrote a famous letter to Emperor Zeno's successor, Anastasius (r. 491–518), explaining how and why priestly *auctoritas* was superior to kingly *potestas*.

IV. The rise of the papacy may be attributed to many causes.

A. Amidst the chaos of the later Roman Empire, Christianity itself seemed more compelling, and the steadfastness of Rome's bishops seemed an attractive alternative to imperial inconsistency.

B. In and around Rome, the popes became more visible and prominent.

1. Popes built magnificent churches.

2. Pope Innocent I (r. 401–417) ministered to Rome after the Gothic sack of 410, and Pope Leo I (r. 440–461) persuaded Attila the Hun (in 452) and Gaiseric the Vandal (in 455) not to sack the city.

3. The popes began to be well connected to Roman society—for good or ill!

C. But Rome's bishops were also playing on a larger stage before a bigger audience.

1. The Council of Serdica in 343 decreed that appeals could go to Rome, and by the time of Innocent I, popes were claiming a prior right to make decisions.

2. Pope Siricius (r. 384–399), the first Roman bishop to use *pope* as a title in the modern sense, issued the first *decretal* (a form of document and practice directly derived from Roman imperial procedure).

3. When, at Church councils in 381 (Constantinople I) and 451 (Chalcedon), the clergy declared Constantinople to be the "New Rome," to be second in dignity and authority after "Old Rome," the popes objected fiercely, saying that their authority derived from Peter, not from Roman history.

D. Indeed, there are many signs of the development of the Petrine argument first met in the pontificate of Stephen I.

1. There was general agreement about the doctrine of apostolic succession and about Peter's leadership of the original community. There was, however, sharp disagreement about how these doctrines were to work in practice.

2. Pope Damasus installed an inscription in San Sebastiano (the "Quo vadis?" church we discussed in Lecture One): "Whoever you may be that seek the names of Peter and Paul, should know that here the saints once dwelt. The East sent the disciples—that we readily admit. But on account of the merit of their blood…Rome has gained the superior right to claim them as citizens."

3. The great exponent of the Petrine powers of the pope was Leo I, one of only two popes called "the Great."

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

a. He imposed his will at the time of the Council of Chalcedon (451).
b. He left behind some 150 letters and 96 sermons—vastly more than any of his predecessors.

4. Leo speaks as both pastor and lawyer. His claims are impressive but not more so than those of Gelasius a little later.

V. Withal, the Roman Church had emerged within the framework of the Roman Empire. What would happen when that empire vanished and Christianity conquered new geographies?

Recommended Reading:

Shotwell and Loomis, *The See of Peter*, pp. 211–715.

Ullmann, *The Growth of Papal Government*, chapter 1.

Questions to Consider:

1. What advantages and disadvantages did the bishops of Rome have in advancing their claims to authority?

2. Why did the doctrine of apostolic succession work particularly to the benefit of the bishops of Rome?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Three
Popes, Byzantines, and Barbarians

Scope: Roman authority around Rome had been weak throughout the 5th century and vanished in 476. From one point of view, the popes were left alone to deal with the new situation. From another point of view, the popes were hemmed in by real and potential enemies. If Rome no longer had emperors, then Constantinople certainly did. And those emperors were keen to impose doctrinal formulations on the popes and did not hesitate to kidnap and browbeat popes to impose their will. Popes had to contend with a series of views they regarded as heretical, from Monophysitism in the 6th century to Iconoclasm in the 8th. These struggles began to loosen papal Rome's ties to the Roman legacy. In Italy, the popes were hemmed in first by Ostrogoths, then by Lombards. The eastern and southern shores of the Mediterranean were lost to emergent Islam. But not all was bleak. The popes sent missionaries to England and supported missionaries in Germany. We can see the popes slowly reorienting their focus from the Mediterranean world to Western Europe. This period also witnessed the pontificate of Gregory I or Gregory the Great, one of the most remarkable of all Peter's successors.

Outline

I. The papacy faced a new world after the collapse of Roman order in the West.

- **A.** The eastern Roman Empire gradually evolved into the Byzantine Empire, and sharp conflicts on many levels separated Rome and Constantinople.
- **B.** Rome's former western provinces had been parceled out in a series of barbarian kingdoms with which the popes entered into varying relationships.

II. The papacy's dealings with imperial Constantinople wavered between hostility and reconciliation, only to end in estrangement.

- **A.** As we have seen, Arianism and Monophysitism had generated serious tension between popes and emperors, on the one hand, and between popes and prominent Eastern churchmen, on the other hand.
- **B.** As the 6th century dawned, Rome and Constantinople were separated owing to the Acacian Schism: Pope Felix III (r. 483–492) had excommunicated Patriarch Acacius (r. 472–489).
- **C.** Emperor Justin I (r. 518–527) was a devout Catholic who wished for religious peace and worked with Pope Hormisdas (r. 514–523) to achieve unity.
  - **1.** More than 2,500 Eastern bishops signed the so-called "Formula of Hormisdas": "I consider the holy churches of God, that of Old Rome and that of New Rome, as one and the same church, the see of Peter the Apostle and the episcopal see of Constantinople as one and the same see…I agree with the pope's profession of doctrine and I censure all whom he censures."
  - **2.** Within a few years, Popes John I (r. 523–526) and Agapitus (r. 535–536) were received in Constantinople with the highest honors.
- **D.** But the unity was soon shattered.
  - **1.** Emperor Justinian (r. 527–565) desired both religious unity in the East and firm union with papal Rome. He could not have both.
    - **a.** His remarkable wife, Theodora (c. 497–548), was an avowed Monophysite, and Justinian wanted to find a formula that did not overtly violate Chalcedon while reconciling the Monophysites.
    - **b.** His court theologians decided to condemn the writings of three relatively obscure Chalcedonians—the so-called "Three Chapters."
    - **c.** Justinian was engaged in the reconquest of Italy and needed papal support, and he wanted papal acquiescence to the condemnation of the Three Chapters.
    - **d.** Pope Silverius (r. 536–537) refused to budge and was arrested and deposed.
    - **e.** Pope Vigilius (r. 537–555) was also arrested but then wavered, finally agreeing to the decisions of the Fifth Ecumenical Council in Constantinople (553).
  - **2.** Rome and most of the West were outraged, but much of the East did not think the condemnation of the Three Chapters went far enough.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

E. As the 7th century progressed, the empire faced first Persian, then Muslim threats in the East, as well as Slavic, Avar, and Bulgar assaults in the Balkans.
  1. Unity was again imperative; thus, Emperor Heraclius (r. 610–641) looked for a formula of reconciliation.
  2. His theologians hit upon *Monoenergism*, which was soon refined into *Monothelitism.*
  3. Pope Honorius I (r. 625–638) accepted Monothelitism and was subsequently condemned in the East and West.
  4. When Pope Martin I (r. 649–655) called a Church council in Rome to refute Monothelite teachings, imperial agents arrested him, brutalized him, and led him in chains to Constantinople, where his mistreatment continued until he died.

F. In 680, Emperor Constantine IV (r. 668–685) held the Sixth Ecumenical Council, which repudiated Monothelitism. This move *might* have restored papal-imperial peace.
  1. Emperor Justinian II (r. 685–695, 705–711) called the Quinisext Council, which issued many decrees that were unacceptable in Rome.
  2. Pope Sergius I (r. 687–701) refused to accept the canons and responded in subtle ways, for instance, inserting the *Agnus Dei* in the Mass.

G. In the 8th century, the situation went from bad to worse.
  1. The imperial government repeatedly tried to raise tax revenues in Italy but would provide no help against the Lombards.
  2. In 726, Emperor Leo III (r. 717–741) began to campaign against icons, and some of his zealous followers—Iconoclasts—began to destroy them. The popes resolutely condemned Iconoclasm.
  3. In response, Leo stripped the papacy of critical revenues from southern Italy and the western Balkans and transferred the allegiance of bishops in those areas to Constantinople.

H. The papacy had arisen in the context of the Roman Empire but now had to think in new geographical and ideological terms.

III. What terms? The answer was gradually provided by the shifting political geography of the post-Roman West.

A. Where there had once been a dense network of prefectures, dioceses, and provinces, there were now kingdoms.

B. These kingdoms posed various problems for papal Rome.
  1. Several kingdoms were ruled by Arian kings: the Ostrogoths, the Visigoths until 589, and the Vandals.
  2. The popes had perforce to deal with the Ostrogoths in Italy, but the regime of King Theodoric (r. 496–526) was enlightened.
  3. Primarily, the popes had no experience in dealing with such peoples or their rulers.

C. Circumstances began to change decisively with Pope Gregory I (r. 590–604).
  1. He struggled to achieve peace with the Lombards and tried hard, but unsuccessfully, to convert them from their Arianism.
  2. When the Visigothic King Reccared (r. 586–601) converted to Catholicism, Gregory entered into relations with him and encouraged him. Gregory also began an exchange of letters with Archbishop Leander of Seville.
  3. Gregory exchanged letters on a wide array of topics with Queen Brunhilde (d. 613) of the Franks, who was reigning as regent for her grandsons.
  4. Most famously, Gregory sent a mission to England in 596 that inaugurated the (re-)conversion of England.

D. As the 7th century progressed and became the 8th, two issues were clear, while many were unclear.
  1. The Greek East and Latin West were drifting apart.
  2. The orientation of the papacy was increasingly Western.

IV. Gregory I or Gregory the Great is the first pope about whom a great deal is known and who can be treated in something like biographical fashion. Let us profile him.

A. He was from a senatorial family and was the great-grandson of Pope Felix III.

B. His youth and upbringing are unknown, but from his voluminous writings, we can see that he was highly educated and widely read.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

C. In 572, the emperor made him prefect of the city of Rome, the highest civil office in the city.

D. After serving only two years, Gregory resigned to become a monk.
   1. He turned his own house on the Caelian Hill into a monastery dedicated to St. Andrew and created six other monasteries on family lands in Sicily.
   2. In 578, the pope made him one of Rome's regionary deacons and, in 579, apocrisiarius to Constantinople. He held that office until 586.
   3. Gregory returned to Rome and to his monastic retreat, but on the death of Pelagius II in an attack of plague, Gregory was unanimously elected pope in 590.

E. Gregory's own writings reveal that he was dispirited by many concerns.

F. Yet, with a truly Roman sense of duty and responsibility, he took to his job energetically.

G. He also wrote voluminously, more originally and brilliantly than any pope before him and more than all but a few after him.

H. This remarkably attractive man, who called himself—as all his successors have done—"Servant of the Servants of God," is perhaps never more impressive than when we realize he was desperately ill his whole adult life.

Recommended Reading:
Markus, *Gregory the Great*.
Richards, *Popes and the Papacy*.

Questions to Consider:
1. What impact did the disappearance of Roman imperial rule from the West have on the emerging papacy?
2. In what ways was Gregory I an exemplary Roman and Christian?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Four
The Popes in the Age of Charlemagne

Scope: The 8th and 9th centuries were decisive for the history of the papacy. As the popes loosened their historical ties to Constantinople, they turned to the Franks for protection from their Lombard foes in Italy. King Pippin III sealed an alliance with Pope Stephen II in 754, and Pippin's famous son, Charlemagne (Charles the Great), confirmed and strengthened that alliance. Pope Leo III crowned Charlemagne emperor in Rome on Christmas Day in 800, in the process laying the foundations for *Christendom*. The popes and the Carolingians—the family of Charles (Carolus) the Great—promoted missionary work, expanded the Church hierarchy, and reformed the Church in Western Europe. Although the popes and the Carolingians worked well together, their very collaboration planted seeds that grew into bitter contention in later centuries as people tried to define the boundary between the realm's royal and priestly power. Peace in Italy also afforded the popes the money and opportunity to rebuild Rome and to decorate its churches with impressive works of art, some of which are still there.

Outline

I. In one of the most famous events of world history, Pope Leo III crowned Charlemagne emperor in St. Peter's basilica on Christmas Day in 800. In this lecture, we shall try to discover why that happened and what it meant.

- **A.** The popes and the Franks—Charlemagne's people—had only sporadic contact before the middle years of the 8th century, but thereafter, their histories became inextricably intertwined.
- **B.** Freed from military and material threats, the papacy prospered.
- **C.** A Western veneration for St. Peter led to a focus on Rome and the popes that enabled a "second Romanization" of Europe.

II. The popes and the Franks first became involved as a result of the papacy's deteriorating relations with Byzantium, Lombard pressures on Rome in Italy, and missionary work in Germany.

- **A.** Theologically and culturally, Byzantium and Rome had been pulling apart for some time, and in the 8th century, Byzantium simply could not spare resources to counter the Lombards in Italy.
- **B.** The Lombard kings ruling from Pavia regarded the Byzantine presence in Italy as an irritant but particularly resented Byzantine control of Ravenna, Rome, and the strip of land connecting the two, because this territory prevented the kings from controlling the autonomous duchies of Spoleto and Benevento.
- **C.** The papacy did not initiate missionary work in the German lands of Central Europe but eagerly supported the labors of Englishmen, such as Willibrord and Boniface, as well as Franks, such as Emmeram and Corbinian, and Irishmen, such as Killian. As the Franks were attempting to expand their influence into this region, mutual interactions were inevitable.

III. Faced with Lombard threats and no help from Byzantium, Pope Gregory III (r. 731–741) wrote twice to Charles Martel, who was mayor of the palace in Francia, the Frankish kingdom.

- **A.** His appeal was without immediate effect, but Gregory began the process of emphasizing to the Franks that Peter was the keeper of the keys of the kingdom of heaven and that the Franks had a moral duty to come to Peter's aid.
- **B.** Gregory and his successor, Pope Zachary (r. 741–752), were in regular contact with Charles's sons, Pippin and Carloman, concerning the mission of St. Boniface and the reform of the Frankish Church.
- **C.** After Carloman retired to Monte Cassino in 747, Pippin, in 749, wrote to Zachary to ask if it were right that the person in Francia who had the royal title had no power, while the person who had all the power lacked the royal title.
  - **1.** Zachary responded that this contravened the divine *ordo*, probably basing himself on Ecclesiastes and St. Augustine.
  - **2.** In 751, Pippin III (r. 751–768) became king of the Franks.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

D. In 751, Aistulf, the Lombard king, conquered Ravenna, the primary Byzantine base in Italy, and began to threaten Rome.
  1. In 752, Pope Stephen II (r. 752–757) appealed in vain to Byzantium and Pavia. By 753, he turned to the Franks and, late in the year, set out to Francia—the first pope to cross the Alps.
  2. Pippin wanted to help the pope, desired further confirmation of his (usurped!) kingship, and had to persuade the Franks to exchange friendship with the Lombards for intervention in Italy.

E. In the end, Stephen crowned and anointed Pippin, and Pippin promised to help the pope in Italy.
  1. In 755 and 756, Pippin campaigned in Italy, defeated Aistulf, and forced him to hand over to Rome all lands he had conquered in Italy.
  2. The so-called "Donation of Pippin" created the first Papal State—the remote ancestor of today's Vatican City. For the first time, the pope was a temporal ruler.

F. For some years, the Franks were bogged down in frontier battles, and the Lombards were emboldened to refuse to hand over the lands they had sworn to relinquish.
  1. In 773, Charlemagne (r. 768–814), Pippin's son, headed for Italy, defeated Lombard King Desiderius (r. 757–774), and took the Lombard crown for himself.
  2. In 781 and 787, Charlemagne—Charles the Great—concluded pacts with the pope that settled the territorial shape of the Papal State as it would exist, at least in theory, for centuries.

IV. These dramatic changes in Rome and Italy, as well as the Frankish connection to Italy, had important consequences for papal Rome.

A. Members of the Roman nobility again sought the papal office and important positions in the papal government.

B. Factional squabbles among the Romans were imported into the Church.
  1. The years 768 to 772, 799, 813, and 823, for example, were particularly violent and unstable.
  2. In 799, Pope Leo III (r. 795–816) was attacked in a street by a mob led by disaffected relatives of his own predecessor, Hadrian.
  3. Charlemagne wanted both to help and protect the pope and to keep a reasonable "hands-off" policy with respect to Rome.

C. Charlemagne himself had been campaigning successfully and brilliantly all over Europe, reforming the Church, and promoting scholarship.

D. In 797, at Byzantium, Irene, who had been serving as regent for her son, Constantine VI, since the death of her husband in 780, blinded and deposed her frivolous son and became *basilissa* (empress).

E. Many streams thus converged in the scene in St. Peter's when Leo crowned Charlemagne and the assembled Romans acclaimed him "Emperor and Augustus."

V. Although the popes were not always secure, the papacy was protected and empowered. But to do what? With what authority?

A. Charlemagne and Pope Hadrian I (r. 772–795) disagreed sharply on the question of the veneration of icons, and Charlemagne disagreed with Pope Leo III on the insertion of the word *filioque* (Latin for "and from the son") into the Creed.

B. Pope Gregory IV (r. 827–844) traveled to Francia to intervene in a quarrel between Charlemagne's son, King Louis the Pious (r. 814–840), and Louis's sons. He did so *ratione peccati* ("by reason of sin") as the chief priest of the Christian world. But the Franks paid scant attention to him.

C. The popes tried but failed to win Bulgaria away from Constantinople for Rome.

D. Popes quarreled with Byzantine rulers and churchmen over theology and Church practices.

VI. Let us profile one pope from this period, Hadrian I, on whose death Charlemagne wept "as if he had lost a friend or a brother."

A. Hadrian was a Roman blueblood whose family lived in the tony Via Lata region.

B. Hadrian served as one of Rome's notaries under Paul I (r. 757–768), and this pope brought Hadrian into the clergy. He rose through the ranks in about a decade and was elected pope in 772.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

C. At the time of his election, Hadrian found Rome in a state of political chaos, and he skillfully composed the situation.

D. Hadrian successfully worked with Charlemagne—as noted—to secure the territories of the Papal State.

E. Hadrian resolutely worked to defeat Iconoclasm and rejoiced at the Second Council of Nicaea (787) that condemned it.

F. Most revealing of Hadrian's pontificate is the building boom that he initiated in Rome.

Recommended Reading:

Noble, *Republic of St. Peter*.

Schimmelpfennig, *Papacy*, chapter IV.

Questions to Consider:

1. How might the history of the papacy have been different if the Franks had not come to the pope's assistance?

2. Explain why collaboration and contention were both visible in the papacy's relations with the Carolingians.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Five
Rome, the Popes, and the Papal Government

Scope: This lecture responds to some very basic questions: How did a man get to be pope? What was the pope's job and how did he do it? Who assisted him? What roles did the pope have in the secular administration of Rome and its region? What religious roles did the pope have in Rome and its region and in the world beyond Rome? In some ways, this lecture reaches back into the world of late antiquity, and in other ways, it prepares the ground for Lectures Eight and Nine on the papal monarchy. This lecture also introduces the major branches of the Lateran administration (this was before the Vatican!), the cardinals, the title churches and stational masses, the great liturgical processions—in short, the many features of papal life and work that still exist today, albeit sometimes in changed form.

Outline

I. Having situated the popes in their familiar European context, we may ask some basic questions about them and the papacy.
- **A.** How were popes elected?
- **B.** Who were the popes?
- **C.** By what means did the popes exercise their leadership of the Roman Church?
- **D.** How, after the emergence of the Papal State, did the popes exercise temporal rule?

II. This is also an opportune time to ask: How do we know about the history of the popes in these early centuries?
- **A.** The *Liber Pontificalis* (*LP*) is a series of papal biographies begun in the early 6th century and kept up more or less continuously until the end of the 9th century.
- **B.** Surviving papal letters from the period to the end of the 9th century number more than 3,500.
- **C.** Chronicles and histories often mention the popes, providing both valuable details and a gauge of the attention paid to papal Rome by outsiders.
- **D.** Official records, court or financial documents, do not survive at all.

III. Like all bishops in early times, popes were elected "by clergy and people." It is hard to penetrate behind this formulation.
- **A.** Occasionally, there were factions, and sometimes, emperors intervened.
- **B.** From the mid-6th to the mid-8th centuries, the Byzantine emperors claimed a right to confirm papal elections, and the imperial administration in Italy routinely meddled in papal elections.
- **C.** The first major decree on papal elections came in a Roman synod—a meeting of bishops—in 769: Only the Roman clergy could serve as electors (the "people" were moved out of the process), and only the cardinal priests and deacons were eligible as candidates.

IV. Who were the popes in the early centuries?
- **A.** The majority of popes down to the 7th century were Romans.
- **B.** From the 7th century, a period of almost 150 years began when many popes were of Eastern extraction.
- **C.** When the popes began to liberate Italy from Byzantium, nobles began to enter the clergy and to become popes, beginning with Stephen II and his brother Paul I in the mid-8th century.
- **D.** Down to the 20th century, many popes then came from important Roman families.

V. Over several centuries' time, two parallel sets of administrative institutions emerged in papal Rome, one primarily for ecclesiastical administration and one for temporal rule.
- **A.** Rome's ecclesiastical structure was much like that of other cities except more elaborate. Everything focused on the bishop.
  - **1.** Worship was provided by an elaborate system involving *suburbicarian bishops* and *title priests*.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. The pope (bishop) was always the principal liturgical celebrant, but obviously, he could not be everywhere.
    a. Seven suburbicarian bishops could celebrate day by day at the main altar of St. John Lateran, Rome's cathedral church.
    b. Twenty-eight title priests could celebrate day by day at the high altars of four *patriarchal basilicas*.
    c. On a regular rotation, the pope celebrated at all these churches in *stational* masses.
3. Popes installed deacons into each of the seven regions of the city, and they oversaw charitable services and routine ecclesiastical administration.
4. The 7 suburbicarian bishops, 28 senior title priests, and 7 regionary deacons were the *cardinals* of the Roman Church. The origin of the word *cardinal*, by the way, is still unclear.
5. The archpriest and the archdeacon, along with the *primicerius* (head) of the notaries, ruled when there was a papal vacancy and served as key advisers to the pope.

B. Mention of the notaries brings us to the secular administration.
1. The notaries were among the first officials introduced by the popes with something other than strictly religious duties.
2. By the 5th century, the popes had introduced *defensores*, who possessed minor judicial authority.
3. The responsibility for feeding Rome's population and, increasingly, maintaining the city led to ever sharper administration of the Church's vast patrimonies.
4. In the 7th century, a system of *diaconiae* emerged as charitable institutions.

VI. As the 8th century became the 9th, the popes had made Rome into a papal city.

A. They governed the city.

B. They put huge numbers of people to work.

C. In complex liturgical arrangements, accompanied by massive processions, the papacy repeatedly put its leadership on visual display.

Recommended Reading:

Llewellyn, *Rome in the Dark Ages*, chapter 4.

Noble, *Republic of St. Peter*, chapters 6 and 7.

Questions to Consider:

1. What strengths and weaknesses do you perceive in the early papal government?
2. Was an ecclesiastical administration well placed to govern a secular entity?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Six
The "Age of Iron"

Scope: With the decline of effective Carolingian power in Italy, the papacy sunk into depths perhaps unmatched in its long history. In 846, Muslim pirates brazenly sacked St. Peter's and St. Paul's. If Rome could not defend itself, neither could it avoid factional strife. John VIII was brutally murdered in 882 (the first pope to be assassinated). Nine months after his death (in 896), Formosus was subjected to a macabre ritual. His body was disinterred, dressed in papal garments, and "tried" by his enemies, who predictably, found him guilty and flung his corpse into the Tiber. The author of this deed, Stephen VI, was eventually arrested by Formosus's supporters, jailed, and strangled. The situation actually worsened. For two generations, the house of Theophylact, Alberic, and Marozia dominated Rome and the papacy. Marozia was mistress of one pope and mother of another. Later Protestant writers referred to this time as the "pornocracy," and the Catholic apologist Cesare Baronius could do no better than to call it the "Age of Iron." But positive developments took place, as well. The western empire was restored in 962 in the person of Otto I. The Papal State was restored to its Carolingian shape. Europe experienced wave after wave of spirited religious reform. German emperors dominated the papacy, but they were generally high-minded men and vastly better than the local Roman aristocrats.

Outline

I. The 10th century, ridiculed as the "pornocracy" and lamented as the "Dark Age" or "Age of Iron," was perhaps the papacy's darkest hour.

- **A.** The collapse of the Carolingian system was primarily responsible for the troubles.
- **B.** Ironically, despite popes who were nonentities or moral wretches, some positive and important achievements did appear in this period.

II. Why did the Carolingian system collapse, and what were the consequences of that collapse?

- **A.** The Carolingian dynasty faced severe problems that precluded sustained attention to Rome.
  - **1.** Dynastic squabbling set in at the time of King Louis the Pious (r. 814–840) and never really stopped until the dynasty itself disappeared.
  - **2.** The Carolingians faced attacks from Vikings, Muslims, and Magyars that consumed their attention and resources.
- **B.** In Rome, no effective imperial presence existed to keep a lid on the aristocratic factions that became increasingly chaotic and brutal.

III. Three examples drawn from the history of the Age of Iron may suffice to reveal the general course of developments.

- **A.** One of the sorriest spectacles in papal history was the "Cadaver Synod."
  - **1.** Pope Formosus (r. 891–896) was elected with the support of the pro-Carolingian party in Rome, whose opponents were centered in Spoleto and northern Italy.
  - **2.** When Formosus died, his opponents secured the election of Stephen VI (r. 896–897), who hated Formosus with a passion.
  - **3.** Formosus's body was exhumed, dressed in papal vestments, seated on a throne, and "tried" for treason and other crimes.
  - **4.** The political worm turned within a year, and Stephen VI was, in turn, hounded by a mob, arrested, and murdered.
  - **5.** John VIII had been brutally murdered less than 20 years before, the first pope to be assassinated.
- **B.** Throughout the first half of the 10th century, the family of Theophylact and Theodora dominated Rome.
  - **1.** Theophylact was a duke and Master of the Soldiers, as well as *vestararius*—a financial officer of the Church.
  - **2.** Marozia (892-937), Theophylact's daughter, was the lover of Pope Sergius III, by whom she had a son who was later elected pope as John XI.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

3. Marozia also married in succession three powerful men who, in concert with her, named and removed popes at will.

C. Alberic II, a son of Marozia and Alberic I, insisted on his deathbed that his 18-year-old son, Octavian, be elected pope.

1. Octavian changed his name to John (XII), only the second pope to do so, but with two exceptions, all later popes followed suit. The first pope to change his name, John II (r. 533–535), did so because he felt it unseemly for a pope to be called Mercurius.
2. John XII forged a bond with the German king, Otto I (r. 936–962), who confirmed the Carolingian territorial privileges for Rome.

IV. The situation of the papacy in the 10th and early 11th centuries embodies paradoxes.

A. The papacy was dominated by powerful Roman or central Italian families.

B. The popes were surprisingly prestigious and effective outside Italy and sometimes within it.

1. They continuously negotiated with the Byzantines.
2. Popes secured Poland and Hungary for the Roman Catholic Church.
3. They promoted monastic reform and worked closely with the great monastery of Cluny, founded in Burgundy in 909.
4. In 993, John XV canonized Ulrich of Augsburg, the first papal canonization. Before that time, canonization was a local affair.

V. Instead of emphasizing all that is dreary, let us conclude by profiling one of the most interesting popes of the early Middle Ages: Sylvester II (r. 999–1003).

A. He was born Gerbert near Aurillac, France, circa 945, and he was educated there and in Vich, in the borderlands between France and Spain, where he had access to Arabic mathematical and scientific learning.

B. In 972, he went to Reims to study dialectic and soon became master of the school.

C. In 998, with Otto's influence, he was made archbishop of Ravenna and a year later, Otto engineered his election as pope.

D. Gerbert was the first French pope, and he took the name Sylvester to symbolize the ideal of papal-imperial cooperation between the Emperor Constantine and Pope Sylvester I.

Recommended Reading:

Mann, *Lives of the Popes*, vols. IV and V.

Schimmelpfennig, *Papacy*, chapter V.

Questions to Consider:

1. What weaknesses in the papacy's position permitted the institution to sink so low in the 10th century?
2. How did the relations between the German emperors and the popes differ from the earlier relations between the Carolingians and the popes?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Seven
The Investiture Controversy

Scope: From the 1060s to the 1120s, the papacy was constantly embroiled with the German emperors and often at odds with one or more of Europe's other rulers. Two broad sets of problems were at issue. On the one hand, generations of religious reformers had vigorously made the point that the Church could carry out its responsibilities effectively only if it were free of lay control. In other words, emperors, kings, dukes, and other rulers should cease appointing bishops, abbots, and priests and demanding secular services from them. On the other hand, supporters of the clergy and of the rulers sharply articulated very different views of how the world ought to be organized. Everyone agreed that God was the source of all power and authority. Disagreement arose from quarrels over who stood next to God, so to speak. Extreme clericalists insisted that the pope was God's vicar on Earth and the head of an ecclesiastical hierarchy that was to be served by all laymen—rulers first of all. Extreme imperialists argued that the emperor was the earthly reflection of the heavenly king and that the ecclesiastical hierarchy—and the pope first of all—were the emperor's "helpers." *Lay investiture*—the practice whereby a layman invested a cleric with his office—has given its name to an era and the controversy that animated it. But the struggle was over more than lay investiture in the strict sense.

Outline

I. Two vignettes will serve to frame the issues that are central to this lecture.

- **A.** In 1046, Emperor Henry III rode triumphantly into Italy and, at Sutri, deposed three rival contenders for the papacy and imposed a choice of his own.
- **B.** In January 1077, King Henry IV stood in the snow before Canossa castle, begging forgiveness and absolution from Pope Gregory VII.

II. The *Investiture Controversy* is the traditional name for the mighty battles between the popes and the German kings or emperors that lasted for nearly three-quarters of a century.

- **A.** Strictly speaking, *lay investiture* refers to the investing of a clergyman with both the symbols and the reality of his office by a layman.
- **B.** But as one historian put it, the controversy was really a "struggle for right order in the world."

III. *Reform* is a word commonly used to describe the developments of the 10th and 11th centuries, but it is a hard word to capture in its contemporary meaning.

- **A.** Gregory VII, who gave his name to the era, used the word *reform* only four times.
- **B.** There had been several powerful currents of "reform" in the 10th and 11th centuries in Europe, including those stemming from Cluny, Gorze, and other monasteries, as well as ascetic monks and rulers in the Carolingian tradition.

IV. The essential background to the Investiture Controversy is formed by the deplorable state of the papacy in the 10th and early 11th centuries.

- **A.** Emperor Henry III (r. 1039–1056) was a deeply pious man scandalized by conditions in Rome.
  - **1.** In the 1040s, three men claimed to be the legitimate pope.
  - **2.** Henry went to Italy, deposed the rival claimants, and engineered the election of Archbishop Suidger of Bamberg as Pope Clement II (r. 1046–1047); then, in rapid succession, he imposed the election of three more Germans (in 1048, 1049, and 1055).
- **B.** What made Henry think he could do this?
  - **1.** Everyone agreed that the earthly realm should mirror the heavenly; that heaven was, in some sense, a monarchy; and that the problem was who on Earth reflected the heavenly monarch.
  - **2.** Kings "by grace of God" had de facto filled the role of divine representatives since Charlemagne.
  - **3.** As a practical matter, kings (and other laymen at all levels) had ruled the Church and ruled through the Church.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

V. Henry's popes were good men and ardent "reformers."

A. Pope Leo IX (r. 1049–1054), in particular, traveled all over Europe, emphasized papal authority, and drew reformers to Rome.

B. The reformers focused on two issues above all others:

1. Clerical morality, in particular, clerical marriage and concubinage.

2. Simony.

C. In 1058, with Henry III dead and his heir a child, the Romans rose up against the reformers and elected a pope in opposition to the reformers' choice, Nicholas II, who nevertheless prevailed.

1. Nicholas II (r. 1058-1061) called a Roman synod in 1059 that outlawed simony and clerical marriage, declared that clergy should not accept offices from laymen, and spoke only in vague terms about the emperor's rights in papal elections.

2. Nicholas also allied with the Normans (of southern Italy), who helped him establish his authority.

VI. For a few years, relations between Rome and Germany were infrequent but cordial.

A. Henry IV came of age in 1066, and between 1071 and 1073, he and Pope Alexander II quarreled over naming an archbishop in Milan.

B. Alexander's resolve was stiffened by Cardinal Hildebrand, who had come to Rome with the reformers in the 1050s and who was later elected as Gregory VII (r. 1073–1085).

C. Gregory is one of the most remarkable and important popes, but he is an enigma in many ways.

1. The *Dictatus Papae*, found in Gregory's papal register, provides some insight into his thinking. It is not clear what this document actually represents—perhaps 27 headings for a treatise that was never written. Some provisions addressed rather routine ecclesiastical business, while a few might have raised eyebrows, and still others seemed startlingly new.

2. In Roman synods of 1074 and 1075, Gregory spoke vigorously against simony and clerical marriage, and he raised the issue of lay investiture clearly.

3. Henry put down a Saxon revolt and, to begin asserting his power, he started naming bishops, including one in Milan.

4. Sharply rebuked by Gregory, Henry summoned a council of German bishops that declared Gregory a false monk and deposed.

5. Gregory responded by excommunicating Henry and releasing his subjects from their oaths of allegiance.

6. By late 1076, German princes and some bishops were demanding that Henry reverse course. Some were concerned as a matter of principle, and some saw an opportunity to weaken the monarchy to the advantage of the landed princes.

7. A council under papal presidency was to meet in 1077 to pass judgment on Henry.

D. Henry stole a march on his foes by trekking through the snow to Canossa castle in north-central Italy, where he asked for forgiveness from the pope.

1. On one hand, Gregory could regard this as a capitulation.

2. On the other hand, Henry could regard this as a clever move that signaled his reconciliation with the pope and stripped his German foes of legitimacy.

3. Many Germans who opposed Henry—for whatever reason—felt that Gregory had abandoned them. Gregory continued to insist that he planned to come to Germany to judge between Henry and Rudolf of Rheinfelden.

4. In 1078, Gregory formally condemned lay investiture.

E. Some Germans elected Rudolf as ruler.

1. In 1080, Gregory again declared Henry excommunicated and deposed.

2. Henry marched on Rome, chased Gregory to the Castel Sant'Angelo, and installed Wibert of Ravenna as an antipope, Clement III.

3. Gregory was rescued by his Norman allies, but they sacked the city and were, in turn, forced to depart.

4. Gregory fled to Salerno, where he died in exile.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

VII. For the next 30 years, the battle dragged on.

- **A.** Emperors wanted imperial coronation and sometimes tried to work with the popes and sometimes installed antipopes.
- **B.** Popes generally maintained the prohibition on lay investiture.
- **C.** Finally, Pope Calixtus II achieved a resolution in the Concordat of Worms (1122).
  - **1.** Based on the thinking of some canon lawyers, *temporalia* and *spiritualia* were differentiated.
  - **2.** The Concordat said that laymen could not invest with ring and crozier and that elections were to be free. But elections could take place in the emperor's presence, and after consecration, a cleric could be invested with *temporalia*.
- **D.** The popes had actually gained in prestige during the years of the Investiture Controversy, though not entirely because of the controversy itself.
- **E.** In a polity conceived as the medieval one was, it was hard to deny ultimate authority to religious authorities.
- **F.** Important, too, and fateful for the future, was the fact that the primary result of the Investiture Controversy was tremendously enhanced papal authority over the Church.

Recommended Reading:

Blumenthal, *Investiture Controversy*.

Tierney, *Crisis of Church and State, 1050–1300*, pp. 1–95.

Questions to Consider:

1. Of what practical and theoretical significance was lay investiture in the Investiture Controversy?
2. Who do you think had the better claim to ultimate authority, priestly kings or kingly priests?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Eight
The Papal Monarchy—Institutions

Scope: Although the popes were challenged in myriad ways during the Investiture Controversy, the papacy emerged from the battle stronger than ever. The 12th and 13th centuries marked the high-water point of papal power and influence, first in the Church, then in the wider world. In this first of two lectures on the papal monarchy, we will examine the papacy as an institution, focusing largely on the pope within the Church but also looking at new ways in which the papacy as an institution influenced the contemporary world.

We will begin by looking at the popes of this period from several different points of view. We will pay particular attention to important changes in papal elections. Then we will look at the Curia, the central government of the Church. We will examine law and law courts, financial offices, and the papacy's means for establishing contacts and effecting control across Europe. We will also examine important new ideological formulations by means of which the papacy defined its place at the summit of a hierarchically ordered society.

Outline

I. From the accession of Gregory VII in 1073 to the death of Boniface VIII in 1303, the papacy attained the height of its power, prestige, and influence.

- **A.** This dramatic surge was owed to the development of papal institutions and ideology and to a series of political encounters that usually brought the popes both short- and long-term gains.
- **B.** In this lecture, we shall focus on the papacy itself, and in the next one, we will turn to the papacy's complex dealings with Rome, Italy, and the wider world.

II. First, then, let us look at the period's 37 popes themselves from several points of view.

- **A.** In terms of geographical origins, we may note that 19 were non-Roman Italians, 10 were Romans, 5 were French, and 1 each came from Savoy, Portugal, and England.
- **B.** In terms of backgrounds, we may note that 8 were monks, 7 were canons, 16 were priests, 2 were deacons, 1 had been patriarch of Jerusalem, 1 held no clerical rank, and by the end of the 13th century, the new mendicant orders, Dominicans and Franciscans, had each contributed 1 pope.
- **C.** Eight popes faced the effrontery of schism. Eleven antipopes disturbed the orderly papal succession.
- **D.** Between schisms and Roman political turmoil, popes were absent from Rome for about 50 years in the 230 years under review here.
- **E.** For various reasons, there were sometimes lengthy gaps between pontificates.
- **F.** Some important changes took place in how popes were elected.
  1. In 1179, Alexander III and the Lateran Council decreed that popes would be elected by the *sanior pars* (the "wiser part"; phraseology adopted from the *Rule of St. Benedict*), and a two-thirds majority was deemed necessary.
  2. Because 13th-century cardinals had a habit of avoiding or fleeing Rome, in 1241, the Roman senator Matteo Rosso Orsini locked the cardinals in the old *Septizonium* and denied them food and drink until they elected a pope.
  3. After several placid elections, Pope Clement IV died at Viterbo in 1268, and the locals locked the cardinals in a palace. The cardinals' prolonged deliberations prompted town authorities to rip the roof off the palace.
  4. Gregory X, elected in Viterbo, formalized the *conclave*, indicating that the electors are locked in as they vote, a tradition that has been used with only minor modifications down to today.

III. The central government of the Church grew further and faster than ever before.

- **A.** Under Urban II, the term *curia* (or *Curia Romana*) began to appear. This could be a general reference to the papal court or to the Church's government, or it could refer quite specifically to the pope and the

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

cardinals sitting in consistory. *Consistory* refers to times when the cardinals and the popes formally meet to discuss and make decisions about the affairs of the Church.

1. In theory, there would have been 53 cardinals, but that number was almost never reached; at times in the 13th century, there were fewer than 10 cardinals.
2. Sometimes politics suppressed the number of cardinals, but financial exigencies played a role, too. Cardinals were expensive and ate up a significant portion of the Church's budget.
3. The Code of Canon Law expressed the cardinal's role this way: "The cardinals of the Holy Roman Church constitute the senate of the pontiff and assist him in ruling the church as his foremost counselors and helpers."
4. By the late 13th century, policies were fairly well established that papal decretals required the signature of one or more cardinals and that *res ardua* (difficult cases) needed consultation.

B. The writing and recordkeeping offices developed under the chancellor.

C. Four times between 921 and 1062, the word *camera* appears in the papal sources; then, under Gregory VII, the financial machinery of the Church began to be put on firm footings.

1. Urban II introduced the *camerarius* (chamberlain), several of whom went on to become pope.
   - **a.** The Church needed money to maintain the papal court, wherever it might be; to keep Rome's churches in repair; to support the cardinals; and to bribe the Roman authorities.
   - **b.** Revenues came from the Papal States, but these lands were in an almost constant state of turmoil.
   - **c.** Funds also came from Peter's pence (an annual voluntary laymen's contribution), paid by England and Poland; feudal dues from princes; and annual fees from some 530 monasteries and canonical houses
   - **d.** Shortly after their appointment, bishops usually paid taxes in the form of the equivalent of a year's diocesan income, then they paid set fees every year.
2. In 1192, Cencius Savelli, as *camerarius*, drew up the *Liber Censuum*, a listing of virtually all revenues due to the papacy. No other government in Europe had any such listing.

D. Judicial institutions were refined, and the volume of business expanded exponentially. The *Rota Romana* gradually handled more and more business, and the Roman Church increasingly demanded that cases be brought to Rome for resolution.

IV. In matters great and small, we can see the papacy taking a leading position in Europe.

A. The Crusades were seen as a papal venture.

B. Rome took virtual control of the process of canonization of new saints.

C. For the first time, albeit with limited success, the popes began to demand liturgical uniformity.

D. Through papal provisions and expectancies, popes began to make more and more routine ecclesiastical appointments around Europe.

E. The popes steadily expanded the number and scope of legates.

F. Whereas popes had long used Roman synods as tools for governance, gathering central Italian clergy, now the consistory and the ecumenical council took over.

V. Papal ideology grew apace in sophistication and articulation.

A. The lawyer Hostiensis once said that the priestly dignity is exactly 7,644½ times greater than the royal. He obviously had Gelasius's letter to Anastasius in mind, as well as Ptolemy, who had said that the Sun is 7,644½ times brighter than the Moon.

B. In the circles around Gregory VII—and later—thinkers interpreted Gelasius's letter as a commentary on Luke 22: 38: "They said, 'Lord, here are two swords.' He answered 'enough.'"

C. The hierarchical thought that undergirded the institutions of this papal monarchy is at once old and new.

D. We must now look to see how the popes could actually act in this world.

Recommended Reading:

Robinson, *The Papacy, 1073–1198*.

Morris, *The Papal Monarchy*.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Questions to Consider:

1. How did the basic institutions of the papacy change in the high Middle Ages?
2. In what ways is the term *monarchy* appropriate to the papacy between, say, 1100 and 1300?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Nine
The Papal Monarchy—Politics

Scope: The end of the Investiture Controversy did not bring an end to quarrels between the popes and Europe's rulers. Rulers lost a good deal of day-to-day influence over the Church but did not abandon their claim to a kind of sacred rule. Frederick Barbarossa of Germany referred to his *Sacrum Imperium Romanum* (his "Holy Roman Empire"; any use of that term before Frederick's time is anachronistic!). He meant to say that his empire was holy and that it derived from Rome but not from the Roman pope. Innocent III, on the contrary, calculated that the empire was like the Moon to the papal Sun: derivative. His meaning was lost on no one. In this lecture, we will examine some of the great battles of the day, emphasizing the struggles between the empire and the papacy.

Outline

I. We have seen the kinds of institutions and ideas that together made up the papal monarchy of the 12th and 13th centuries. Now we turn to the nuts-and-bolts history of that period to see what the popes could and could not do.

II. The Schism of 1130 was a portent of things to come in Rome and in the Church.

- **A.** In the last years of Pope Calixtus II (r. 1119–1124), the Pierleoni and Frangipani families began to contest for leadership of the city, and they inserted supporters into the College of Cardinals.
  - **1.** When Calixtus died, the Pierleoni engineered the election of their candidate, who took the name Celestine II.
  - **2.** Enraged, the Frangipani forcibly ejected Celestine and introduced Lambert, the bishop of Ostia, who took the name Honorius II (r. 1124–1130).
  - **3.** Honorius managed to rule peacefully until his death in 1130.
- **B.** The international situation for Honorius was complex.
  - **1.** The Salian dynasty was vanishing in Germany.
  - **2.** In the south, Duke Roger II of Sicily invaded and seized Apulia and Calabria.
  - **3.** Even in the countryside around Rome, Honorius found himself obliged to wage battles in support of Frangipani interests.
- **C.** When Honorius died, 16 cardinals of the Frangipani faction elected Cardinal Gregory Papareschi, who took the name Innocent II.
  - **1.** The other 14 cardinals refused to accept the election and, in San Marco, elected cardinal Pietro Pierleoni, who took the name Anacletus II.
  - **2.** A few Frangipani cardinals agreed to accept Anacletus; thus, it appeared that he had a majority, and Innocent had to flee amidst questions about procedures.
- **D.** France, Germany, England, much of Italy, the great religious orders, and key ecclesiastical figures, such as Bernard of Clairvaux, supported Innocent.
- **E.** Anacletus had the support of the Romans and the Normans, whose allegiance he solidified by making Roger II king.
- **F.** Only in 1133 was Innocent able to take control of Rome and then only because the German king, Lothar of Supplinburg, accompanied him into the city.
- **G.** Lothar campaigned against Roger and weakened him sufficiently that he was no menace when Lothar died in 1137.
- **H.** Anacletus's position was ruined, Innocent held a great council in 1139, and Roger was eventually recognized as king by Innocent.
- **I.** What are the lessons here?
  - **1.** As the papacy and cardinalate became more international, they lost the loyalty of the Romans.
  - **2.** Great Roman families could still exercise dire influence over the papacy.
  - **3.** The popes could not protect themselves without having recourse to outside powers.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

III. The Schism of 1159 to 1180 marked a return to papal-imperial tensions, complicated by problems in the city of Rome and urban dynamics in northern and central Italy.

A. First, we must set the stage.

1. The situation in Rome was intensely volatile and complicated.

a. Angry with both popes and nobles, Roman craftsmen and merchants inaugurated a commune in 1143.

b. Commune leaders and popes vied with each other to secure the support of both German and Sicilian kings, who were themselves bitter enemies.

c. By 1159, Hadrian IV (Nicholas Breakspear, the only Englishman ever elected pope) had accepted Frederick Barbarossa as king, made peace with William I of Sicily, and patched up a peace with the Romans.

d. But on Hadrian's death, the cardinals split into factions.

2. The popes had generally supported and had been supported by Lothar of Supplinburg in Germany, but he declined to provide much help in Italy.

3. We have already seen that the Normans in the south were a constant concern for the popes.

B. One party of cardinals elected Orlando Bandinelli, a distinguished lawyer, who took the name Alexander III. He would eventually prevail.

1. Another faction elected Cardinal Ottaviano, who took the name Victor IV and appealed to the emperor; Alexander had appealed to William of Sicily.

2. Initially, Victor IV controlled Rome and Alexander was forced to remain away.

3. Barbarossa came to Italy in 1160 to hold a council and decide between the rivals. When Alexander refused to appear, Barbarossa declared Victor the true pope, and most of Italy, Germany, and Europe opposed Barbarossa for going too far.

4. There were three more antipopes down to 1180, but their cause was overtaken by other events. Suffice it to say that Alexander III was able to prevail because Barbarossa was unable to provide continuous support to his antipopes in Rome.

C. We learn here, once again, that the popes were always subject to the whims of other people's interests in Italy and that the Roman populace as a whole now added its troublemaking ability to that of the nobility.

IV. The first half of the 13th century was dominated by the papacy's battle with Frederick II of Hohenstaufen.

A. Some background is crucial to understanding the inception, duration, and bitterness of this battle.

1. The age-old desire of German rulers for dominion in Italy took a bizarre turn when Barbarossa married his son Henry to Constance of Sicily. The Norman male line had died out, and when Henry died young in 1197, the German and Sicilian inheritances were united in a 3-year-old child.

2. When Constance herself died in 1198, young Frederick II became a ward of the pope.

B. In Germany, two factions emerged. One, under Philip of Swabia, supported the Hohenstaufen, while the other, under Otto IV of Brunswick, supported noble privileges.

C. Pope Innocent III intervened by supporting Otto, who renounced all claims in Italy.

1. Then, in 1208, Philip was murdered, removing all restraints from Otto, who promptly invaded Italy and got himself excommunicated.

2. In 1212, Innocent elevated Frederick II to the throne of Germany.

D. Frederick was a remarkable character, more Sicilian by far than German, and determined to rule all of Italy and at least be recognized as ruler in Germany.

1. Until his death in 1250, Frederick had almost entirely bad relations with the popes.

2. Partly the troubles stemmed from Frederick's repeated failure to go on crusade, as he had sworn to do, and partly, Frederick's own morally dubious behavior was at issue.

3. But the great issue, as so often, was Italy, where Frederick's policies threatened to surround the Papal States.

E. The whole struggle was unedifying in many ways and resulted in the demise of the Hohenstaufen family and a 60-year gap in the imperial succession (1250–1312), but this was an important period for the popes in other respects.

1. Innocent III forced French and English kings to bow to his will and opened closer relations in Spain than had ever existed before.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. On the demise of the Hohenstaufen, the popes recruited first English, then French princes to reign in southern Italy and Sicily.
3. New religious orders, especially the Franciscans and Dominicans, revitalized the Church.
4. Under Gregory IX, the Roman Inquisition systematically pursued heretics.
5. Laws were revised, the Papal States were administered effectively, and finances were carefully managed.

F. Two lessons here are clear.
1. Temporal rule inevitably involved the popes in the great political issues of the day.
2. However much it might seem that the popes were either dominated or distracted by secular concerns, the business of the Church went on apace.

G. But perhaps there is a third lesson: The papacy's secular rule and political actions were vulnerable to serious changes in thinking about the nature of society and the ends of government.

Recommended Reading:

Morris, *The Papal Monarchy*.

Sayers, *Innocent III*.

Questions to Consider:

1. How does the growth of papal institutions help in an understanding of papal politics?
2. What roles did Rome and Italy play in the papacy's battles with the empire?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Ten
The Popes at Avignon

Scope: The struggles between the popes and the empire foreshadowed an intense battle between King Philip IV of France and Pope Boniface VIII that did not end in such a way as to settle the fundamental issues. In one sense, it appeared that the signature event of the Investiture Controversy had been replayed in reverse. In the winter of 1077, a penitent Henry IV stood in the snow before Canossa castle begging forgiveness from Gregory VII. In 1303, Philip IV of France sent lawyers and thugs to Rome to seize Boniface and bring him to France for trial. By 1305, the cardinals—papal electors—were about evenly divided between those who wanted to seek reconciliation with France and those who, infuriated at Boniface's rough treatment, were intransigent. The former group managed to secure the election of Bertrand de Got, the archbishop of Bordeaux. As Clement V, he wandered for about four years in the south of France trying to compose the papacy's quarrel with Philip. In 1309, Clement and the papal court settled on papal territory at Avignon, with the idea of settling things with Philip, then returning to Rome. In fact, the popes remained at Avignon until 1378.

The Avignon papacy is difficult to evaluate. The Avignon popes were not saints, but they were not bad men either. Several were impressively pious. A few were superb administrators. They built the spectacular papal palace that dazzles tourists to this day. They tried hard to secure peace between France and England when the Hundred Years War broke out. When the popes returned to Rome, their reputation had suffered severely. St. Catherine of Siena referred bitterly to the papacy's "Babylonian Captivity."

Outline

I. We have seen that it was not uncommon for the popes to be absent from Rome; however, in the years 1309 to 1378, the popes were continuously resident in Avignon, a city in the south of what is now France but then safely on papal territory.

- **A.** Contemporaries, such as St. Catherine of Siena and Petrarch, condemned this "Babylonian Captivity" of the papacy.
- **B.** We must ask how the popes came to be in Avignon and what they did while they were there.

II. The years at the turn of the 14th century saw a titanic struggle between King Philip IV of France (r. 1285–1314) and Pope Boniface VIII (r. 1294–1303), which is the fundamental background to the Avignon papacy.

- **A.** Both Philip and Boniface were interesting, forceful personalities.
- **B.** Two basic issues divided Boniface and Philip.
  - **1.** Philip and King Edward I of England (r. 1272–1307) were continuously short of money and laid heavy taxes on their clergy.
    - **a.** Boniface issued *Clericis laicos*, forbidding taxation of the clergy.
    - **b.** England more or less capitulated, but Philip forbade the export of bullion from France, which severely crippled papal revenue collecting.
    - **c.** In 1297, Boniface, needing revenue and battling the Colonna family in Rome, relented; he affirmed that kings could tax the clergy "in an emergency."
  - **2.** In 1300, Philip attempted to haul Bernard Saisset, bishop of Pamiers, before the royal tribunal to answer charges of treason.
    - **a.** In 1301, Boniface issued *Ausculta fili*, which put *Clericis laicos* back in force, insisted on the *Privilegium fori* for members of the clergy, and summoned the king of France and his bishops to answer for their conduct.
    - **b.** In 1303, a troupe of Philip's supporters verbally and, perhaps, physically abused the 80-year-old Boniface at the papal summer residence at Anagni. Boniface died shortly thereafter.
- **C.** This is nothing like the world of Innocent III; it is more like Canossa in reverse. What had happened?
  - **1.** There had been searing criticisms for years of the wealth and secular preoccupations of the papacy.
  - **2.** The rediscovery of Aristotle's *Politics*, along with the dissemination of Roman law and its dictates, including "What pleases the prince has the power of law," led writers as different as Dante and John of

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Paris to conclude that popes might possess property but should not have temporal political rule over people.

III. In the attempt to find some resolution to this bitter conflict, the popes wound up in Avignon.

A. On Boniface's death, Benedict XI was elected, primarily as a non-Colonna, and he managed to achieve peace in Rome and with Sicily.

B. On Benedict's death, the cardinals were hopelessly deadlocked for 11 months and finally settled on Bertrand de Got (Pope Clement V), the archbishop of Bordeaux, who was well connected to the French court.

1. Clement V (r. 1305–1314) created numerous French cardinals and negotiated constantly with the French court. In his desire to achieve a settlement with France, Clement settled in 1309 in Avignon.

2. When Clement died, Jacques Duèze, bishop of Cahors but formerly bishop of Avignon, was elected as John XXII. He moved into the bishop's palace in Avignon.

IV. Without anyone's having planned or desired it, the popes stayed in Avignon for the next 59 years.

V. How may we characterize the Avignon popes?

A. All seven were French; three were monks. Average pontificates (about 10 years) were lengthy compared to those in the second half of the 13th century but similar to those of the preceding era.

B. These popes had, for the most part, long and distinguished careers in the Church and were learned, thoughtful men. Their great gifts were in administration.

C. Pope Innocent VI (r. 1352–1362) had to accept the first electoral "capitulation" in papal history, meaning that he would have to agree to accept certain conditions imposed by the cardinals in order to be elected pope. In this case, the agreement had to do with limiting the number of cardinals that Innocent could appoint.

D. Without Rome as their natural stage, the popes developed a "palace style" more fitting for a secular court.

VI. As always, the international situation was complex and brought pressures to bear.

A. The great issue of the age was the Hundred Years War (1337–1453) between France and England.

1. Both the French and, especially, the English thought the popes were too sympathetic to their enemy.

2. In reality, the popes were trying to free Europe's rulers (and money) for a new crusade.

B. The papacy's relations with Germany were, on the whole, terrible.

C. The south was now divided between Angevin princes in Naples and Aragonese princes in Sicily, all of whom got along poorly with one another and were often at odds with the popes.

D. Maintaining the Papal States from Avignon was tricky.

VII. The Avignon popes always planned to return to Rome.

A. In 1367, Urban V returned to Rome but went back to Avignon in 1370.

B. Gregory XI left Avignon in 1376, arrived in Rome in 1377, and had just begun settling into the city when he died in 1378.

C. In the election of 1378, the 16 cardinals in Rome (6 were still in Avignon) elected Bartolomeo Prignano, the archbishop of Bari, largely because a howling mob was demanding a Roman or, at least, an Italian pope.

D. The new pope, Urban VI (r. 1378–1389), initially enjoyed the good will of the cardinals in Rome but then ruined his position by treating them terribly.

1. The cardinals declared Urban deposed and elected Cardinal Robert of Geneva as Clement VII.

2. Clement eventually returned to Avignon in 1381, and the West was plunged into the Great Schism, perhaps the greatest crisis in papal history.

Recommended Reading:

Mollat, *The Popes at Avignon*.

Renouard, *The Avignon Papacy, 1305–1403*.

 ©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Questions to Consider:

1. How would you account for the very different outcomes in the papacy's struggles with the empire and with France?
2. How would you rate the work of the Avignon popes?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Eleven
The Great Schism

Scope: The Great Schism (1378–1417) constituted the greatest crisis in the papacy's long history. For four decades, two and, sometimes, three men each claimed to be the legitimate pope. By the time the schism ended, the papacy's prestige had taken a beating and the monarchical theory of Church government had been dealt a blow.

The schism grew out of the papacy's period of residence in Avignon. There was always a basic assumption that the papacy belonged in Rome, yet Rome and Italy presented real challenges. The Lateran was dilapidated, the Papal States were in open rebellion, and enemies threatened. Still, Urban V did return to Rome in 1367, but less than three years later, he returned to Avignon. Finally, Gregory XI returned to Rome in 1377 and died there the next year. In the first conclave held in Rome since 1303, the archbishop of Bari was elected. He proved so high-handed, however, that several cardinals deposed him. They returned to Avignon, joined the cardinals Gregory XI had left there to administer Church business, and elected Clement VII. Two men claimed to be pope, and Europe split down the middle in its allegiance. In 1409, a council at Pisa tried to resolve the dispute but only succeeded in adding a third claimant. Finally, the Council of Constance (1414–1418) accepted the resignation of two "popes," declared a third one deposed, and elected a new pope, Martin V. Constance also declared that a general council was superior in authority to the pope, a dramatic reversal of trends in place for four centuries. For the next 30 years, the popes struggled resolutely to defeat *conciliarism*.

Note: The dates mentioned in this lecture may be confusing because of the complications with popes and antipopes who refused to leave even after they had officially resigned or were deposed.

Outline

I. To understand the Great Schism, we need to review just a few of the details pertaining to the last days of Gregory XI and the election of Urban VI.

A. When Gregory XI died, it is not clear what the cardinals might have done had they felt completely free.

1. They were inclining toward Prignano of Bari but panicked and elected the aged Roman Francesco de' Tebaldeschi, only to have Prignano rally them to his cause; he was elected pope (Urban VI).

2. Through the summer of 1378, delegations of cardinals went to Urban VI to express doubts about the election and to call for a new one in which Urban could be a legitimate candidate.

B. Europe soon split down the middle, and it is only hindsight that makes it so clear that the line of Urban VI was uniquely "legitimate."

Popes during the Great Schism

Rome	Avignon	Pisa
Urban VI (r. 1378–1389)	Clement VII (r. 1378–1394)	Alexander V (r. 1409–1410)
Boniface XI (r. 1389–1404)	Benedict XIII (r. 1394–1409)	John XXIII (r. 1410–1415)
Innocent VII (r. 1404–1406)	Clement VIII (r. 1409–1417)	
Gregory XII (r. 1406–1415)	Benedict XIV (r. 1425–1430)	
Martin V (r. 1417–1431)		

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

II. The lines across Europe changed somewhat as the schism dragged on, but the basic contours may be identified for the first 20 years or so.

A. Among major states, the support divided as follows:

1. France, Scotland, Castile, Aragon, and Navarre supported Clement and, initially at least, his successor, Benedict XIII.

2. Germany, Scandinavia, the (Catholic) Slavic world, England, Portugal, and most of Italy supported Urban.

B. The great religious orders—Franciscans, Dominicans, Cistercians—were divided as well, not one from another but internally.

C. The old curialists and cardinals supported Clement, whereas Urban created new curialists and cardinals.

III. At this point, we will turn to an account of the basic course of the schism, then look at some of the concepts implemented to bring it to a shaky resolution.

A. Down to 1395, Urban and his two successors (Boniface and Innocent) and Clement, plus his successor (Benedict), tried hard to win or maintain supporters.

B. In 1395, the French crown and the University of Paris chose the *via cessionis*: They withdrew their support from Benedict XIII.

C. In 1403, Benedict escaped, won back his cardinals, and achieved renewed French backing because he had the support of the duke of Orléans, who was dominant at the French court.

D. Benedict made some effort to come to an understanding with his Roman rivals, but it is not clear if this was because or in spite of their troubles with the kingdom of Naples (always the Italian territorial situation!).

E. In 1408, the duke of Orléans was murdered, and France again withdrew its support from Benedict.

F. The majority of Avignonese and Roman cardinals, however, desired a council and called for it to meet in Pisa in 1409.

1. The council's main goal was to remove both the contending popes and elect a new one recognized by everyone.

2. In June 1409, the council declared Benedict XIII and Gregory XII excommunicated and deposed as heretics and schismatics. Both popes ignored the council.

3. A conclave elected Peter Philarghi as Alexander V. There were now three popes!

4. Alexander called for a new council to meet in 1412 to address general issues needing reform.

G. Germany at first maintained its allegiance to Rome, but when Sigismund of Bohemia was elected king of Germany in 1411, he opened negotiations with Pisa's John XXIII. Sigismund and John called for a new council to meet at Constance in 1414.

H. The Council of Constance (1414–1418) was at once successful and problematic.

1. John XXIII convened the council but was immediately asked to resign; he then fled to Vienna. He was captured, brought back, tried, and deposed.

2. In July 1415, news came that Gregory XII had resigned.

3. Sigismund never could get Benedict XIII to resign, and Benedict had successors down to 1430 claiming, of course, to be the only legitimate popes.

4. On November 11, 1417, Oddo Colonna was elected as Martin V, and the schism appeared to be over in all important respects.

5. Martin agreed to undertake a broad program of Church reform, and he accepted, under duress, two critical decrees of Constance.

a. *Haec Sancta* (1415) declared that the authority of councils was superior to that of popes.

b. *Frequens* (1417) called for a new council in 5 years, then another in 7 years, followed by councils every 10 years.

I. Martin could not get to Rome until 1420 and faced military anarchy in central Italy, along with the hostility of Naples.

J. Clerics began assembling in Basel by late 1431, but only a few of them; thus, Martin's successor, Eugenius IV (r. 1431–1447), declared the council dissolved.

1. In 1439, radicals at Basel declared Eugenius deposed and elected Amadeus VIII of Savoy as Felix V, who earned little recognition except as history's last antipope.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. To everyone's great relief, the Great Schism did not open again.

IV. The kind of papacy that emerged from the schism will be a prominent feature of later lectures, but first, we must address all these councils.

A. The papal monarchy of the high Middle Ages did not leave much room for shared governance of the Church.

B. Already in the 12th and 13th centuries, writers were trying to understand the implications of the papal "fullness of power" (*plenitudo potestatis*).

C. The increasing study of Roman law led to reflections on the doctrine of corporations and its principle, "What touches all ought to be approved by all" (*Quod omnes tangit approbetur ab omnibus*).

D. The schism raised problems to which a *conciliar* ecclesiology emerged as an answer.

E. The fact that Pisa tried to solve the schism and that Constance did so conferred legitimacy and prestige on conciliarism.

F. The combination of Avignon and the Great Schism sent the papacy into the epoch we dub the Renaissance in a very different posture than the papacy had enjoyed in its high medieval heyday.

Recommended Reading:

Smith, *The Great Schism*.

Tierney, *Foundations of the Conciliar Theory*.

Questions to Consider:

1. What central flaws in the papacy's governing structure permitted the Great Schism to occur?
2. How, exactly, did conciliar theory counter the hierarchical thought of the high Middle Ages?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twelve
The Renaissance Papacy—Politics

Scope: Rome and the papacy made important contributions to the dynamic set of movements that we call the Renaissance. Statecraft constitutes one kind of contribution, and we will examine the place of the popes in the public culture, war, diplomacy, and government of the 15th-century world in this first of two lectures on the Renaissance. Culture constitutes the second, and more familiar, element of the Renaissance. We turn to that subject in the next lecture.

Papal activity during the Renaissance did little to bring credit to the institution. Still, one can discern some traditional areas of activity. The fall of Constantinople to the Turks in 1453 spurred a renewed interest in crusades. The definitive return of an unrivaled papacy to Rome led to attempts to put the Papal States in order. Many customary sources of revenue having dried up, the popes needed the revenues from the Papal States. But, as in the Middle Ages, the independence of the Papal States was believed to guarantee papal freedom of action. Renaissance popes were, therefore, engaged repeatedly in wars with Italian powers. The Renaissance popes also ruthlessly promoted their own families, handing out lands, offices, and incomes with a free hand. Within the Church, popes and cardinals engaged in a long-running and unsavory battle for power. Almost every Renaissance pope was more prince than priest.

Outline

I. The old, but not contemporary, term *Renaissance* may be used in either of two ways.

- **A.** It may be applied somewhat imprecisely to some chunk of the period, roughly, 1300 to 1600, with the chunk usually lopped off according to the dictates of particular disciplines (painting, sculpture, literature, philosophy, and so on). But the focus here is on cultural phenomena.
- **B.** The term can also be used, just as imprecisely, to refer to general historical developments in that same long period or some segment of it.

II. In this lecture, we will look at the papacy as an institutional, political, and diplomatic actor in what we might otherwise call the later Middle Ages.

III. Let us begin by attempting to characterize the popes of the Renaissance.

- **A.** When Eugenius IV was elected in 1431, 6 of 12 cardinals were Italian, but when Alexander VI was elected in 1492, 23 of 24 were Italian.
- **B.** Not only was papal Rome becoming more Italian, but quasi-dynasties were emerging in the Roman Church.
- **C.** The Renaissance period was not a time when the popes reached a very high standard of moral rectitude.
- **D.** The papacy became a secularized institution during the Renaissance.

IV. Let us set the national and international stage for the Renaissance papacy because, as we have learned, this background is essential to understanding other aspects of papal history.

- **A.** In the early 15th century, Milan's leaders were the Visconti family, followed by the Sforza family.
- **B.** In 1452, Venice attacked Milan, but the fall of Constantinople to the Turks in 1453 was sufficiently shocking that the major parties in Italy made peace at Lodi in 1454.
- **C.** Italy's peace was broken when the French invaded in 1494.
- **D.** In 1527, an army of German mercenaries, nominally in the service of Habsburg ruler Charles V of Spain, terrorized Italy and sacked Rome.
  1. Pope Clement VII (r. 1523-1534) finally joined an alliance of Milan, Florence, Venice, and France against Charles V, which resulted in peace in 1529.
  2. As a consequence of that peace, Clement crowned Charles emperor in Bologna in 1530, the last time a pope would crown a Holy Roman Emperor.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

V. No less important than the general historical situation was always the particular situation of the Papal States in central Italy.

A. The popes tried hard to maintain and even expand the Papal States, partly to provide independence in Italy and partly to provide revenues.

B. Popes often named either relatives or people from their home districts as rulers of various segments of the Papal States.

C. During the foreign occupations after 1494, several popes tried cleverly to expand the Papal States but without lasting success.

D. Down to the 19th century, the Papal States remained a top priority for the popes but represented an insignificant factor in Italian politics.

VI. The position of the pope within the Church was altered in subtle ways during the Renaissance.

A. The epoch of the Great Schism and conciliarism had somewhat contradictory results.

1. Basel partially discredited conciliarism, but in France (1438) and Germany (1448), rulers opportunistically imposed concordats that cut off revenues to Rome, some kinds of papal appointments, and some appeals to the papacy.

2. The popes meanwhile tried to quash conciliarism definitively, and Pius II issued the bull *Execrabilis* forbidding appeals to councils.

3. Julius II assembled Lateran V (1512–1517) to counter the French-inspired Council of Pisa (1512), which sought to restore *Haec Sancta* and *Frequens*. He effectively put *Unam Sanctam*, the powerful statement that Boniface VIII issued at the end of his failed pontificate, back in force, but it was clearly an empty letter in terms of practical effect.

B. The very calling of Lateran V points to other key issues.

1. There had been powerful calls for reform and a council for decades, even among ardent supporters of the papacy.

2. Fearful of the precedents set by Constance and, especially, Basel, the popes were reluctant to call councils at all.

VII. The basic institutions of the Roman Church changed relatively little.

A. Practically every pope agreed to an electoral capitulation and quite frequently dispensed money. Technically, this made simonists of popes and cardinals.

B. Grasping for new revenues, offices began to be sold.

C. The popes gradually assumed greater responsibility for governing Rome itself, which furthered the secularization of the Church.

VIII. The Renaissance papacy can be viewed in European perspective by looking at failed attempts to mount a new crusade.

A. Popes tried unsuccessfully several times to rally support in the Balkans for wars against the Turks.

B. The fall of Constantinople in 1453 did not have the kind of effect that some expected.

C. Pius II called a congress at Mantua in 1459 to launch a crusade, but virtually no one attended, and Venice had already concluded a lucrative commercial treaty with the Turks.

D. The continuing fragmentation of anything that might reasonably be called Christendom was ongoing, unstoppable, and dangerous for the long-term interests of the papacy.

Recommended Reading:

Prodi, *The Papal Prince*.

Thomson, *Popes and Princes, 1417–1517*.

Questions to Consider:

1. If you viewed them purely as secular rulers, how would you evaluate the Renaissance popes?

2. The popes were generally unsuccessful with their diplomatic ventures. Why?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Timeline

c. 6 B.C.–30 A.D.	Life and ministry of Jesus Christ.
c. 4 B.C.	Birth of Peter (Simon).
c. 28 A.D.	Peter meets Jesus.
42–67 A.D.	Dates traditionally given for Peter's term as the first pope, though their accuracy is questionable.
64–67 A.D.	Peter's crucifixion takes place sometime during this period.
c. 150	Sources speak of "monarchical bishops," suggesting that the bishops had come to be significant figures in the cities of the Roman world.
180–284	Crisis of the 3rd century: civil wars and succession crises, barbarian incursions along frontiers, rampant inflation, systematic persecution of Christians.
284–600	The world of late antiquity; Christian culture becomes dominant.
306–337	Reign of Constantine.
313	Constantine issues the Edict of Milan, making Christianity legal.
343	Council of Serdica decrees that appeals of unjust judgments against bishops could go to Rome.
381	Council of Constantinople I.
410	Pope Innocent I ministers to Rome after the sack of the city by the Goths.
451	Council of Chalcedon.
452	Pope Leo I persuades Attila the Hun not to sack Rome.
455	Pope Leo I persuades Gaiseric the Vandal not to sack Rome.
484–519	Acacian Schism.
535–555	Gothic Wars in Italy.
553	Fifth Ecumenical Council in Constantinople.
600–900	Period of the early Middle Ages.
751	Pippin III becomes king of the Franks.
773	Pippin's son, Charlemagne, defeats the Lombard king Desiderius and takes the Lombard crown for himself.
787	Second Council of Nicaea.
800	Pope Leo III crowns Charlemagne emperor of Rome.
900–1300	Europe's medieval highpoint.
c. 900–950	The family of Theophylact and Theodora dominates Rome.
c. 975–1025	Papacy dominated by powerful Roman or central Italian families.
1046	Emperor Henry III deposes three rival contenders for the papacy and imposes a choice of his own.
1058	Upon Henry III's death, Romans rise up against reformers and elect a pope in opposition to the reformers' choice, Nicholas II.
1075–1122	Investiture Controversy.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1077 ..... King Henry IV begs forgiveness and absolution from Pope Gregory VII.

1078 ..... Pope Gregory VII formally condemns lay investiture.

1095–1101 ..... First Crusade.

1122 ..... Concordat of Worms, which made a clear distinction between the spiritual side of a prelate's office and his position as a landed magnate and vassal of the crown.

1130 ..... Struggle for power between papal candidates backed by the powerful Pierleoni and Frangipani families.

1140 ..... Issuance of the *Concordantia Discordantium Canonum* (usually called Gratian's *Decretum*) as a rationalized compendium of Church law down to its time.

1145–1147 ..... Second Crusade.

1159–1180 ..... Papal schism centering on tensions between popes and German kings.

1176 ..... Lombard League forces defeat of Frederick Barbarossa at Legnano.

1177 ..... Peace of Venice; the German king and Roman emperor Frederick Barbarossa makes peace with Pope Alexander III.

1179 ..... Alexander III and the Lateran Council decree that popes will be elected by the *sanior pars* ("wiser part"), meaning a two-thirds majority.

1188–1192 ..... Third Crusade.

1192 ..... Cencius Savelli, as *camerarius*, draws up the *Liber Censuum*, a listing of virtually all revenues due to the papacy.

1204 ..... Fourth Crusade, during which Constantinople is taken.

1212 ..... Pope Innocent III elevates Frederick II to the throne of Germany.

1215 ..... Pope Innocent III's Fourth Lateran Council forms the basis for the *Clericis laicos*, forbidding taxation of the clergy.

1217 ..... Fifth Crusade, including the conquest of Damietta.

1228–1239 ..... Sixth Crusade.

1249–1252 ..... Seventh Crusade.

1270 ..... Eighth Crusade.

1297 ..... Pope Boniface VIII permits taxation of the clergy "in an emergency."

1300–1600 ..... Period of the Renaissance; religious reformation.

1305–1378 ..... Avignon papacy.

1337–1453 ..... Hundred Years War.

1378–1417 ..... Great Schism.

1414–1418 ..... Council of Constance, which ended the Great Schism.

1438 ..... French rulers impose a concordat that cuts off revenues to Rome, some kinds of papal appointments, and some appeals to the papacy.

1448 ..... German rulers impose a concordat that cuts off revenues to Rome, some kinds of papal appointments, and some appeals to the papacy.

1453 ..... Fall of Constantinople.

1454–1494 ..... Peace of Lodi.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1506 ..... Pope Julius II issues the *Cum tam divino*, which voids any papal selection tainted by simony.

1509 ..... Erasmus writes his widely read *In Praise of Folly*, an indictment of the contemporary Church.

1512 ..... French-inspired Council of Pisa, seeking to restore *Haec Sancta* and *Frequens*.

1512–1518 ..... Lateran V council, seeking to reestablish *Unam Sanctam*, in essence quashing the Council of Pisa.

1517 ..... Erasmus writes *Julius Exclusus*, another indictment of the Church.

1517 ..... Martin Luther posts his Ninety-five Theses on the church door in Wittenberg.

1520 ..... Pope Leo X issues the bull *Exsurge Domini*, condemning Martin Luther's teaching on 41 specific points.

1524 ..... St. Cajetan and Giovanni Pietro Caraffa (later Pope Paul IV) form the Theatine order of priests, explicitly focused on reforming the Church.

1525 ..... Charles V of Spain defeats Francis I of France near Pavia, then puts Rome to an eight-day sack.

1530 ..... Pope Clement VII crowns Charles V emperor of Rome, the last time a pope will crown a Holy Roman Emperor.

1534 ..... The Act of Supremacy makes Henry VIII head of the Church in England, although he does not embrace Protestant theology.

1534 ..... Ignatius Loyola forms the Society of Jesus (the Jesuits).

1536 ..... Commission created under Pope Paul III to determine what aspects of the Church need reform.

1542 ..... Roman Inquisition reinstated under Caraffa.

1545–1563 ..... Council of Trent affirms traditional Catholic teachings and institutes many reforms.

1548 ..... Confraternity of the Most Holy Trinity founded by Philip Neri (the "Apostle of Rome," 1515–1595) to care for pilgrims and the ill.

1555 ..... Peace of Augsburg, the first example of religious toleration in Europe.

1570 ..... Pope Pius V excommunicates the Protestant Queen Elizabeth I of England.

1582 ..... Pope Gregory XIII introduces the Gregorian calendar.

1600–1700 ..... Baroque era.

1618–1648 ..... Thirty Years War between the Catholic Habsburgs and Protestant powers of Germany.

1633 ..... Pope Urban VIII condemns Galileo's writings and commits him to imprisonment.

1700 ..... War of the Spanish Succession.

1700–1800 ..... Era of the Enlightenment.

1789–1799 ..... French Revolution.

1815 ..... Congress of Vienna.

1860 ..... Pope Pius IX loses the Papal States.

1864 ..... Pope Pius IX writes his *Syllabus of Errors* to counter the "progress, liberalism, and modern civilization" seen as corrupting tradition.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1869 ..... Vatican I opened in the presence of more than 700 bishops, the largest council in the Church's history.

1870 ..... Vatican I adopts *Dei Filius*, a decree on faith that essentially affirms the teachings expressed in Pope Pius IX's *Syllabus* of 1864, and *Pastor Aeternus*, defining papal infallibility and making the pope universal ordinary.

1870 ..... Pope Pius IX loses Rome.

1900–present ..... Modern era of the Church.

1908 ..... French theologian Alfred Loisy excommunicated.

1914–1918 ..... World War I.

1920 ..... Pope Benedict XV canonizes Joan of Arc as a concession to France in the wake of hostility following the pope's efforts to keep Italy out of World War I.

1929 ..... Lateran Treaty turns the Papal States into Vatican City and puts the pope's political position in the modern world on a new footing.

1933 ..... Pope Pius XI negotiates controversial concordat with Nazi Germany.

1939–1945 ..... World War II.

1942 ..... The Vatican opens relations with Japan.

1960 ..... Pope John XXIII creates a Secretariat for Christian Unity.

1961 ..... Pope John XXIII sends envoys to the World Council of Churches meeting in Delhi.

1962–1965 ..... Second Vatican Council (Vatican II).

1963 ..... Pope Paul VI appoints a study commission to examine the use of artificial contraception, banned by the Church.

1964 ..... Pope Paul VI signals papal interest in Asian Catholics by attending a Eucharistic congress in Bombay.

1965 ..... Pope Paul VI addresses the United Nations, pleading for an end to war.

1965 ..... Pope Paul VI and Orthodox Patriarch Athenagoras I issue a joint resolution regretting the mutual excommunications of 1054.

1988 ..... Pope John Paul II institutes the apostolic constitution *Pastor Bonus*.

1994 ..... Pope John Paul II hailed as *Time* magazine's "Man of the Year."

1996 ..... Pope John Paul II makes changes to the procedures for electing a pope.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Glossary

Allocution: A solemn form of address or speech used by the pope on certain occasions.

Antipope: A false claimant of the Holy See in opposition to a pontiff canonically elected.

Arianism: See **Arius** in Biographical Notes.

Augsburg, Peace of: A settlement made in 1555 between Lutherans and Catholics in Germany, which included the principle *cuius regio, eius religio* ("whose the rule, his the religion"). Princes could dictate the religion of their lands, and people were free to stay and practice that religion or migrate elsewhere. The settlement ignored Calvinists yet was the first example of religious toleration in Europe.

Babylonian Captivity: Derisive name for the period when the papacy resided in Avignon (1305–1378).

Baroque: Period in the history of Western culture and art roughly coinciding with the 17th century. The work that distinguishes the Baroque period is stylistically complex and strives to evoke emotional states. Qualities associated with the Baroque are sensuous richness, drama, vitality, tension, and emotional exuberance

Bishops: "Overseers" in Greek, the chief religious and administrative officers of the Christian Church.

Breviary: A priest's daily prayer book.

Camera*/*Camerarius: The pope's chamberlain, responsible for writing, recordkeeping, and overseeing the financial machinery of the Church.

Cardinals: Key officers of the Catholic Church. Emerged in late antiquity and achieved institutional prominence in the 12th century. Served as papal electors.

Carolingian: Dynasty of Frankish rulers whose most famous member was Charlemagne (Carolus Magnus). The Carolingians came to power in 751 and ruled until 911 in Germany and 987 in France.

Cistercians: Monks of Citeaux, in Burgundy, or their allies; a community of reformed Benedictine monks who sought primitive purity. Their influence spread rapidly in the 12th century.

Clericis laicos: Order issued by Pope Boniface VIII forbidding taxation of the clergy.

Cluny: Great monastery founded in Burgundy in 910 to be free of all lay control. Tremendously influential well into the 12th century, not least because of its famous abbots.

Conciliarism: Doctrine spawned during the Great Schism, which maintained that Church councils, not the popes, are supreme in the Church.

Conclave: Assembly of the cardinals for the purpose of electing a new pope.

Concordantia Discordantium Canonum: A rationalized compendium of Church law developed in 1140. Thereafter, several new collections of decretals were issued.

Concordat of Worms: Compromise arranged in 1122 between Pope Calixtus II and Roman Emperor Henry IV marking the end of the first phase of the Investiture Controversy. The Concordat of Worms made a clear distinction between the spiritual side of a prelate's office and his position as a landed magnate and vassal of the crown.

Confraternity of the Most Holy Trinity: Order founded by the "Apostle of Rome," Philip Neri, that devoted itself to caring for pilgrims and the ill.

Consistory: Session in which the cardinals and the popes formally meet to discuss and make decisions about the affairs of the Church.

Constitutiones: Documents issued by the pope without his being asked to do so.

Council of Constance (1414–1418): Broad program of Church reform that ended the Great Schism. Two critical decrees declared that the authority of councils was superior to that of popes and called for a new council in 5 years, another in 7 years, then one every 10 years.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Council of Trent (1545–1563): Most important Catholic Church council of the Reformation era. Affirmed traditional Catholic teachings and instituted many reforms.

Counter Reformation: From the 1560s, an effort by the Catholic Church to win back areas lost to Protestants. Most effective in Poland and southern Germany.

Crusades: Long series of "armed pilgrimages" between 1095 and 1291 designed to liberate the Holy Land from the "infidels" (Muslims). The French were most prominent in the Crusades. Papal leadership was sometimes effective, but the overall results were limited.

Curia Romana: General reference to the papal court, the Church's government, or specifically, to the pope and the cardinals sitting in consistory.

Decretals: A form of document and practice derived directly from Roman imperial procedure.

Defensores: Church officials who possessed minor judicial authority.

Diocese: The territory under the authority of any bishop; the word comes from Roman imperial administration.

Dominicans: Mendicant order founded by Dominic de Guzman (1170–1221) in southern France. The ideal of the monks was to combat heresy by acquiring great learning and living exemplary lives. The order produced many great scholars.

Donatism: Christian movement, named for Bishop Donatus, that arose in Africa after Constantine granted legal status to Christianity. The movement objected to forgiving Christians who knuckled under during times of persecution and opposed welcoming them back to the fold.

Ecclesiology: The theory of Church government.

Edict of Milan: Decree in 313 whereby Constantine granted legal toleration to Christianity.

Eirenicism: Theology aiming at religious unity.

Encyclical: A papal letter addressed to bishops or to the Church hierarchy of a specific country.

Enlightenment: An intellectual movement in the late 17th and 18th centuries characterized by an abiding faith in the power of human reason.

Excommunication: Ecclesiastical punishment in which a person is denied the sacraments of the Church and forbidden most kinds of ordinary human interaction.

Febronianism: A politico-ecclesiastical system outlined by Johann Nikolaus von Hontheim (1701–1790), auxiliary bishop of Trier (under the pseudonym Justinus Febronius), that attempted a reconciliation of Protestants with the Church by proposing diminished papal power.

Franciscans: Mendicant order founded by Francis of Assisi (1181/1182–1226) based on poverty and service to outcasts. Tremendously popular but riven by factional strife over the question of individual versus corporate property.

Gallicanism: A French movement with the intent of diminishing papal authority and increasing the power of the state over the Church. It was viewed as heretical by the Roman Catholic Church.

Great Schism (1378–1417): Period during which two or even three rivals claimed to be the legitimate pope. Generally considered the greatest crisis in papal history, the schism grew out of the papacy's period of residence in Avignon (see **Babylonian Captivity**).

Holy See: The authority of the pope to govern the Church.

Huguenots: Name for French Protestants of the Calvinist variety; derives from a medieval romance about King Hugo.

Humanism: Movement encompassing love for the literary culture of antiquity, concern for human beings, and interest in secular rather than theological issues. Often associated with the Renaissance.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Hundred Years War: Conflict between France and England (1337–1453) rooted in the longstanding controversy over English royal holdings in France. The English won most battles, but the French won the war.

Indulgences: In Catholic theology, the remission of some portion of the temporal punishment for sin. Subject to massive abuses in the late Middle Ages.

Inquisition: Ecclesiastical judicial process for the identification and reconciliation of heretics. Followed basic principles of Roman law.

Interdict: Ecclesiastical censure whereby most sacramental services are forbidden in a defined area to pressure the rulers of that region.

Interregnum: The period between the end of a sovereign's (or a pope's) reign and the accession of his successor.

Investiture Controversy: Institutional and ideological battle between popes and German emperors in the 11th and 12th centuries; finally won by the popes at great cost to the Germans.

Jansenism: Christian teaching of Cornelius Jansen, which held that people are saved by God's grace, not by their own willpower, because all spiritual initiatives are God's. Jansenism divided the Roman Catholic Church in France in the mid-17th century.

Jesuits: Common name for the religious order called the Society of Jesus, founded in 1534 by Ignatius Loyola. The order is dedicated to poverty, chastity, and obedience to the pope. Its members are famous as teachers, scholars, and missionaries.

Josephism: Religious reform movement developed by Joseph II of Austria (1741–1790). Like Febronianism, Josephism focused on minimizing papal authority.

Lateran Councils: Councils called by the popes to facilitate the governance of the Church. The most important was the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215.

Lateran Treaty of 1929: Agreement between the papacy and Mussolini's government that turned the Papal States into Vatican City and put the pope's political position in the modern world on a new footing.

Lay investiture: The investing of a clergyman with both the symbols and the reality of his office by a layman.

Legate: One whom the pope sends to sovereigns or governments or only to the members of the episcopate and faithful of a country, as his representative, to handle Church matters or on a mission of honor.

Liberation theology: Doctrine, often Marxist tinged, teaching that Christians must work for social and economic justice for all people.

Lombards: Germanic people who entered Italy in 568 and gradually built a strong kingdom with a rich culture, especially in law, only to fall to the more powerful Franks in 773–774.

Modernism: Artistic and cultural movement that generally includes progressive art and architecture, music, and literature, emerging in the decades before 1914, as artists rebelled against late-19th-century academic and historicist traditions.

Monoenergism: Christian doctrine holding that Jesus Christ had two natures but a single will. Proposed as a compromise between the Monophysitist view and that of the Council of Chalcedon.

Monophysitism: Christian heresy prominent in the eastern Mediterranean world holding that Jesus Christ had only one true (divine) nature. Condemned by the Council of Chalcedon in 451. Still influential among West Asian Christians.

Nuncio: A permanent representative of the pope, vested with both political and ecclesiastical powers, first appearing in the 16th century. The nuncio's office is limited to a specific district (his *nunciature*), wherein he must reside; his mission is general, embracing all interests of the Holy See.

Papal States: Lands in central Italy ruled by the papacy beginning in the 8th century.

Peace of Lodi: A 40-year period (1454–1494) of relative peace and prosperity in Italy; an important background to the cultural side of the Renaissance.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Penitentiara: The Church's court for dispensations.

Peter's pence: The annual voluntary laymen's contribution to the support of the pope.

Petrine theory: Idea advanced by Roman bishops that, just as Peter was leader of the apostles, so, too, is the successor to Peter the leader of the Church. Based on Matthew 16:16–19.

Pontificate: The term of office of a pope.

Pope: The bishop of Rome who, on the basis of the Petrine theory, the historical resonances of Rome, and various historical circumstances, achieved a leading position in the Catholic Church.

Protestant: Latin word meaning "they protest" that appeared in a document of 1529. Became a catchall designation for persons who left the Catholic Church and the descendants of such people.

Religious (noun): A person who belongs to a religious order.

Renaissance: Generally means "rebirth," specifically of the literary culture of Greco-Roman antiquity. The term was traditionally applied to Italy during the period 1300 to 1550 but is increasingly applied to all periods of significant cultural efflorescence.

Rota Romana: The second highest tribunal of the Roman Catholic Church.

Schemata: Documents spelling out issues for discussion in a council.

Schism of 1130: The struggle between popes supported by the powerful Pierleoni and Frangipani families.

Simony: Selling the gifts of the Holy Spirit, especially religious offices.

Spiritualia: The spiritual, sacramental, or holy side of a churchman's office.

Syllabus of Errors: Document written by Pope Pius IX to counter the "progress, liberalism, and modern civilization" that he saw as corrupting tradition.

Temporalia: The temporal dimensions of the authority that churchmen have by dint of investiture. These responsibilities might be legal, financial, or military.

Theatines: Order of priests formed by St. Cajetan and Giovanni Pietro Caraffa (later Pope Paul IV), aimed explicitly at reforming the Church.

Thirty Years War: Series of European conflicts from 1618 to 1648, primarily based on the profound religious antagonism engendered among Germans by the events of the Protestant Reformation.

Tropaion: A special tomb or a cenotaph, a monument to a deceased person whose remains are interred elsewhere.

Ultramontanism: Policy of supporting papal authority.

Uniate churches: Eastern Christian communities that were in full communion with Rome but retained all their rites, customs, and languages. They are found throughout Eastern Europe and in the Middle East.

Vatican II: The Second Vatican Council was an ecclesial, theological, and ecumenical congress convened from 1962 through 1965. The council produced 16 documents and marked a fundamental shift toward the modern Church.

Vatican City: An independent state within Rome, the product of the Lateran Treaty of 1929, that is ruled by the pope and serves as world headquarters of the Roman Catholic Church.

Vernacular: Languages or other cultural manifestations that are not in Latin.

Vestararius: A financial officer of the Church.

Zelanti: Extremely conservative 18th-century cardinals.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Popes and the Papacy: A History

Part II

Professor Thomas F. X. Noble

THE TEACHING COMPANY ®

Thomas F. X. Noble, Ph.D.

Professor of History, Notre Dame University

Thomas Noble is the Robert M. Conway Director of the Medieval Institute and Professor of History at the University of Notre Dame. He assumed his current position in January of 2001 after teaching for 20 years at the University of Virginia and 4 years at Texas Tech University.

Professor Noble earned his B.A. in history at Ohio University and his M.A. and Ph.D. in medieval history at Michigan State University, where he studied with the distinguished medievalist Richard E. Sullivan. During his years as a graduate student, Professor Noble held a Fulbright-Hays Fellowship, which took him to Belgium for a year and gave him the opportunity to study with François-Louis Ganshof and Léopold Génicot. Subsequently, he has been awarded two fellowships by the National Endowment for the Humanities, two research grants by the American Philosophical Society, and a visiting fellowship in Clare Hall (University of Cambridge).

Professor Noble's research interests are concentrated in the late antique and early medieval periods (A.D. 300–1000). He has worked on religious history, the history of Rome and the papacy, and the age of Charlemagne. His first book, *The Republic of St. Peter* (1984; Italian translation, 1997) explored the origins of papal temporal rule. Dr. Noble has also edited four volumes and has written more than a dozen articles on Roman and papal history as a preparatory to a history of the papacy from its origins to 1046. Shortly, Dr. Noble will complete a long monograph, *Images and the Carolingians*, itself preceded by six articles, which explores controversies over religious art in the 8th and 9th centuries, set against the background of late-antique and Byzantine art discourse. In 2004, Houghton-Mifflin published the fourth edition of his successful co-authored textbook, *Western Civilization: The Continuing Experiment*.

Dr. Noble has been a member of the Institute for Advanced Study (Princeton) and the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study (Wassenaar). In 2002, he was elected a Fellow of the Societa Internazionale per lo Studio del Medioevo Latino (Florence) and, in 2004, was elected a Fellow of the Medieval Academy of America. Dr. Noble currently serves on the editorial boards of *Speculum* and *Church History* and has held offices and/or served on committees in the American Academy of Religion, the American Catholic Historical Association, the American Historical Association, and the Medieval Academy of America.

Professor Noble has taught courses in Western civilization for more than 25 years, along with surveys of medieval Europe and Church history. He has also taught advanced courses in late antiquity and Carolingian history. In 1999, Professor Noble was presented with the Alumni Distinguished Professor award at the University of Virginia, that institution's highest award for teaching excellence, and a Harrison award for outstanding undergraduate advising. Dr. Noble has supervised 11 dissertations, and his Ph.D. students now teach at colleges and universities across the country.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Table of Contents

Popes and the Papacy: A History
Part II

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Popes and the Papacy: A History

Scope:

The papacy is the oldest continuously functioning institution in the world. Indeed, in all the world's history, only a few institutions can trace so long an unbroken history. This fact alone commands attention. And if anyone wonders whether that story still matters, we have only to think about the rapt attention that the world lavished in 2005 on the death of Pope John Paul II and the election of his successor, Benedict XVI. Four million people streamed into Rome, and many people waited up to 30 hours to pay their respects to John Paul. Media outlets all over the globe devoted almost continuous coverage to the solemn events that marked the passing of one pontificate and the inception of another.

What, then, is papal history? At its core, it is four histories. The first is the history of an idea, the idea of the *Petrine Office* and of the *ecclesiology*—that's a theologian's word for the theory of Church government—that flows from that office. Second, it is the history of an institution. The Catholic Church has one pope at a time (albeit sometimes, there have been two or more men claiming to be legitimate pope!), but the papacy is an institution that transcends time. Americans are familiar with separating presidents from the presidency. So, too, we shall learn to distinguish between popes and the papacy. Third, it is the serial biography of 265 men, some holy and some wicked, some efficient and some incompetent, some learned and some simple, some visionary and some blinkered. There were also more than 30 antipopes from 217 to 1447, and we will meet some of them, as well. Fourth, the history of the popes and the papacy is, in some ways, a mirror of the history of Western civilization itself. At every great moment and turning point, the popes were there as participants, promoters, or critics. Viewing Western civilization through a papal lens will open for us unique perspectives on the end of the Roman Empire; the evangelization of Europe; the Crusades; the Renaissance; the Reformation; the Enlightenment; the great movements of modern times, such as industrialization, urbanization, science, and mass politics; and finally, the world wars and the collapse of communism.

Papal history has tended to be written in huge volumes, sometimes many-volume collections, or in highly specialized studies in many languages. As a result, the suggested readings at the end of each lecture in this course often refer to chapters in larger works, as well as to particular studies. Books that themselves contain rich bibliographical information are marked with an asterisk (*) in the bibliography.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Thirteen
The Renaissance Papacy—Culture

Scope: It is an open question whether the popes might have contributed sooner to the Renaissance movement had it not been for Avignon and the Great Schism. The "New Learning"—an intellectual, cultural, and educational movement much indebted to Greece and Rome—began to flourish in Florence in the last decades of the 14th century. The papacy made contact with this movement when Eugenius IV and his court spent some time in Florence from 1434 to 1443. Nicholas V really initiated the Renaissance movement in Rome, and it persisted for a century. The popes restored and rebuilt much of the fabric of ancient Rome and restored many of Rome's churches. The Vatican Library was begun, and almost every famous Renaissance painter, sculptor, and architect received commissions in the city from popes, papal relatives, or cardinals.

Outline

I. In this lecture, we ask what role the popes played in the remarkable cultural efflorescence that we call the Renaissance.

II. The Renaissance phenomenon was rooted in Italian, particularly Florentine, perceptions of their own history and of their contemporary connections to the cultures of ancient Greece and Rome.

- **A.** Central to the Renaissance was what we call *Humanism*.
- **B.** Courtly, princely, and civic pride also played key roles in sustaining the Renaissance.
- **C.** The papal court first made serious contact with the Humanists when Eugenius IV, as a fugitive from Rome, was in Florence from 1434 to 1443.
- **D.** Nicholas V (r. 1447–1455) inaugurated the Roman and papal Renaissance.

III. The Renaissance papacy played a key role in physically transforming Rome.

- **A.** Nicholas V definitively moved into the Vatican Palace.
- **B.** Sixtus IV is most famous for initiating a restoration of the Sistine Chapel.
- **C.** Several popes after Nicholas V added to the Vatican Palace.
- **D.** To accommodate pilgrims and because of design considerations, Roman streets were relocated in 1450 and 1475, and Sixtus IV built the first bridge over the Tiber since antiquity.
- **E.** Paul II restored some ancient monuments, such as the Pantheon, and Leo X commissioned Michelangelo several times.
- **F.** Several popes dreamed of rebuilding St. Peter's, but this stupendous project was begun by Julius II on a plan by Bramante.

IV. The literary dimension of the Roman Renaissance is multifaceted but did not result in an array of famous writers.

- **A.** Nicholas V took one of the greatest steps in founding the Vatican Library.
- **B.** Literary Humanism had various implications for papal Rome.
  - **1.** Paul II instituted the first printing press in Rome.
  - **2.** By 1500, perhaps 100 Humanists were in the papal employ, and their culture may well have contributed to the secular and pagan taste of Renaissance Rome.
- **C.** The Medici pope Leo X patronized famous Florentine writers, such as the historian Francesco Guicciardini and the commentator Niccolò Machiavelli (the model for Machiavelli's *Prince* was Alexander VI's son Cesare Borgia).

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

V. The popes were among the great patrons of the Renaissance era.

A. We can see the way of the future in Eugenius IV's summoning of Fra Angelico (1400–1455) to Rome to decorate a chapel; Angelico continued to work under Nicholas V.

B. Pius II had Benozzo Gozzoli (1420–1497) paint the processional standards for his installation.

C. Sixtus IV got a gallery of stars to paint the 28 niches between the windows in his new Sistine Chapel.

D. Piero Pollaiuolo (1443–1496) created a tomb for Sixtus IV, then a bronze statue of Innocent VIII.

E. Alexander VI had Pinturrichio (1454–1513) decorate his apartments in the Vatican. Julius II, who hated Alexander and would not use his apartments, moved into new quarters and had Raphael (Raffaello Sanzio, 1483–1520) decorate them.

F. Julius II not only commissioned Bramante (1444–1514) to design for him a new St. Peter's, but he also brought Michelangelo to Rome, first to do the sculptures for a monumental tomb, then for the ceiling of the Sistine Chapel.

G. These few examples must suffice to give a sense of the range and quality of the work accomplished under papal auspices.

VI. Finally, to gain a little better sense of the Renaissance papacy, let's look at two members of this rogues' gallery for closer inspection: Pius II (r. 1458–1464) and Julius II (r. 1503–1513).

A. Enea Silvio Piccolomini (Pius II) was born near Siena in 1405 and studied at Siena and Florence. His brilliance recommended him to Cardinal Domenico Capranica, and this launched his career.

1. He traveled with Capranica to Basel, then began a series of diplomatic journeys on behalf of several important churchmen.

2. A serious illness caused him to abandon his dissolute life (he fathered several illegitimate children) and take holy orders in 1446.

3. His rise through the clerical ranks was meteoric: bishop of Trieste in 1447, of Siena in 1450, and cardinal by 1456.

4. In a three-day conclave in 1458, he was elected and took the name Pius, playing on Pius Aeneas of Virgil's *Aeneid*.

5. As pope, Pius rather disappointed the Humanists, the secularists, and his former friends among the conciliarists.

6. His great dream was to launch a crusade, but he could never get the necessary cooperation.

B. Giuliano delle Rovere (Julius II) was born near Savona in 1443 to a poor family. He was educated by the Franciscans and owed his subsequent career to the election of his uncle Francesco as Sixtus IV in 1471.

1. Sixtus made Giuliano bishop of Carpentras and cardinal in 1471.

2. When Alexander VI died in 1503, Giuliano could not prevent the election of Pius III, but Pius lived only a few weeks; Giuliano then, in effect, bought his own election with cash and the promise of various offices.

3. He aimed, more or less simultaneously, to reconstitute the Papal States and to drive the "barbarians" out of Italy.

4. "Il terribile" led campaign after campaign in his silver armor.

5. Guicciardini said that there was nothing of the priest about Julius except "the name and the dress." There is little to be said of his religious work.

6. We might add here only that despite his lavish expenditures, he left the treasury full.

7. The remarkable thing about Julius II is that this energetic man tirelessly advanced the interests of the papacy as he understood them.

Recommended Reading:

Shaw, *Julius II*.

Stinger, *The Renaissance in Rome*.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Questions to Consider:

1. How might the Renaissance movement have been different if the papacy had not participated?
2. Compare Pius II and Julius II as popes and Renaissance figures.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Fourteen
The Challenge of Reform—Protestantism

Scope: Calls for "reform" were as old as the Christian Church itself. In the age of the Renaissance, voices constantly raised the call for moral, spiritual, and institutional reform. The Renaissance popes, when they were not preoccupied with their cultural endeavors or family aggrandizement, were generally suspicious of reform and reformers. They tended to think always in terms of conciliarism and attempts to check papal power. Consequently, when Martin Luther called for a debate on indulgences in 1517, Leo X was ill-disposed to engage him. For the next 20 or 30 years, as Protestantism settled firmly into place in important parts of Europe, the popes dithered. They feared altering the diplomatic situation in Europe and were concerned that modest and necessary institutional reforms might mushroom into wholesale limitations on papal authority. Further, they never understood the nature of the theological challenge that had arisen in Germany. It is interesting to speculate on whether a more enlightened papal response to calls for reform might have changed dramatically the religious history of the modern world.

Outline

I. A quick history lesson will put the next two lectures in context and explain why we must journey to and fro among seemingly distinct topics and periods.

- **A.** In the 18th and 19th centuries, particularly under the influence of the Enlightenment, educated opinion sought the origins of the modern world in a conscious abandonment of the allegedly backward, superstitious, priest-ridden Middle Ages.
- **B.** Focus soon fell on the achievements of the Renaissance, although some overly enthusiastic interpreters seem to have missed the deeply religious side of the Renaissance.
- **C.** The call by many Renaissance figures for reform of the Church was duly noted, but the reform that seemed most obviously to have arisen was *the* Reformation—the Protestant Reformation.
- **D.** Given that we are trying to understand the history of the popes from the mid-15th to the early 17th centuries (with particular emphasis in this lecture and the next one on the 16th century), we need to ask how we should think about this period.
  - **1.** The Protestant Reformation emerged under manifestly "Renaissance" popes.
  - **2.** Once the popes began to take stock of Protestantism and of the need for reform in their own Church, they became "reformers."
- **E.** This lecture and the next one will treat the 17 pontificates from Leo X to Paul V (1513–1621). A final reminder is in order: These lectures will somewhat overlap each other and the two previous lectures.

II. We may begin by cataloguing a few details about the popes of this turbulent century.

- **A.** The Dutchman Hadrian VI (r. 1522–1523) was so pious and ascetic, and so disliked by the Romans (he could not speak Italian), that it was not until 1978 that another non-Italian was elected pope.
- **B.** Seven of the popes were nobles—or had good claim to noble status—while 10 were of middling or poor stock.
- **C.** Only 3 popes were Romans—only 2 if one discounts Urban VII, who was born in Rome to a Genoese family.
- **D.** The pontificates of these 17 popes averaged only 6 years; thus, the period saw frequent elections and a good deal of factional squabbling.
- **E.** The popes' ages at election averaged just under 61 years, rather older than in the Renaissance period.
- **F.** On the whole, the educational standard of the Reformation popes was very high.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

III. We may identify at least three background factors to Martin Luther's tacking of his Ninety-five Theses to the castle church door in Wittenberg in 1517.

A. Luther (1483–1546) was objecting specifically to the bull issued by Julius II and Leo X authorizing the sale of indulgences to raise funds to rebuild St. Peter's.

B. There had long been calls for reform of the Church involving both theological issues and matters of practical administration.

1. In Florence, Girolamo Savonarola (1452–1498), a fiery Dominical preacher, had been arguing for personal spiritual renewal, while also calling the pope "the Antichrist" and Rome "the harlot of Babylon."

2. Many Christian Humanists had doubts about at least some of the teachings of the Church and real objections to the loose and easy lives of the clergy generally, but especially of the Renaissance popes.

C. Many in Germany had long felt that the Church and the emperors had taken advantage of them to advance other causes and interests.

IV. Leo X (r. 1513–1521) had shut down the Fifth Lateran Council in 1517 and was in no mood to consider plans for "reform."

A. When he learned of Luther's actions, he first attempted to get the Augustinian order to discipline him; then he tried to get Frederick of Saxony to remove his protection.

B. Luther kept on writing and teaching, and in 1520, Leo issued the bull *Exsurge Domini*, which condemned Luther's teaching on 41 specific points. Luther publicly burned the bull and denied papal authority.

C. Leo then excommunicated Luther, perhaps supposing that would end the matter.

V. When Leo X died suddenly, the cardinals elected Hadrian of Utrecht, mainly because he had no enemies. At the time, Hadrian was a grand inquisitor in Spain.

A. Hadrian sent a legate to a diet in Nuremburg in 1522; the legate acknowledged that the Church was in serious need of reform and that the pope and the hierarchy were obstacles to reform.

B. But Hadrian dismissed Luther as a "petty monk" and an insignificant heretic.

C. Clearly, informed opinion in Rome had not figured out what Luther was all about.

VI. The cardinals then turned to a Renaissance aristocrat, Clement VII (r. 1523–1534), who was, on the whole, a decent man who did not give rise to scandals. But he, too, had no understanding of what was happening in Germany, and on his "watch," other forms of Protestantism began to spread and England was lost to the Church.

A. Like his predecessors, Clement tried to play the French and the Spanish off against each other so that neither would be able to dominate Italy.

1. To Clement's horror, Charles V of Spain defeated Francis I of France near Pavia in 1525.

2. Months later, Charles marched on Rome, and his army put Rome to a terrible eight-day sack.

B. The situation in England is revealing of the currents of the age.

1. Henry VIII mobilized his theologians to refute Luther, and Leo X named him "Defender of the Faith."

2. But Henry wanted a male heir, which it seemed that his wife, Catherine of Aragon, could not give him.

3. He sent Cardinal Wolsey to Rome to negotiate a possible annulment, which might have been granted with some ease were it not for two immediate problems.

a. Julius II had issued a special dispensation to permit Henry to marry his brother's widow in spite of the biblical prohibition.

b. Rome was just then in the hands of Catherine's favorite nephew, Charles V, who would not stand for the humiliation of his aunt.

4. Henry finally grew impatient, divorced his wife, and married his mistress, Anne Boleyn, who after all this, bore him a daughter, Elizabeth Tudor.

5. In 1534, with the Act of Supremacy, Henry made himself the head of the Church in England without, however, embracing Protestant theology.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

VII. The currents of the early Reformation era all met in Paul III (r. 1534– 1549).

A. In many respects, he was a "Renaissance" man, or pope, but he also had a real sense of the need for reform.

B. Paul appointed a number of remarkable men to the cardinalate, some of whom would be influential for decades, including Gasparo Contarini, Reginald Pole, and Gianpietro Caraffa.

C. These men, along with others, were appointed to a commission in 1536 to study the areas needing reform. When they issued *Consilium de emendenda ecclesia*, it was so critical that Paul held it back, but a pirated copy got to Germany, where Luther translated it into German and published it.

D. Standing in the way of a council, then, were several kinds of problems.

1. The Lutherans demanded, as the price of their participation, that the council be "Christian," that is, that laymen participate and that the pope not preside.

2. The emperor wanted a council that he could control or, at least, influence and that would deal with practical matters and abuses, not with theology.

3. The king of France took delight in Germany's troubles and pressed for theological reform.

4. Among Paul's cardinals, there were disagreements: Pole wanted to talk about theology, while Caraffa wanted moral and spiritual reform, believing the Lutherans (and even Pole!) to be heretics.

E. Paul saw other spiritual forces taking shape.

1. New religious orders were formed: the Oratory, the Theatines, and most famously, the Jesuits.

2. The Roman Inquisition was reinstituted in 1542 under Caraffa.

F. Finally, in 1545, Paul saw the convening of the Council of Trent, which would go on intermittently for 18 years.

VIII. One good way to enter the spirit and achievements of the era is to look at the vicissitudes of Trent.

A. That Paul III got the council underway at all was a triumph of papal diplomacy, but he always intended to manage the council carefully. In fact, an outbreak of typhoid fever in Trent in 1546 permitted the pope to transfer the council to Bologna in 1547, then to suspend it in 1548.

B. Julius III (r. 1550–1555) reopened Trent in 1551, but the French refused to attend, and when the Elector of Saxony joined King Henry II of France in a war against the empire, Julius had to suspend the council again.

C. In 1555, Paul IV (r. 1555–1559) was enraged by two disturbing developments.

1. Charles V abdicated and divided his vast realms between Philip II (Charles's son), who got Spain, Italy, the Netherlands, and the New World, and Ferdinand (Charles's brother), who got Germany and Austria. Paul felt that Charles was abdicating not so much his realms as his responsibility.

2. In the Peace of Augsburg, the emperor accepted the religious status quo in the German lands. To Paul, this acceptance was akin to accommodating heretics.

D. Pius IV ("il Medechino") (r. 1559–1565) managed to reconvene the council, to which he was honestly committed, in 1562–1563.

E. Despite its checkered history, the Council of Trent accomplished a great deal.

1. The council affirmed the equal validity of scripture and tradition, the Church's sole right to interpret the Bible, the authority of the text of the Vulgate, traditional teaching on Original Sin and justification and merit, and traditional teaching on the sacraments, in particular, the doctrine of transubstantiation.

2. More cursory affirmations were given to relics, images, saints, and indulgences (although the sale of indulgences was effectively banned).

3. After the council, its call for a new edition of the Vulgate, a new breviary and missal, and a catechism was answered by the resolute work of several popes.

F. Trent did not win back any land for the Catholic Church; in that sense, then, it was not part of a Counter Reformation, but it did mark a crucial step in the Catholic Church's undertaking to put its own house in order.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Recommended Reading:

Bainton, *Here I Stand: A Life of Martin Luther*.

Jedin, *History of the Council of Trent*, vols. 1 and 2.

Questions to Consider:

1. Why did the popes take so long to respond effectively to Martin Luther?
2. In how many different ways can you find the word *reform* being used in the first half of the 16th century?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Fifteen
Catholic Reform and Counter Reform

Scope: The 15th century has been viewed as a time of intense reform within the Catholic Church and as a "Counter Reform" designed to stop the spread of Protestantism and to win back Protestants. Both views have merit. Paul III was a Roman aristocrat, a Humanist, and thoroughly corrupt. But he also saw the need for institutional reform. The need for reform was no less urgent for some of his successors, who were decent and pious men. New religious orders, for example, the Society of Jesus (the Jesuits), were founded. Great artists continued to be employed in making Rome ever grander, partly as a continuation of Renaissance initiatives and partly to glorify the popes themselves at a time when they were challenged. The popes pressed European rulers to combat Protestantism and founded schools to train missionaries for service in formerly Catholic but now Protestant lands. The popes played a leading role in fighting the Turks and worked hard to spread Catholic Christianity around the globe.

Outline

I. In the years after Paul III summoned the Council of Trent, the Catholic Church affirmed and more precisely defined its theology, reformed some basic institutions, and carried the Renaissance into the Baroque.

- **A.** The popes of this period were a mixed bag: Compare the pederast Julius III and the ill-tempered bigot Paul IV to the austere and ascetic Pius V, the learned Gregory XIII, and the elegantly patrician Paul V.
- **B.** Large-scale political tensions in Europe continued to hound papal efforts at reform.
- **C.** There were widespread signs of authentic spiritual revival, and several popes played key roles in promoting and sustaining this activity.
- **D.** Cultural achievements abounded—many of them visible to this day.

II. The overall political situation in Europe was, from a papal point of view, an uncontrollable mess.

- **A.** The great fact of the age was the almost Europe-wide battle of the Habsburgs and the Valois.
- **B.** France posed an interesting problem in its own right.
  - **1.** French Protestants—Huguenots—were growing in numbers, prominence, and acceptance.
  - **2.** By the 1590s, the Catholic Party in France was prepared to accept the Protestant Henry IV as king because he was most likely to prevent Spanish domination of France.
  - **3.** Sixtus V grudgingly accepted Henry, who later delighted the Catholics by becoming one himself, although the staunchest among them disliked his Edict of Nantes in 1598 that essentially guaranteed religious freedom.
- **C.** The Turks represent another interesting gauge of the period.
  - **1.** Sultan Suleiman the Magnificent (r.1520–1566) was aggressive and successful in the Balkans; there was no telling where he would stop.
  - **2.** Because of Venice's old commercial interests, the Venetians did not want war, and Francis I of France actually signed an anti-Habsburg pact with Suleiman in 1536.
- **D.** Reality kept crashing in on the popes of the Reformation era.
  - **1.** Paul III excommunicated Henry VIII of England with absolutely no effect.
  - **2.** In 1570, Pius V excommunicated Elizabeth I of England, in the process producing a vicious anti-Catholic backlash in England.
  - **3.** Pius V and Sixtus V fulminated over the papacy's superiority over secular rulers, but no one listened. The world of Innocent III was dead and gone.

III. Solid reform came from Trent, to be sure, but from other sources as well.

- **A.** Trent put some finishing touches to the creation of seminaries (the word means "seed beds") as centers for the intellectual, spiritual, and moral formation of priests.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

B. The popes did not initiate the great missions of the age, but they sustained them, created Church hierarchies, and responded to difficult theological questions.

C. Several new religious orders were ardent supporters of reform, loyal to the popes, and agents for the spread of papal prestige and authority.

1. In 1524, St. Cajetan (1480–1547) and Gianpietro Caraffa (later Paul IV), along with two others, formed the Theatine order of priests, explicitly aimed at reforming the Church.

2. The "Apostle of Rome," Philip Neri (1515–1595), founded the Confraternity of the Most Holy Trinity in 1548 to care for pilgrims and the ill.

3. In 1534 in Paris, Ignatius Loyola (1491–1556) formed the Society of Jesus (the Jesuits), and in 1540, Paul III approved the new order.

a. The Jesuits aimed to foster reform in the Church and to conduct missionary work.

b. They were fiercely loyal to the papacy.

c. Because of their careful intellectual formation, they were often teachers, and Protestants feared them as the crack troops of the Counter Reformation.

D. Schools and universities were founded in Rome: Gregory XIII elevated the Jesuit College to university status and he, as well as other popes, approved colleges for English, Hungarian, German, and other students.

E. Gregory XIII introduced the Gregorian calendar in 1582.

F. Paul IV introduced the "Roman Index of Printed Books," a list of forbidden books, which we may regard as a dubious sort of reform.

IV. Reforms in the basic operations of the Curia, especially in the financial realm, took place right across the period.

A. As a reminder of old problems, Sixtus V and his troops waged a brutal battle against bandits in the Papal States, killing perhaps 7,000 of them.

B. Gregory XIII systematized the replacement of legates with nuncios.

C. Sixtus V made important changes in the College of Cardinals.

1. He divided the cardinals among 15 congregations to handle a variety of Church business.

2. This change had the result of reducing the power of the consistory and, thus, of the cardinals as a group.

3. The congregations lasted virtually unchanged until the 20th century.

D. Sixtus also regularized the *ad limina* visits of bishops to Rome, at the time of their installation and periodically after that.

E. Sixtus, finally, reintroduced a modified version of Rome's ancient stational liturgy.

V. One can also see that the spirit of the Renaissance was still alive.

A. Paul III appointed Michelangelo as chief architect for St. Peter's.

B. Julius III, on his election, brought from his bishopric of Palestrina Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina (c. 1525–1594), the chorister and organist.

C. Sixtus V, not content with his reforms, was a great builder and rebuilder.

D. Paul V commissioned Carlo Maderno (1556–1629) to complete the facade of St. Peter's.

VI. We may conclude by taking a closer look at two of the popes of this era.

A. Paul IV (Gianpietro Caraffa) is, on balance, an unattractive figure but a revealing one.

1. He was a person of complete integrity, deep piety, and utter commitment to the reform of the Church.

2. He mistrusted almost everyone: He thought Ignatius Loyola was a heretic, hounded Cardinal Pole as a closet Lutheran, and had the cardinal primate of Spain arrested on suspicion of heresy.

3. He herded Rome's Jews into a ghetto, made them sell their property, and forced them to wear yellow headgear.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

4. He treated Charles V as a heretic and schismatic.

B. Camillo Borghese, Paul V (r. 1605–1621), was born in Rome in 1552 to a family originally from Siena.

1. He was trained in law and held a series of curial offices but distinguished himself on a diplomatic mission to Spain and was made a cardinal in 1596.
2. He was a compromise candidate in 1605.
3. In the great battles of the day, he maintained strict diplomatic neutrality.
4. As we already saw in discussing his awkward relations with Venice, he had anachronistic views on the relations between the Church and the state.
5. Something of Paul V's character can be ascertained from his saints: He canonized Carlo Borromeo (1538–1584) and Santa Francesca Romana (1384–1440), and he beatified Ignatius Loyola, Philip Neri, and Teresa of Avila (1515–1582).
6. He looks enlightened in permitting the vernacular in worship in China but benighted in censuring Copernicus and Galileo.

Recommended Reading:

Evennett, *The Spirit of the Counter Reformation*.

O'Connell, *The Counter Reformation*.

Questions to Consider:

1. Do you see the "Counter" Reformation as a move to combat Protestantism or to put the Catholic Church in order?
2. In what ways does Paul V embody the spirit of the Counter Reformation?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Sixteen
Absolutism, Enlightenment, and Revolution

Scope: The diplomatic situation in Europe in the early 17th century effectively brought the Counter Reformation to a halt on the Continent. The next two centuries were not times of gain or glory for the popes. Indeed, on a few occasions, the papacy's survival appeared to be in question. The popes simply could not negotiate the complex animosities that divided the Catholic states of Europe: Portugal, Spain, France, and Austria. Moreover, the rulers of these states routinely ignored the popes when they did not altogether thwart them. The Papal States were constantly under siege. More than one pope left Rome as a fugitive; several endured shocking indignities. The popes also faced challenges inside the Church. Factious cardinals supported one or another of the Catholic monarchies, their own family interests, and rivalries among the religious orders. Conclaves routinely lasted three or four months. There were irritating and interminable theological challenges in Jansenism, Gallicanism, and Febronianism. This was also an age when some popes wrote erudite books, founded learned academies, expanded the Vatican Library and Museum, and continued the beautification of Rome, while other popes condemned Galileo, rejected the French *philosophes*, and condemned freedoms of the press, conscience, and religion. It seemed that every current of the modern world was running against the papacy.

Outline

I. The 17th and 18th centuries were difficult for the papacy as many features of the modern world came into focus.

- **A.** The modern state system and great-power politics left the papacy less room for influence than ever before.
- **B.** The Enlightenment posed fundamental intellectual challenges.
- **C.** The French Revolution ushered in the secular state as an enduring feature of the modern scene.

II. This lecture looks at the 18 pontificates from the death of Paul V in 1621 to that of Pius VII in 1823.

- **A.** As always, some background data can be interesting and revealing.
  - **1.** Pontificates averaged 11 years, but that of Pius VI (r. 1775–1799) was the longest to date.
  - **2.** Popes in this period tended to be older, on average, than before, with the average age at election being 64.
- **B.** Gregory XV (r. 1621–1623) introduced some electoral reforms that lasted until the early 20th century.
  - **1.** Cardinals were to vote only for one deemed worthy, to prevent symbolic and protest votes.
  - **2.** Gregory banned practices called *adoration* and *accession* without secret ballots.
  - **3.** Among other regulations, he tried to guarantee secrecy of ballots to limit power of faction leaders; demanded only one name per ballot; instructed cardinals to disguise their signatures; called for separate desks; and made binding the tradition (since 1059) that cardinals were not to vote for themselves; finally, he instituted two scrutinies (ballots or votes) per day.
- **C.** The popes of this period were nepotists on a spectacular scale.
- **D.** The popes themselves, as well as their enriched relatives, continued to patronize artists, as their Renaissance predecessors had done.
  - **1.** The list of artists who worked in the city through this period is impressive.
  - **2.** Many of Rome's most familiar monuments date from this period.
  - **3.** New galleries were added to the Vatican Library, and Clement XIV (r. 1769–1774) and Pius VI built the Vatican Museum.
- **E.** One significant institutional change may be mentioned: Gregory XV instituted the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith and assigned 13 cardinals to it.
  - **1.** This was a clear signal that the papacy took missionary activity, in Europe and around the world, very seriously.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. Urban VIII and Alexander VII permitted the use of the vernacular in several areas and continued to give cautious approval to the use of native rites.

III. From the standpoint of international politics, the situation began badly and became worse.

A. The fundamental problem on the international front was how to control France, which first under King Louis XIV (r. 1643–1715), then under Napoleon (r. 1796–1815), aimed at European domination.

B. From the immense complexity of the age, a few examples will illustrate the key issues.

1. In the Thirty Years War, the Catholic Habsburgs fought against the Protestant powers of Germany.
2. Throughout the period, the popes wanted to form a Catholic League against the Turks but could not.
3. The War of the Spanish Succession arose in 1700, when Charles II of Spain died without an heir.
4. In the French Revolution, Pius VI managed to forge a Catholic Alliance against France (which also included Protestant powers), but then Napoleon came to power, crushed Austria, invaded northern Italy, seized Spain, and effectively dissolved the Papal States. Napoleon was finally defeated, but the popes played no serious role in this.

C. The Congress of Vienna (1814–1815) restored the Papal States and the *legations* (Bologna, Ferrara, and Ravenna) but did not give back Avignon and the Comtat Venaissin in southern France.

D. It had become painfully obvious that the papacy had no power to manipulate, let alone to coerce the great states of Europe. Christendom was gone and, with it, the medieval papacy.

IV. These same centuries saw several momentous developments inside the Church itself, which rarely worked to the papacy's advantage.

A. For more than a century, a debate over Jansenism embroiled the papacy with theologians across Europe but especially in France.

1. Cornelius Jansen (1585–1638) studied St. Augustine intensively and came to a series of theological positions contrary to the customary teachings of the Catholic Church and close, in many ways, to the ideal of John Calvin.
2. In 1640, Jansen's *Augustinus* was posthumously published, and it was soon condemned, by the Sorbonne in 1649 and by Innocent X in 1653.
3. In 1693, Pasquier Quesnel (1634–1719) published his Jansenist *Moral Reflections on the Gospel*.
4. The result was a prolonged debate over the papal teaching office inside the Catholic Church. This had not been an issue since conciliarism and fed into 19th-century debates over papal infallibility.

B. The long battle over Gallicanism flared up several times, with complex and ironic results.

1. Louis XIV's attempts to control every aspect of life in his kingdom led him to take more and more extreme measures.
2. In 1682, he issued his Four Gallican Articles, whose core ideas held that royal authority came directly from God; therefore, the king was superior to the popes in all except theological issues.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

3. In the early stages of the French Revolution, the Church was legislated almost out of existence, but then Napoleon cynically decided to recognize Catholicism as "the religion of the vast majority of citizens of France."
4. The European powers defeated Napoleon, and the French clergy appealed to the papacy over his state-run Church.
5. Ironically, a powerless papacy used papal power to weaken a powerful Gallicanism that had been rendered all but powerless by Napoleon.

C. The Enlightenment struck at the heart of Christianity of all kinds, but especially at the heart of Catholicism.

D. Two movements with roots in the Enlightenment posed a particular challenge for the Catholic Church.

1. Johann von Hontheim (1701–1790), an auxiliary bishop of Trier, wrote in 1763 *On the State of the Church* under the pseudonym Febronius.
   a. Febronianism sought to win back Protestants by curbing the abuses in Catholic piety and curbing the power of the papacy.
   b. The teaching held that neither such abuses nor this power could be found in scripture or historical records; thus, they should be eliminated.
2. Josephism is the name given to the religious reforms of Joseph II of Austria (r. 1765–1790).
   a. Absolutist, "enlightened," and perhaps Febronian, Joseph wished to curb the power of the papacy while reforming the Church.
   b. Joseph issued more than 6,000 edicts on religious matters. He closed monasteries, regulated seminaries, reorganized parishes, and forbade various devotions. He basically believed that the pope was in charge of doctrine, while he was in charge of everything else.

E. The papacy's inability to keep order in its own house can be seen in the disgraceful dissolution of the Jesuits in 1773 by Clement XIV.

V. Let's take a closer look at two popes from this period, Urban VIII and Benedict XIV.

A. Maffeo Barberini (Urban VIII), born in 1568, came from a rich Florentine merchant family.

1. He studied with the Jesuits in Florence, then continued his studies in Rome and became doctor of laws in Pisa.
2. Aided by an uncle, he began a career in the Curia that took off when he served extraordinarily well as an envoy to France.
3. Paul V made him a cardinal in 1606, and he then held several top posts.
4. In a conclave that lasted almost a month in the sweltering Roman heat, he was elected with 50 of 55 votes.

B. As Pope Urban VIII (r. 1623–1644), Barberini was one of the great nepotists of his time, making a brother and two nephews cardinals and enriching them vastly.

1. Urban's promotion of his relatives led him to disastrous wars in the Papal States.
2. Urban emptied the treasury, and by the end of his pontificate, 85 percent of the papal income was going to service the debt.
3. A disastrous war with Parma led him to strip Roman buildings of their valuables, prompting one contemporary to say, "What the barbarians did not do, the Barberini did."

C. Urban had a hard time with the Thirty Years War; he wanted to behave as a neutral but was openly sympathetic to France.

D. Urban was highly cultivated and a Latin poet of some ability.

E. Today, Urban is most likely remembered as the pope who censured Galileo.

1. In 1616, Galileo tried to prove Copernicus's heliocentric theory by mathematical demonstration, resulting in a condemnation of Copernicus.
2. Urban had been friends with Galileo and perhaps even sympathetic to his ideas, but when Galileo was denounced to the Inquisition, Urban had to act. In 1633, Urban condemned Galileo's writings, committed him to imprisonment (commuted, in effect, to house arrest), and forbade him to teach or write.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

F. Prospero Lorenzo Lambertini (Benedict XIV) was born in Bologna of a good but poor family in 1675.

1. He studied both theology and law in Rome.

2. He rose on talent through the Curia, and he wrote what became the classic treatise on the canonization of saints.

3. After some years of effective pastoral work, he was made a cardinal in 1728.

4. He was elected as a compromise candidate after a six-month conclave, the longest of modern times.

5. As pope, Benedict XIV (r. 1740-1758) had the common touch, walking about Rome, being kind to ordinary people, and talking in the local slang.

G. He promoted the work of scholars and artists.

H. He also pursued Church reforms.

I. He managed the Papal States effectively and reduced taxes.

J. Benedict was a man of utter integrity to whom Voltaire dedicated a book.

Recommended Reading:

Chadwick, *The Popes and European Revolution*.

Gross, *Rome in the Age of Enlightenment*.

Questions to Consider:

1. What powers and resources did the popes lack in responding to the challenges of the 17th and 18th centuries?

2. What can be learned from the Galileo affair?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Seventeen
Pius IX—Prisoner of the Vatican

Scope: Pius IX reigned longer as pope than anyone else, almost 32 years. His pontificate coincided with tremendous military, political, ideological, and cultural turmoil. Pius was involved in many of the great events of his time and had a profound effect on the Church itself. As a young man, he was seen as a liberal, but on becoming pope, he almost immediately confronted the nationalism and secularism of the newly emerging Italian state. In 1860, he effectively lost the Papal States and, in 1870, Rome itself. Thereafter, Pius never left the Vatican, declaring himself to be a prisoner. In 1864, in his *Syllabus of Errors*, Pius countered the "progress, liberalism, and modern civilization" that he saw as corrupting traditional ways. It would take the Church more than a century to come to grips with Modernism. In 1870, Pius called the First Vatican Council. The decree of this council that spelled out papal infallibility is its most famous, but its declaration that the pope was "universal ordinary" was probably more important. This decree meant that the authority of the pope superseded that of any bishop, any *ordinary*, in his diocese. Pius was, and is, a controversial figure. But he was much loved in his own time and highly respected by those who were his opponents.

Outline

I. The pontificate of Pius IX (r. 1846–1878) was the longest in papal history and one of the most eventful.

- **A.** Pius lost the Papal States to a newly unified Italy, ending 11 centuries of temporal rule.
- **B.** Pius set his stance against the modern world with the *Syllabus of Errors*.
- **C.** He defined fundamental dogmas: the Immaculate Conception and papal infallibility.
- **D.** In some respects, Pius created the modern papacy and the modern Church.

II. Before coming to Pius IX, we must quickly review some key developments from the reigns of his immediate predecessors.

- **A.** Pius VII lived until 1823 and was followed by Leo XII (r. 1823–1829), Pius VIII (r. 1829–1830), and Gregory XVI (r. 1831–1846).
- **B.** Leo and Gregory were both elected by the Zelanti among the cardinals, the extremely conservative zealots who wanted no part of liberal politics or modern thought.
- **C.** The Zelanti hated Pius VII's secretary of state, Ercole Consalvi.
  - **1.** The Zelanti supported absolute monarchs at all costs, so that Gregory XVI denounced the Catholic Poles when they rose up against the oppressive Russian regime.
  - **2.** Emerging Italian nationalism terrified the Zelanti.
- **D.** In the Papal States, Consalvi had tried to institute reforms, but he could not satisfy either the reactionaries or the progressives.
- **E.** In a Christmas homily in 1797, before his election, Pius VII had said that the Catholic Church did not have to oppose democracy. He was seen as dangerously liberal in some quarters, but the "restoration" of 1815 was fundamentally monarchist and conservative.
  - **1.** When liberal uprisings emerged in 1830, the papacy denounced them, treating democracy as a modern heresy.
  - **2.** Leo XII issued decrees against indifferentism, toleration, and the Freemasons.
  - **3.** Gregory XVI, while still a cardinal, had published a book, *The Triumph of the Holy See*, which insisted on papal infallibility and temporal rule.
- **F.** Pius IX inherited a long list of difficult problems.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

III. Giovanni Maria Mastai-Feretti (Pius IX) was born at Senigallia in 1792. His family was not distinguished, his education was solid but unimpressive, and he was sickly.

A. He had a long and distinguished pastoral career and was widely seen as rather liberal because he was sympathetic to administrative reforms in the Papal States and attracted to the cause of Italian unification.

B. He was elected in a two-day conclave, much to everyone's surprise, over the arch-Zelanto Cardinal Lambruschini, Gregory XVI's secretary of state.

IV. Pius's first acts as pope won him wide acclaim in Italy, across Europe, and even in the United States.

A. Right away, he conferred amnesty for some 2,000 political prisoners in the Papal States.

B. He released the Jews from the obligation of hearing a weekly Christian sermon.

C. Within the Papal States, he introduced a Consultative Assembly drawn by election from the whole Papal State and permitting lay membership.

V. In 1848, Europe plunged into revolution, and Pius's pontificate was knocked off course.

A. Milan and Venice rebelled against Austrian rule, and Pius was placed in a predicament.

1. He wanted the Austrians out of Italy, but he needed to secure the Papal States.

2. The papacy had always been strictly neutral in international conflicts, and the emerging contest pitted Catholics against Catholics.

B. Many in Italy felt that Pius had betrayed the Italian cause, but he was never a revolutionary and certainly not a republican.

1. In Rome, angry mobs murdered key officials and shut Pius up in the Quirinal Palace.

2. In the dead of night, Pius was spirited away to Gaeta, south of Naples. This was the last papal flight from Rome.

C. In Pius's absence, a republican regime was proclaimed in Rome. The pope denounced it and called on the Catholic powers to help him. France responded, largely to forestall Austrian interests.

1. With a French garrison nearby, Pius returned in 1850.

2. Pius was now absolutely convinced that the Papal States were essential to the papacy's survival.

D. Political developments in Italy—the *Risorgimento*—continued apace, with movements in Naples led by Giuseppe Garibaldi (1807–1882) and in Piedmont by Camillo Cavour (1810–1861) and with everyone following the writings and ideals of Giuseppe Mazzini (1805–1872).

E. In the end, the new Italian state, with Rome as its capital, confined Pius to the Vatican, allowing him also the Lateran and the summer palace at Castel Gandolfo.

1. The Law of Guarantees accorded Pius all the customary immunities of a sovereign, a personal guard, a post office and telegraph, and a 3.2 million–lire subsidy per annum in compensation for the Papal States.

2. Pius rejected the law and never again set foot outside the Vatican.

VI. It is easy to think that Pius was consumed by Roman and Italian politics from 1850 until his death, but in fact, he accomplished a great deal of fundamental religious work.

A. In 1854, he defined the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception of Mary and made December 8 a universal feast in the Church.

B. In 1864, Pius issued *Quanta Cura*, calling for a return to the traditional theology of St. Thomas Aquinas, and he attached to it the *Syllabus of Errors*.

1. The latter document spelled out 80 "errors" that had already appeared in earlier documents of Pius himself and other popes.

2. Among such errors, we can mention pantheism, naturalism, rationalism, indifferentism, latitudinarianism, socialism, communism, Bible societies, and so on.

C. In 1867, Pius announced plans for a general council. Significant preparatory work was undertaken, leading to a plan to issue two constitutions, one on the faith and one on the Church.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1. Vatican I opened on December 8, 1869, in the presence of more than 700 bishops—the largest council in the Church's history.
2. After a slow start, the council adopted *Dei Filius* in April 1870, a decree on faith that essentially affirmed the teachings expressed in the *Syllabus* of 1864.
3. The debate on the subject of papal infallibility began in May.
4. Debate was closed on July 4, and on July 13, the definition on infallibility received 451 *placets* ("yes" votes), 88 *non-placets* ("no" votes), and 62 *placets iuxta modum* ("yes" votes but with reservations).
5. The constitution *Pastor Aeternus* on July 18 received 533 *placets* and 2 *non-placets*. So as not to have to vote, 66 bishops departed.
6. The key decree reads as follows:

   > The Roman pontiff, when he speaks *ex cathedra*, that is, when exercising the office of pastor and teacher of all Christians, he defines…a doctrine concerning faith and morals to be held by the whole Church, through the divine assistance promised to him in St. Peter, is possessed of that infallibility with which the divine redeemer wished his Church to be endowed…and therefore the definitions of the Roman pontiff are irreformable of themselves, and not from the consent of the Church.

7. *Pastor Aeternus* also made the pope, in effect, "universal ordinary": It is as if the pope is, at once, the ordinary bishop everywhere. This has had immense practical significance.

VII. Pius IX left his successors a difficult heritage in politics, theology, and ecclesiology, yet he also left them a vastly more popular papacy.

Recommended Reading:

Butler, *The Vatican Council*.

Hales, *Pio Nono*.

Questions to Consider:

1. How is it possible to understand the papacy's intense mistrust of modernity in all its forms?
2. The great decrees of Vatican I have been called both traditional and radical. How would you interpret them?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Eighteen
The Challenge of Modernism

Scope: After the long pontificate of Pius IX, it was clear that the pope's place in the world and in the Church would be forever different. But how? One thread of the story runs from the "prisoner in the Vatican" to the Lateran Treaty of 1929 that turned the Papal States into Vatican City and put the pope's political position in the modern world on new footings. A second thread stems from the implications of the pope as universal ordinary; Rome could no longer dominate the world, but it could certainly dominate the Church. A third thread traces the papacy's coming-to-grips with modern political ideologies. In short, the popes learned how to accommodate democracy. And the popes, especially Leo XIII, learned how to apply traditional Catholic social teaching to such modern phenomena as industrialization, urban poverty, and the labor movement.

But if the popes learned how to accommodate some aspects of modern civilization, they, especially Pius X, also condemned *Modernism*. This might mean the whole secularist bent of the modern world, or it might mean new science and scholarship.

Outline

I. The pontificates that ran from the death of Pius IX in 1878 to that of Pius XI in 1939 witnessed unprecedented challenges for the papacy.

- **A.** One world war and the outbreak of a second, anticlerical regimes, Russian communism, and European fascism posed immense challenges for a papacy that could not understand or reconcile itself to the modern state.
- **B.** New social movements prompted skepticism, cautious approval, and outright condemnation.
- **C.** The movements called *Modernism* posed distinctive intellectual and theological challenges.

II. Each of the four popes of this era—Leo XIII (r. 1878–1903), Pius X (r. 1903–1914), Benedict XV (r. 1914–1922), and Pius XI (r. 1922– 1939)—was a study in contrasts and contradictions.

- **A.** Goiacchino Pecci (Leo XIII), born in 1810, was brilliant and learned but had been in the ecclesiastical wilderness since he had performed poorly as nuncio to Belgium in 1843.
  - **1.** When Pius IX's closest associates could not prevail in the conclave, Pecci was elected, despite being 68 and frail. To everyone's surprise, he reigned for 25 years.
  - **2.** Leo issued several of the most important encyclicals of modern times.
- **B.** On Leo's death, the conservatives feared any compromises with progress and decided that someone more focused on the Church and less interested in international affairs was needed.
  - **1.** The choice fell on Giuseppe del Sarto (Pius X), the patriarch of Venice. His was the first election in which an American participated—Cardinal James Gibbons.
  - **2.** Under Pius X, the Modernist crisis came fully into view.
  - **3.** A good and decent man and an ardent Church reformer, Pius X was the first pope made a saint (in 1950) since Pius V was canonized in 1712.
- **C.** Giacomo della Chiesa (Benedict XV) came from a noble Genoese family and had a distinguished career in the Church.
  - **1.** The pontificate of Benedict XV was dominated by World War I.
  - **2.** He was more conciliatory than his predecessor and might have been a great pope had he lived longer or faced different circumstances.
- **D.** Achille Ratti (Pius XI) was an oddity—the first scholar-pope since Benedict XIV. He had been prefect of the Ambrosian Library in Milan, then of the Vatican.
  - **1.** Benedict XV made him nuncio to Poland in 1919, where he was besieged by the Bolsheviks in 1920 and formed an intense hatred for communism.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. After his courageous stand in Warsaw, he was made archbishop of Milan and cardinal in 1921.
3. On Benedict's death, Ratti emerged as a compromise candidate and was elected on the 14th ballot.
4. In a long and eventful pontificate, he had to deal with the wreck of European civilization represented by the dictatorships of the right and left.

III. The international scene during this time was dominated by an ancient problem—temporal rule—and a dizzying array of modern ones—political transformations.

A. Like his predecessor, Leo XIII was a "prisoner of the Vatican."

B. Pius X was contemptuous of the Italian government and wrote repeatedly to defend the legitimacy and necessity of temporal rule.

C. Benedict XV finally saw the need to deal with the changed circumstances.

1. Pius XI's secretary of state, Pietro Gasparri, began negotiations with Mussolini's government in 1926, resulting, in 1929, in the Lateran Accords.
2. The pope was no longer a "prisoner," and the question of temporal rule was resolved.

D. Leo XIII set the tone in dealing with modern states.

1. Like his successors, he utterly abhorred socialism in all its forms, calling it a "murderous pestilence."
2. He was skeptical of democracy, believing it opposed to the natural order of things.
3. Still, Leo was a realist and believed it possible for the Church to work with governments that were not overtly anti-Catholic or anticlerical.

E. Papal relations with France provide one good example of the difficulties faced by the papacy. France was "the oldest daughter of the Church," and its secular, anticlerical posture was a particular sadness for the papacy.

1. Pius X was greeted with a severely anticlerical government in France. In 1904 and 1905, the government passed laws abrogating the Concordat of 1801 and effectively separating Church and state in France.
2. World War I was vexing for relations between the Vatican and France.
   a. Benedict XV insisted on a negotiated settlement and vigorously opposed demands for reparations and compensation.
   b. The pope denounced the brutality and destruction of the war but remained steadfastly neutral, as his predecessors had always tried to do.
   c. France and England felt that Benedict was secretly prejudiced in favor of the Germans, which was unfair and untrue.
   d. Benedict tried to keep Italy out of the war, and when the Italians entered on the side of the Allies (the United States, England, France), the Italian government demanded that no one agree to negotiate with the Vatican for fear that the pope would extract some concessions on Rome or the Papal States.
3. Benedict canonized Joan of Arc in 1920 as a concession to France, and diplomatic relations were restored in 1921. Relations with France were never easy but improved after 1921.

F. Germany represents a different kind of case.

1. Chancellor Bismarck had passed a series of sharply anti-Catholic laws in the time of Pius IX.
2. Leo XIII worked skillfully to get these relaxed and to convince Bismarck that it was in his interests to stop alienating his Catholic population.
3. The situation was reasonably peaceful until the outbreak of World War I, when the pope was accused of favoring Germany.
   a. In fact, Benedict did think that he might get some German help in regaining Rome, but this was never on Germany's agenda.
   b. The Germans liked Benedict's call for no reparations and the idea of a negotiated peace.
   c. Benedict harangued the Peace of Versailles as unjust and vindictive, and he was prescient in seeing that Germany would harbor deep resentment.
4. During the 1920s and 1930s, Pius XI negotiated 18 concordats with states all over Europe.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

a. Among these, the most controversial in later times was the one he concluded with Nazi Germany in 1933.

b. Concordats had, for many years, been the Vatican's way of dealing with secular states in an attempt to regulate such matters as episcopal appointments, communication with Rome, education, marriage laws, and so on.

c. The popes were trying to learn to deal with modern secular states but did not understand democratic politics.

d. Pius XI was also faced with the spectacle of communism in Russia and Spain, where 7,000 priests had been murdered. Unfortunately, he saw the Nazis as a bulwark against communism.

e. But in 1937, Pius asked Cardinal Faluhaber of Munich to draft a letter, and in a remarkable smuggling operation, copies of the letter went to Germany and were read from pulpits on Palm Sunday in 1937: *Mit brennender Sorge* (*With Burning Concern*).

f. This letter was an uncompromising denunciation of Nazism, Nazi racial theories, and anti-Semitism. It infuriated Hitler's government.

G. When Pius died in 1939, the world was on the eve of war and Europe was facing evils unprecedented in human history.

IV. For now, however, we must turn to the other activities, challenges, and accomplishments of the four popes we have in view.

A. Leo XIII is a study in contrasts.

1. Many sincere Catholic reformers all over Europe had been calling for decades for the Church to take up the cause of the poor and oppressed.

2. Leo was impressed by pilgrimages of working people to Rome in the 1880s.

3. In 1891, he issued *Rerum Novarum*, one of the Church's greatest encyclicals, which attacked both godless socialism and unfettered capitalism.

4. Yet he was antidemocratic and paternalistic and refused to countenance Catholic social movements that were in any way independent of the Church.

5. Still, in 1879, he called for a return to Thomas Aquinas as the sure guide to truth in Catholic theology. Neo-Thomism served for decades as a brake on advances in Catholic scholarship.

B. Pius X presented no contrasts at all.

1. For decades, the Church had been battling Modernism, an almost indefinable catch-all term for modern social and political thought, science, social values, and religion.

2. Catholic Modernists tried to answer the charge that the Church could not be found in the Gospels and that only simple Christianity was authentic.

3. Matters came to a head in the writings of Alfred Loisy (1857–1940), a brilliant and prolific French scholar who argued for historical change and contingency.

a. Several of his writings were condemned, and in 1908, he was excommunicated after he vigorously rejected two papal bulls.

b. Under Pius's minions, a witch hunt was instituted that shocked scholars everywhere and many Catholics.

V. Finally, we may look at developments within the Church itself in these fateful years.

A. Interestingly, the greatest reformer of the age was Pius X.

1. He was the first "people's pope."

2. He promoted frequent communion and moved the age for First Communion down to 7 from 12–14.

3. He cut 37 Vatican departments down to 19.

4. He appointed Cardinal Gasparri to carry out a comprehensive codification of canon law. This was not completed until 1917 but was a remarkable achievement.

5. He restored traditional church music, including plainchant in place of the baroque accretions of the last two centuries.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

B. Relations with other churches continued to be problematical.

1. The popes continued to teach that the Catholic Church was the one true church, that all others were heretical, and that no negotiation was possible.

2. Fledgling ecumenism was dealt a grievous blow by *Mortalium annos* in 1928, when Pius XI condemned "pan-Christians consumed by zeal to unite churches."

C. Relations with the Uniate churches constituted a special problem.

1. Uniate churches were Eastern Christian communities that were in full communion with Rome but retained all their rites, customs, and languages. They are found throughout Eastern Europe and in the Middle East.

2. Leo XIII prudently gave up efforts to Latinize the Uniates.

3. Pius XI, on the other hand, returned to a policy of Latinization, which rendered awkward Rome's relations with the Uniates.

D. Pius XI also legislated on missions in an enlightened way and over strenuous objections.

VI. In some ways, the Church was freer than ever, but in other ways, it was under siege.

Recommended Reading:

Jemolo, *Church and State in Italy*.

Vidler, *The Modernist Movement*.

Questions to Consider:

1. Why do you think that Leo XIII's social teachings did not lead to a broader opening to the modern world?

2. Leo XIII and Pius XI were formidable scholars, yet both opposed intellectual Modernism. Why?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Nineteen
The Troubled Pontificate of Pius XII

Scope: There is a saying: "He who enters the conclave as pope comes out as a cardinal." It is a solemn warning against predictions and frontrunners. And yet, on a few occasions, the choice of the cardinals has been pretty clear. Such a case was the election of Pius XII in 1939. Eugenio Pacelli had entered papal service in 1901, worked on the revision of the canon law, served as papal nuncio to Bavaria and the German Republic, and was appointed secretary of state in 1930. In that office, he traveled much of the world. On his election, then, he was a man of unmatched experience. He longed for peace and lived through war after war, some hot, some cold. We will consider his diplomacy. But of course, we must also consider the controversy that has arisen in recent times concerning his actions, or his failure to act, in the face of Hitler's attempt to destroy European Jewry. Pius also issued important encyclicals on theological and intellectual issues, Church dogmas, and basic Catholic practices. Brilliant but austere, a hero to some and a villain to others, Pius is a fascinating figure.

Outline

I. There is an old saying that whoever enters a conclave as pope leaves as a cardinal. The point is that there are rarely favorites, much less predictable ones.

- **A.** Be that as it may, Pius XI wanted Eugenio Pacelli to succeed him.
  - **1.** Pius had dominated the cardinals, very few of whom knew each other, but he sent Pacelli all over the world, so everyone knew him.
  - **2.** Pacelli was elected on the second ballot in 1939 but asked for a third ballot as confirmation.
- **B.** Eugenio Pacelli was born in Rome in 1876 to a family that had long performed with distinction in the papal service.
  - **1.** After a superb education, Pacelli was assigned to the Secretariat of State at 25 and worked with Gasparri on the Code of Canon Law.
  - **2.** Pacelli served as nuncio in Germany from 1917 to 1920 and, on Gasparri's death, was made secretary of state in 1929.
  - **3.** For the time, Pacelli was exceptionally well traveled.
- **C.** Few men have ever been so well prepared for the papal office.

II. World War II was the great "event" of Pius XII's pontificate (r. 1939– 1958), but it has assumed greater significance after the fact.

- **A.** As secretary of state, Pius had seen the storm clouds gathering, and it is almost certain that he had a hand in editing *Mit brennender Sorge* in 1937.
- **B.** Pius was elected March 12, 1939, and on March 15, the Germans entered Prague. On April 7, Good Friday, Italy took Albania.
- **C.** August saw the Hitler-Stalin Pact and the virtual certainty that Poland would be attacked and divided.
  - **1.** October 20, 1939, Pius issued his first encyclical, *Summi Pontificatus*, which condemned the invasion of Poland and the idealization of the state by totalitarian regimes but did so in abstract, generalized language.
  - **2.** Through the end of 1939 and into 1940, Pius tried to launch peace negotiations and to serve as mediator; he was acting in some ways as Benedict XV had done in World War I.
- **D.** The situation began to change in 1942.
  - **1.** The Allies began winning important victories in North Africa.
  - **2.** In his Christmas allocution of 1942, Pius spoke of his opposition to totalitarian regimes and evoked loud German protests and dark threats of personal attacks on himself.
- **E.** As long as Italy was independent, Pius was in no danger because of the Lateran Accords, but Mussolini fell in mid-1943 and the Germans took over Rome.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

F. The Vatican maintained strong diplomatic connections throughout the war, but it is an open question how timely and accurate their information was.

1. The Vatican opened relations with Japan in 1942, much to the distress of the United States, but the Japanese had conquered lands holding 18 million Catholics.

2. Relations with German bishops were fairly close, but some of them were clearly Nazi sympathizers (and there were ardent Fascists among the Italian bishops).

3. By 1944, when defeat of the Nazis became fairly certain, Pius again called for a "just" peace, in part because he feared Russian communist domination of Europe.

III. Pius became a figure of controversy well after the war.

A. There were a few criticisms of his dealings with Franco's Spain and with the Vichy regime in France and its anti-Semitic legislation.

B. On the whole, Pius was seen as a hero, a resolute opponent of tyranny, a tireless worker on behalf of the oppressed, not least the Jews.

1. Pius's Vatican processed 11.25 million missing person investigations.

2. Stories poured in about the Jews whom Pius had ordered to be helped.

C. The pope's reputation changed with the publication in 1963 of Rolf Hochhuth's play *The Deputy*, a cunning and brutal condemnation of Pius.

1. The play alleged that Pius's silence made it possible for influential Germans to accommodate and profit from Hitler's regime; that Hitler feared the pope and if Pius had not been so concerned about his business interests, he could have moved the dictator; that Pius saw Hitler as unifying Europe against the godless Soviets; and that the roundup of Rome's Jews took place under Pius's windows and he did nothing.

2. Virtually all of Hochhuth's charges were easily rebutted by dispassionate scholars, but fewer and fewer people were dispassionate.

3. In hope of putting the matter right, the Vatican set a team of mainly Jesuit priests to combing the archives and publishing all relevant materials. Eleven volumes appeared between 1965 and 1981.

4. By the 1990s, it became possible for utterly contemptible charges to be lodged against Pius in publications intended for wide audiences.

D. What had brought about these charges? The need for a scapegoat for this paroxysm of violence and destruction as well as considerable virulent anti-Catholicism.

IV. What is to be made of the charges against Pius?

A. He has long been accused of "silence." This charge has *some* merit.

1. Pius spent his adult life as a diplomat and was accustomed to the calculated discretion of diplomacy.

2. He wrote in tortured circumlocutions that, he firmly believed, could be penetrated by the knowing. But were his words too complex at a time when clarity might have been called for?

3. Pius seems quite genuinely to have believed that strong words would have brought barbaric reprisals against the very people he was trying to help.

4. Pius did have some resources at his disposal, such as Vatican radio, that permitted blunt assessments of the current situation, and no one could have doubted Pius's approval.

B. Pius had long lived in Germany and he admired German culture, particularly music.

1. This has led to the ridiculous charge that he was sympathetic to the Nazis.

2. Pius was no more pro-German than Benedict XV had been.

3. There is not a scrap of credible evidence that Pius was anti-Semitic.

C. With some justice, it has been argued that Pius saw communism as a graver threat to Christianity than Nazism.

D. Pius does not seem to have feared for his own safety. The safety of Rome and of the Vatican may have been elements in his thinking, but they certainly were not dominant issues.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

E. Pius did feel a deep obligation to protect the interests of Catholics in Europe; he was the pope.

F. Our age likes grand, theatrical gestures, but Pius's age did not, and no one trained as he was could possibly have taken any actions similar to those that Pius has been criticized for not taking.

V. Pius's encyclicals, allocutions, and radio addresses fill up volumes of material.

A. In 1943, he issued *Divino Afflante Spiritu*, which opened Catholic biblical scholarship to all the modern scholarly tools available.

B. Also in 1943, he issued *Mystici Corporis*, which articulated a more spiritual than juristic ecclesiology by spelling out ideas about the Mystical Body of Christ (although he did not budge on the hierarchical governance of the Church).

C. In 1947, he issued *Mediator Dei*, which called for a renewed appreciation for the liturgy and a more vigorous and effective lay participation in worship.

D. In 1949 and 1950, Pius attacked communism and declared all who joined or collaborated with communist parties or who voted for communists to be excommunicated.

E. In 1950, Pius seemed to backtrack on his great encyclicals of the 1940s.

1. In *Munificentissimus Deus*, he declared on his own authority the doctrine of the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin, which distressed members of many Christian bodies.

2. After some early nods in the direction of ecumenism and the World Council of Churches, Pius condemned "false eirenicism."

3. In *Humani Generis*, Pius condemned the "New Theologians" and called for the "perennial philosophy" of St. Thomas Aquinas.

4. Perhaps as a shot across the bow of the New Theologians, Pius canonized the arch anti-Modernist Pius X.

VI. Pius XII was an austere, dignified, deeply spiritual, profoundly reflective man. He was the first pope really known, moved, and admired by many people.

Recommended Reading:

Halecki, *Eugenio Pacelli*.

Sánchez, *Pius XII and the Holocaust*.

Questions to Consider:

1. What impressions do you have of Pius XII as a pope in general terms, apart from his controversial role in World War II?

2. Why do you think Pius enjoyed such a good reputation for so many years, only to be vilified (by some) in more recent times?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twenty
The Age of Vatican II

Scope: When the long pontificate of Pius XII came to an end, what would happen was anybody's guess, and few would have imagined the eventual outcome. John XXIII was elected, and instead of being an elderly placeholder, he decided to summon the Second Vatican Council. John opened the council in 1962 but died after its first session. First, then, we will look at the life and papal career of John XXIII. Second, we will examine the reasons why he called the council and what hopes he had for it. The council continued its work under Paul VI. Thus, our third task will be to look at the actual work of the council. We will conclude with some reflections on why the council has continued to be a controversial topic for 40 years.

Outline

I. On any reckoning, the Second Vatican Council (1962–1965) was the most important event in the modern history of the Catholic Church. But we must begin with some discussion of John XXIII (r. 1958-1963), the pope who called the council.

- **A.** We must try to understand what the council was, why it happened, and what it accomplished.
- **B.** The council has also been controversial in the decades since it closed. We must make some effort to understand and contextualize this controversy.

II. Angelo Giuseppe Roncalli was born to a family of peasant farmers near Bergamo, a middle child among 13, in 1881.

- **A.** He taught Church history in the local seminary and began scholarly work on a study of Carlo Borromeo, the great pastoral bishop of Milan.
- **B.** While doing research on Borromeo, Roncalli met Achille Ratti in the Ambrosian Library. Ratti (Pius XI) set him on his diplomatic career.
- **C.** In the conclave of 1958, there was no obvious choice, as there had been in 1939.
  - **1.** Roncalli was elected on the 12th ballot and took the name John, his father's name.
  - **2.** It has long been said that Roncalli was elected because he was old (almost 77) and likely to be transitional and inactive.
  - **3.** This is not quite fair: He was an experienced diplomat, a gifted linguist, a fine scholar, and a superb bishop.

III. John XXIII wanted to hold a regular diocesan synod for Rome, revise canon law, and hold an ecumenical council. He accomplished the first, began the second, and shocked everyone by following through on the third.

- **A.** John spoke of a need for a "New Pentecost," for *aggiornamento* (bringing things up-to-date).
- **B.** Conservatives in the Curia feared that John was stirring up a hornets' nest, but he stressed that he did not want change so much as teaching and pastoral concern.
- **C.** Over serious objections and not a little bureaucratic blocking, John appointed 10 preparatory commissions in June 1960 to prepare *schemata* (documents spelling out issues for discussion): 69 schemata were prepared.
- **D.** When the council opened on October 11, 1962, the delegates immediately rebelled.
  - **1.** The delegates whittled down the list of schemata to 16.
  - **2.** There has been some controversy over John's reaction to the delegates' assertion of authority.
- **E.** It is important to realize what sort of a meeting this was.
  - **1.** The council opened with more than 2,200 bishops, and more than 2,800 attended at one time or another.
  - **2.** The council was seen as John's project, but he died of stomach cancer in June of 1963 before the second session met. Paul VI courageously fought the conservatives to keep the council going and fought the liberals to keep it from going too far.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

F. The basic thrust of the council took its strength from the ideas and intentions of John XXIII, but the council fathers made important contributions, too.

1. John's encyclicals indicated the direction he wished to go.

a. *Ad cathedram Petri* (1959) called for a spirit of love and consideration in dealings with "separated brethren."

b. *Mater et Magistra* (1961) updated the social teaching of Leo XIII and Pius XI, condemning greed and acquisitiveness and calling on rich nations to help poor ones.

c. *Pacem in terris* (1963) stressed the basic human right to freely profess religious faith, welcomed the progress in workers' rights, condemned Marxist ideology but noted social advances in even communist states, abandoned Cold War rhetoric, called for an end to colonialism and national self-determination, and called the nuclear arms race "irrational."

2. John also wished earnestly for Christian unity and created a Secretariat for Christian Unity in 1960. In 1961, he sent envoys to the World Council of Churches meeting in Delhi.

IV. The council accomplished its work in four great sessions.

A. The sessions tended to last two to three months: I—October 11–December 8, 1962; II—September 29–December 4, 1963; III—September 14–November 21, 1964; IV—September 14–December 8, 1965.

B. The popes did not preside and did not attend many of the sessions.

1. Paul VI intervened on two occasions to thwart the efforts of Cardinal Ottaviani (the leader of the conservative forces) to block progress.

2. At the end of the council, Paul formally confirmed and promulgated the documents.

C. The council issued 16 documents that differ in terms of specificity and intended audience. Apostolic constitutions, for example, are addressed to the Church as a whole, whereas decrees might be addressed to professed religious (that is, people who belong to religious orders), and declarations might spell out particular Church positions, say, with respect to non-Christians.

V. We may note a few highlights of the constitutions.

A. *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, rethought liturgy as again the work of the people of God.

1. Worship demanded active participation, not silent observation.

2. Vernacular languages were permitted and, eventually, communion in the hand and the granting of the cup to laity.

B. *Lumen Gentium*, Constitution on the Church, substituted the people of God for the strictly hierarchical, juridical ecclesiology dominant since the defeat of conciliarism.

1. The constitution tried to deal with collegiality—the relationship of bishops to one another and to the pope—but could not find a satisfactory formula.

2. The constitution said that the Church of Christ "subsisted" in the Roman Catholic Church, instead of saying that the Church of Christ *was* the Roman Catholic Church.

C. *Gaudium et Spes*, Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World, embraced the world, even the modern world, without succumbing to Modernism.

1. In this as in other documents, there was a quest for the "signs of the times," meaning that things happen in historical time with meaning and significance that are grounded in specific circumstances.

2. The Church must be concerned with issues of peace and justice.

3. Faith pertains to humanity living in the world and not only to the bond between believers and the transcendent.

VI. A balance sheet cannot really be drawn up because the battle over Vatican II rages on.

A. Most people noticed changes in the Mass.

B. Most people were aware that there had been a number of changes, but the Church did a poor job of post-conciliar catechesis, that is, teaching people what had been changed.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

C. Paul VI bravely brought the council to a conclusion but then, after about 1970, stopped directing the post-conciliar Church along any distinct path.

Recommended Reading:

Flannery, *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post-Conciliar Documents*.

Hebblethwaite, *John XXIII*.

Questions to Consider:

1. John XXIII is often portrayed as simple and pious. Do you see signs of greater complexity in him?
2. Granted that Vatican II accomplished a great deal, but can you think of topics or problems that were not addressed by the council?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twenty-One
The Transitional Pontificate of Paul VI

Scope: Shy and bookish, kind but aloof, Paul VI was described by John XXIII, whose close confidante he was, as "a little like Hamlet." Paul held numerous positions in the Curia and served from 1954 to 1963 as archbishop of Milan. When he was elected pope, he was well prepared. His legacy is a tangled one. Progressives admire the fact that he carried on with the work of Vatican II and faithfully implemented its major decisions; that he opened channels of ecumenical dialogue, especially with the Anglicans and Orthodox; that he reorganized the Curia and papal finances; and that he promulgated a new sacramentary. But they have never forgiven him for *Humanae Vitae*, the encyclical that upheld the traditional prohibition of contraception. Conservatives mostly disliked him. Some held him to have "Protestantized" the Church; others felt that he lacked discipline and resolve as Catholics all over the world tried in their own ways to implement Vatican II.

Outline

I. Giovanni Battista Montini was born near Brescia, Italy, in 1897, the son of a Partito Popolare politician.

- **A.** He was educated locally and in Rome and entered the Secretariat of State in 1922.
  - **1.** In 1952, he was one of the two deputy secretaries of state (Pius XII served as his own secretary of state) and, apparently, along with his colleague Tardini, declined a cardinalate.
  - **2.** It is more likely that he was seen as too progressive by the increasingly cautious Pius XII.
  - **3.** In 1954, Pius named him archbishop of Milan but denied him the customary red hat.
- **B.** The "Workers' Archbishop" tried hard to do a good job in a large and difficult diocese.
- **C.** Montini was widely traveled, something unheard of before Pius XII.
- **D.** His friend John XXIII made him a cardinal in 1958, perhaps signaling for both men a break with Pius XII.
- **E.** In the early years of John's pontificate, Montini worked hard to get the council off and running, even though he had some doubts about the whole project.
- **F.** It was known that John wished for Montini to succeed him. In the 1963 conclave, the 80 cardinals finally chose him on the fifth ballot.

II. When he became pope, Paul (r. 1963–1978) was not in an easy position. Vatican II was in adjournment, and he had to decide right away whether or not to reconvene it and carry on.

- **A.** In June of 1963, right after his election, he indicated his intention to continue the council and to seek some basic goals: carry on with the revision of canon law; promote justice in civil, social, and international life; and work for the peace and unity of all Christians.
- **B.** When he reopened the council in September of 1963, he introduced some procedural reforms and relaxed the rules of confidentiality.
- **C.** As we saw in the previous lecture, Paul prevented conservatives, such as Ottaviani, from damming up the council's work.
  - **1.** But Paul did add—almost certainly it was his work—a prefatory note to the Constitution on the Church (*Lumen Gentium*) that stressed papal authority and reigned in democratic ideas about collegiality.
  - **2.** Paul also stopped all discussion of ending priestly celibacy and reserved discussions of the "ends of marriage" (procreative and unitive) to his study commission and later encyclical.
- **D.** At the same time, Paul was even more forward-looking that John XXIII in the areas of ecumenism, religious liberty, and social justice, and he saw to the incorporation of major statements on these themes in the conciliar documents.
- **E.** During intervals in the council, Paul made many international and ecumenical gestures.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1. In December of 1964, he attended a eucharistic congress in Bombay, signaling papal interest in Asian Catholics.
2. In October of 1965, he addressed the United Nations and pleaded for an end to war.
3. In December of 1965, he and Athenagoras issued a joint resolution regretting the mutual excommunications of 1054.

III. With the council over, Paul had to deal with the implementation of its decrees and, perhaps, with developing an agenda for his own pontificate.

A. In terms of the continuing work of the council, Paul set up several commissions to deal with liturgical matters.

B. Paul reorganized the Curia and some financial departments. For example, he changed the old Holy Office to the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith.

C. Paul created several permanent secretariats: For the Promotion of Christian Unity, for Non-Christian Religions, and for Non-Believers.

D. Paul continued to travel, too. He met Athenagoras in Istanbul and visited Switzerland and Uganda, Sardinia and Spain, Australia, and the Philippines, where he survived an attempt on his life.

E. Paul developed a new Ostpolitik. He did not like communism any better than Pius XII, but he saw confrontation as unproductive.

F. Paul never abandoned his ecumenical efforts.

G. Anxious to carry on the council's work and to develop relations between the pope and the bishops, he created the World Synod of Bishops as a regular body.

1. The synod met five times and dealt with a range of issues.
2. The synods had lengthy agendas and were relatively short. They did not advance the governance of the Church or clarify fundamental ecclesiological issues.

H. In the years just after the council, Paul issued a series of documents that, taken together, are hard to assess because they seem to pull in different directions.

1. *Mysterium Fidei* (1965) endorsed the liturgical changes of the council while affirming traditional eucharistic doctrine.
2. *Populorum Progressio* (1967) was a ringing call for social justice, economic justice, and an end to colonialism.
3. *Sacerdotalibus Coelibatus* (1967) upheld priestly celibacy when many thought that the issue, having been shunted aside at the council, would come up for serious discussion afterwards.
4. *Humanae Vitae* (1968), the encyclical banning artificial contraception (actually affirming a traditional Catholic ban), is the most controversial document in Catholic history.
   a. Paul appointed a study commission in 1963. A majority of the commission supported contraception in certain circumstances for well-informed and faithful people.
   b. Paul apparently agonized over the decision, then went against his commission's recommendation. The results have been disastrous.
5. *Matrimonia Mixta* (1970) only slightly relaxed the rules governing marriages between a Catholic and a non-Catholic and the upbringing of their children.

I. In 1970, Paul delighted conservatives and angered the English when he canonized 40 English and Welsh religious martyrs from the 16th and 17th centuries.

J. At almost the same time, Paul made Catherine of Siena (1347–1380) and Teresa of Avila (1515–1582) Doctors of the Church, the first women ever so honored.

K. Paul raised the number of cardinals to 138 and reduced the number of Italian cardinals almost to insignificance.

1. He infuriated some of the diehard old-liners by saying that cardinals over 80 could not do curial business or vote in papal elections.
2. He also required priests and bishops to retire at 75.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

IV. After 1968, there was a noticeable change in Paul.

A. Paul faced the breakaway movement of Bishop Marcel Lefebvre, who believed that Vatican II was schismatic and heretical.

B. He had to deal with the negative reaction to *Humanae Vitae.*

C. He became increasingly concerned about terrorism.

D. There were rumors that he intended to resign or that he planned to move from the Vatican to the Lateran, where he would live with seminarians.

E. Paul's last act was poignant: He presided at the funeral of his friend of more than 50 years, Aldo Moro, the premier of Italy who had been captured and murdered by the Red Brigade terrorists.

F. Paul died after a short illness at Castel Gandolfo in August of 1978.

V. Paul is an enigma, and it is no easier to understand him given that he is framed by the heroic figures of John XXIII and John Paul II.

A. In some ways, Paul was courageous but, in other ways, indecisive and uncertain.

B. John XXIII said of him that he was like Hamlet.

Recommended Reading:

Hebblethwaite, *Paul VI.*

Tentler, *Catholics and Contraception*.

Questions to Consider:

1. How would you assess the pontificate of Paul VI: drifting, decisive, changeable?

2. How might Paul be viewed if *Humanae Vitae* were left out of the accounting?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twenty-Two
The Vatican and What It Does

Scope: The pope lives in Rome in a place called the Vatican. The Catholic Church has its headquarters in a place called the Vatican. There is a big museum in the Vatican. But what is this *Vatican*? This lecture provides some useful nuts-and-bolts information about the Vatican and some interesting sidelights on the people and structures that it comprises. At the end, we'll know what congregations and dicasteries are. We'll know what officials the Vatican has and what they do. The purpose of this lecture is to dispel some of the aura of mystery and intrigue that surrounds the Vatican.

Outline

I. In many lectures, we have encountered institutional terminology that seems strange, even to Catholics. In this lecture, we want to unpack some of that terminology in the context of a discussion of the Vatican as the governing center of the Roman Catholic Church.

- **A.** It is important to keep in mind from the start the sheer scale of what we are going to describe here.
  - **1.** There are approximately 1 billion Catholics in the world.
  - **2.** As we have seen, the Church is both old and highly centralized; it is not surprising that it has developed a complex governing structure.
- **B.** We have talked at some length in earlier lectures about the central institutions of the Church. Why do we return to the subject?
  - **1.** First, because things today are bigger, more expensive, and more complex than ever before.
  - **2.** Second, because we can describe today's Vatican in vastly more detail than was ever possible in the past.
  - **3.** Third, because we actually know more about the Church today than formerly.
  - **4.** And, fourth, because most people are likely to be more interested in the here and now than in the past and gone.

II. Let's begin by clearing up some very basic terminology: pope, Holy See, Vatican, Curia.

- **A.** Everything starts with the pope. What does he do?
  - **1.** There is no better place than to start with the Code of Canon Law, chapter 331:

    > The office uniquely committed by the Lord to Peter, the first of the apostles, and to be transmitted to his successors, abides in the Church of Rome. He is the head of the College of Bishops, the Vicar of Christ, and the Pastor of the Universal Church here on earth. Consequently, by virtue of his office, he has supreme, full, immediate, and ordinary power in the Church, and he can freely exercise this power.
  - **2.** Let us remember, too, that the papacy is always an idea, and the pope at the moment is the embodiment and expression of this idea.
  - **3.** The pope's titles are a key clue to what he does: His Holiness (note, not "His Majesty"), Bishop of Rome, Vicar of Jesus Christ, Successor of St. Peter, Prince of the Apostles, Supreme Pontiff of the Universal Church, Patriarch of the West, Servant of the Servants of God, Primate of Italy, Archbishop and Metropolitan of the Roman Province, Sovereign of the Vatican City State.
  - **4.** As bishop of Rome, the pope heads a diocese (the territory under the authority of any bishop); the pope has responsibility for 2.5 million Catholics, 334 parishes, and 5,331 priests.
  - **5.** Within the Church, the pope defines theology, regulates liturgy, canonizes saints, names bishops, and decides on charitable donations.
    - **a.** The pope is also, in principle, the final court of appeal for all Catholics.
    - **b.** The pope promotes Christian unity and understanding, speaks for Christianity to other religions, speaks for Christian values to the modern world, and responds to practically all issues that come before the world community.
- **B.** People refer to the Holy See, the Vatican, and the Curia.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1. The Holy See refers specifically to the authority of the pope to govern the Church.
2. *See* comes from *sedes* ("seat"), which basically translated the Greek *cathedra* ("chair").
3. The term *Apostolic See* is synonymous.
4. The Holy See makes treaties, receives diplomats, and sends diplomats.
5. The Holy See does not depend on Vatican City or the Papal States as it did, for example, between 1870 and 1929.

C. Vatican City is 108 acres, the product of the Lateran Accords of 1929 and, in a sense, of the 1,000-plus-year history of the Papal States.

1. The Vatican always had a certain importance but became the center of activity between 1870 and 1929 when the pope was the "prisoner of the Vatican" and lost touch with the Quirinal Palace and the Lateran.
2. Vatican City is fully recognized in international law but, curiously, does not send ambassadors, receive diplomats, and so forth. The Holy See performs these functions.
3. The pope is the governor of Vatican City, now under the 2000 Fundamental Law of the Vatican City State.
4. In 2003, the Vatican had 1,511 employees, including 1,432 lay people.
5. The Vatican is where the Holy See is located.

III. The Curia is a catch-all term for the papal government, the Holy See in action, what happens in the Vatican.

A. In his decree *Christus Dominus*, Paul VI said this about the Curia: "In exercising supreme, full, and immediate power in the universal Church, the Roman pontiff makes use of the departments of the Roman Curia which, therefore, perform their duties in his name and with his authority for the good of the churches and in the service of the sacred pastors."

B. The Curia as a whole is divided into 9 congregations, 3 tribunals, and 11 councils. The various branches of the Curia are often called *dicasteries*.

C. The Secretariat of State supervises all the other dicasteries, but the Congregation for the Doctrine of Faith is prominent because it has responsibility for the essentials of the faith.

D. The Secretariat of State, under the secretary of state (basically the pope's prime minister), goes back to 1644. It is divided into two branches.

1. The First Section, under the *sostituto* (the substitute for the secretary of state), oversees the day-to-day operations of the Church, meaning the Curia itself and the Church throughout the world.
2. The Second Section of the Secretariat oversees relations with states and will strike Americans as being more like our Department of State.
3. The Holy See maintains diplomatic relations with 211 countries and international bodies (including the United Nations, European Union, and Organization of American States) but not, currently, with China, Saudi Arabia, and Vietnam.
   a. The normal diplomatic officer is the nuncio.
   b. Nuncios look out for the legal and financial interests of the Church, protect religious freedom, and promote the Church's foreign policy and the priorities of the pope.
   c. The intelligence-gathering capabilities of the Church are unrivaled, but the papacy maintains strict neutrality and rarely makes information available to others.

E. The congregations, under prefects, are powerful because they oversee major areas of interest and responsibility and can make binding decisions.

1. They sit once a year in plenary session with the prefect (virtually always a cardinal), the cardinal members, bishops, and the secretary.
   a. Ordinary sessions meet more regularly and include those members who are resident in Rome.
   b. Congresses meet about monthly and include the prefect, the secretary, and other members as needed and appropriate.
2. The nine congregations are as follows:

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

a. Doctrine of Faith (formerly the Holy Office; before that, the Inquisition) defines official teachings, investigates wayward theologians, and screens the documents of the other dicasteries.
b. Eastern Churches deals with all Eastern Rite Catholics that are in full communion with Rome.
c. Causes of Saints deals with beatifications and canonizations.
d. Divine Worship and Discipline of the Sacraments deals with all issues pertaining to the worship of the Church.
e. Bishops deals with new appointments and the supervision of sitting bishops but does not control the nearly one-third of all dioceses regarded as missionary nor the bishops of the Eastern Rite Churches.
f. Evangelization of Peoples (formerly the Propaganda Fidei since the 17th century) deals primarily with mission territories, for instance, in Africa and Asia.
g. Clergy deals with the life and ministry of priests, preaching, and *catechetics* (instruction in the fundamentals of the faith and explanation of key doctrines) and the temporal administration of churches throughout the world.
h. Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life (often referred to as the Congregation for Religious) deals with *religious*, which in Catholic terminology, means people who belong to religious orders (Jesuits, Benedictines, Dominicans, and so forth).
i. Catholic Education deals with schools, universities, and seminaries.

F. The three tribunals essentially deal with the application of canon law, which in the 1983 revision, amounts to 1,752 canons.
1. The Apostolic Penitentiary deals with the *internal forum*, meaning matters of conscience that can be handled only secretly.
2. The Roman Rota is the main judicial forum and primarily handles appeals from ecclesiastical courts, that is, bishop's courts, around the world.
a. The largest order of business is marriage annulments: There were 591 cases in 1991 and 1,055 in 2001.
b. The Rota also hears appeals against decisions made by bishops.
3. Supreme Tribunal of the Apostolic Signature is the highest court of appeal, apart from the pope himself, who is always, in theory, the court of last resort.

G. The 11 pontifical councils all took their current shape after Vatican II, primarily to implement the council's decrees and to oversee the areas of responsibility falling under those decrees.
1. With two exceptions, these councils do not have "power of government"; they cannot issue binding decisions.
2. The role of the councils is persuasive more than coercive or judicial.
3. The pontifical councils are as follows: Laity; Christian Unity (dealing with ecumenical relations, including handling relations with Jews and Judaism); Family; Justice and Peace; *Cor Unum* (dealing with charity); Pastoral Care of Migrant and Itinerant People; Pastoral Care of Health Care Workers; Interpretation of Legislative Texts; Interreligious Dialogue (dealing with non-Christian religions except Judaism); Culture; and Social Communications.

H. There are a few offices that are not under one of the dicasteries.
1. Apostolic Camera derives from the financial administration of the Papal States and manages the Church's holdings in a papal interregnum.
2. Patrimony handles property and goods—valued at $800 million in 2003.
3. Economic Affairs manages the budget, approximately $230 million in 2003.
4. Papal Household manages the papal residence and audiences with the pope.
5. Liturgical Celebrations manages papal liturgies in Rome and on foreign travels.

I. Communications are not strictly part of the government but are important and have interlocking relationships with other branches.
1. *L'Osservatore Romano*, the Vatican newspaper, is published daily.
2. Vatican Radio has 400 staff members and 200 journalists from 61 countries; it broadcasts daily programs in 61 languages.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

3. Weekly television shows highlight the papacy's doings and provide live "feeds" of papal events.
4. Together, these communication services are expensive and take in no revenue.

IV. Paul VI instituted some major reforms.

A. Diocesan bishops were made full members of the congregations to ensure people with pastoral experience were included.

B. The dicasteries were significantly internationalized.

C. Heads of dicasteries were limited to terms of five years (but the terms could be renewed).

D. The Secretariat of State was placed at the top of the system.

V. Some concluding reflections might include the following:

A. In 2003, 2,659 people worked in the Curia, including 744 priests, bishops, archbishops, and cardinals and 1,524 lay people; 351 were women religious.

B. The Vatican is not rich.

1. The Vatican Bank controls $3.5 billion in assets, but these do not belong to the bank.
2. What would be the point of assessing the value of St. Peter's basilica, or Michelangelo's *Pietà*, or the ceiling of the Sistine Chapel?

Recommended Reading:

Allen, *All the Pope's Men*.

Reese, *Inside the Vatican*.

Questions to Consider:

1. What do you see as the principal strengths and weaknesses of the Church's government?
2. The pope may be infallible, but where do you see evidence that he must work in collaboration with others?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twenty-Three
John Paul II—"The Great"?

Scope: In 1978, Karol Wojtyla, archbishop of Krakow, was elected pope. He was the first Slav elected pope and the first non-Italian since Hadrian VI, a Dutchman, was elected in 1522. At the time of his death in 2005, he had served as pope longer than anyone except Pius IX. John Paul II traveled more than all the popes in history put together. He issued more than a dozen major encyclicals. He was a towering figure on the world stage and played a key role in the collapse of communism in Eastern Europe. He was controversial to some, respected by all, and loved by many. Although it is too early to take stock of his life in a balanced way, it is possible to review the major achievements of that life and to put them in the perspective of his times.

Outline

I. The year 1978 saw three popes. Paul VI died on August 6, and the cardinals assembled in Rome to elect his successor.

- **A.** There were serious divisions in the College, but on the third ballot, the cardinals elected Albino Luciani, the patriarch of Venice, "God's Candidate," as he was called.
  - **1.** Luciani, born in 1912, came from poor working-class parents and had not had a distinguished ecclesiastical career.
  - **2.** He had become well known in the Italian bishops' conference, but given that only 27 electors were Italian in 1978, there was no reason to see him as a serious candidate.
  - **3.** In taking the unique (at the time) double name John Paul, he signaled a desire to follow in the footsteps of his immediate predecessors.
  - **4.** He immediately faced the burgeoning Vatican Bank scandal, rife with accusations of embezzlement, financial mismanagement, and rumors of money that had been poured into dubious Italian political causes.
  - **5.** Always in poor health, he was found dead in his room on September 28, and immediately, baseless rumors of his murder spread.
- **B.** The cardinals returned to Rome to elect another pope.
  - **1.** Apparently, on the eighth ballot, the cardinals turned overwhelmingly (103 of 109 votes) to Karol Wojtyla, the archbishop of Krakow.
  - **2.** In choosing the name John Paul II (r. 1978–2005), he, too, signaled a desire to follow his predecessors.
  - **3.** He was the first Pole ever elected and the first non-Italian since the Dutchman Hadrian VI, who was elected in 1522.

II. Karol Josef Wojtyla was born May 18, 1920, in Wadowice, Poland.

- **A.** He was educated in local schools, at the Jagiellonian University (until it was closed by the Nazis), and in the underground seminary of the archbishop.
- **B.** Karol was ordained a priest in 1946 and soon left for the University of St. Thomas (the Angelicum) in Rome for graduate studies.
  - **1.** The Jagiellonian University awarded him a doctorate for his dissertation on *The Problem of Faith in St. John of the Cross* in 1948.
  - **2.** He taught at the Jagiellonian University until 1954, when the communists closed the theology faculty. Thereafter, he taught for 20 years at the Catholic University in Lublin.
  - **3.** Karol was consecrated as auxiliary bishop of Krakow in 1958.
- **C.** Karol Wojtyla achieved larger recognition at Vatican II, which he attended from the beginning.
  - **1.** John XXIII named him archbishop of Krakow in 1963, but communist interference delayed his taking office until 1964.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

2. Paul VI named him a cardinal in 1967.

III. When Wojtyla was elected pope, the Church was in turmoil.

A. The Vatican Bank scandal was still a blot on the Church's reputation.

B. Priests and nuns were leaving the ranks in huge numbers.

C. Conservatives and progressives were battling over the legacy of Vatican II.

D. Liberation theology was gaining virtual ascendancy in some areas, especially Latin America.

E. As pope, Wojtyla immediately addressed the bank scandal but took a larger view as well, dedicating himself to three particular areas of activity.

1. The ways in which the Cold War threatened world peace and the particular ways in which communism dehumanized individuals and disrupted the Church in Eastern Europe were almost an obsession with him.
2. The pope saw a need for a "new evangelization," which did not mean converting new peoples to Catholicism but, instead, reaffirming the faith of Catholics.
3. Finally, he felt a profound need to address the ravages wrought by modern culture on traditional social and moral values.

F. It has been suggested by some that the pope's single-minded pursuit of this agenda led him to neglect the day-to-day operations of the Vatican.

1. In fact, he instituted major reforms in the Curia, not least in his apostolic constitution *Pastor Bonus* (1988).
2. In his apostolic constitution *Universi Dominici Gregis* (1996), he made subtle changes in the College of Cardinals and in the procedures for electing a pope.

IV. The raw details of his 27-year pontificate—the longest after that of Pius IX—stagger the imagination.

A. He issued 14 encyclical letters, 44 apostolic letters, 10 apostolic constitutions, and 22 documents *motu proprio* ("on his own initiative").

B. He made 104 trips to foreign countries. He visited many countries where no pope had ever gone before.

C. He was the first pope, as far as is known, to visit Rome's synagogue and the first to visit a mosque, in Damascus. He prayed at Jerusalem's Western Wall, visited Auschwitz, and spoke at Yad Vashem, Israel's Holocaust Memorial.

D. He visited 317 of Rome's parishes.

E. He canonized 482 saints, again more than all his predecessors combined, and named 1,342 people "blessed."

F. He received 1.8 million people in his general audiences and countless more in other settings.

G. On his travels, he celebrated immense outdoor masses, including one in the Philippines attended by more than 4 million people.

V. This is not yet the time to try to place John Paul II into historical perspective. Nevertheless, certain broad themes can be discovered, and they conform well to the three goals enumerated already.

A. John Paul saw himself, above all, as a teacher, and he taught in a torrent of writings and through personal diplomacy.

B. Commentators have had a hard time defining John Paul.

1. Conservatives, who normally favor small government, applauded his centralization of authority in Rome.
2. Liberals, who normally desire strong government, disliked his tendency away from local control.
3. Conservatives liked John Paul's firm opposition to socialism and communism but were uneasy at his condemnation of raw capitalism.
4. Liberals liked the pope's staunch defense of working people, the poor, the oppressed, and the colonized but could not tolerate his stands on gays, abortion, and divorce.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

5. John Paul was not obstinate or out of touch. He was spectacularly consistent, but his values rose from his faith, not from the world's wisdom.

C. Where the Cold War and communism are concerned, John Paul knew these dreary realities firsthand and opposed them with every fiber of his being.

1. In the second journey of his pontificate, John Paul went home to Poland and told the Poles that they were men, not slaves. They took heart, and 10 years later, they were free.
2. Although the pope was generally well-disposed toward the democratic regimes of the West, he also found them soulless, secular, and aimless.

D. Where evangelization is concerned, John Paul worked on many fronts.

1. His first encyclical letter, *Redemptor Hominis* (1979), treated the salvific work of Jesus Christ. A year later, in *Dives in Misericordia*, he addressed the infinite love and mercy of God the Father. In 1986, with *Dominum et Vivificantem*, he addressed the Holy Spirit. Together, these three encyclicals constituted a penetrating reflection on the Triune God.
2. His travels were, in part, a way of communicating personally, but more important, they made the universal Church present at the local level.
3. A central component of John Paul's mission to evangelize was his outreach to other Christians and to non-Christians.
4. To clarify and remove ambiguities from Catholic teaching, he saw to the publication of the first new full catechism since Trent.
5. In the men he elevated to the cardinalate and in the saints he canonized, John Paul internationalized the Church as never before.

E. John Paul grappled with the culture of the modern world in multiple ways.

1. Everything for him started from a central theological premise that was rooted in the mysteries of creation, incarnation, and redemption.
2. John Paul spoke disparagingly about what he called "schools of suspicion," that is, modern philosophical and political movements based on reason that were cut loose from the ties of faith.
3. John Paul castigated aggressive individualism and acquisitiveness.
4. In the broad realm of sexual ethics, John Paul was a traditionalist but a deeply reflective one. He criticized the "Culture of Death."
    a. His *Evangelium Vitae* (1995) has been criticized, but it is a powerful affirmation of life.
    b. To the pope, contraception, abortion, homosexual acts, euthanasia, capital punishment, and war are all offenses against life, which is itself the greatest gift people possess.
    c. John Paul's affirmation of priestly celibacy arose from his sense that, in the sexually obsessed world in which we live, the voluntary renunciation of sex can be a powerful statement.
    d. John Paul's insistence that the Church "has no authority to ordain women" has obscured for some his "Theology of the Body," which is Christian feminism of a high order, even if it offends against the deeply held beliefs of secular feminists (and many Catholic feminists as well!).
5. The Modernist struggle had no terrors for John Paul.
    a. He was a serious intellectual and the author of some 10 books, ranging from the dryly academic to the sparklingly popular.
    b. He created or revitalized one pontifical academy after another: Life, Family, and Social Sciences joined Science—the oldest such body continuously in existence.

VI. We attempt to sum up.

A. Something very powerful drew 4 million people to pass reverently by John Paul's body in April of 2005.

B. He was *Time* magazine's "Man of the Year" for 1994.

C. Although vigorous and athletic even at the time of his election, the attempt on his life in Rome in 1981 (and there was another in the Philippines in 1982) began a downward spiral in his health.

D. He went to a prison to see his "brother" Mehmet Ali Agca, the man who shot him.

E. On his deathbed, his last words were, "Let me go to the house of the Father."

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Recommended Reading:

Hebblethwaite, *The Year of Three Popes*.

Weigel, *Witness to Hope*.

Questions to Consider:

1. How is it that both progressives and conservatives have found so much to admire and to criticize in John Paul II?
2. How would you go about making a case for and a case against John Paul's "greatness"?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lecture Twenty-Four
Benedict XVI, the Future, and the Past

Scope: On April 19, 2005, the cardinals elected Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger as successor to St. Peter and pope following John Paul II. This concluding lecture will follow four themes. We will begin with an account of what can be known at the present time about the conclave that elected Benedict. Then, we shall turn to the man who was elected. As the head of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith for more than 20 years, Cardinal Ratzinger established a visible and controversial public profile. But before he came to Rome, he was a professor, a scholar, and a bishop. We will look into his life in some detail. Next, we will measure some of the new pope's earliest pronouncements against some of his public work in an attempt to assess where he might take the world's billion Catholics. Finally, we shall offer a few reflections on the place of the pope in the 21st century.

Outline

I. In February of 2005, the health of John Paul II took a decided turn for the worse, and by March 30, it was clear that his condition was grave.

- **A.** On Saturday, April 2, at 9:37 P.M., John Paul died, and the news was announced at 9:55 P.M.
- **B.** On Friday, April 8, in St. Peter's Square, with Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger as the dean of the College of Cardinals presiding, John Paul's Requiem Mass was celebrated in the presence of more than 100 heads of state and 142 leaders of religious bodies.
- **C.** Cardinal Ratzinger's moving homily presented him to the world in a way no one had ever seen.

II. The cardinals had elected to begin the conclave on Monday, April 18.

- **A.** Between April 2 and 18, they met in 13 General Congregations to pray, reflect, and consult with one another.
- **B.** Before entering the conclave, the cardinals celebrated together the "Mass for electing the pope," then solemnly processed to the Sistine Chapel to begin their work.
- **C.** In the chapel, the cardinals took a general oath to observe faithfully all the provisions of John Paul II's 1996 apostolic constitution, *Universi Dominici Gregis.*
- **D.** On that first day, the cardinals voted once, and no one got the necessary two-thirds of the ballots cast: The number of voting cardinals was 115; thus, 77 votes were needed.
  - **1.** On the fourth ballot, Ratzinger received perhaps 100 votes and was elected.
  - **2.** Asked what name he chose, he replied, "Benedict."
- **E.** About 5:50 P.M., white smoke issued from the chimney of the small stove where the ballots are burned.

III. Joseph Ratzinger, Pope Benedict XVI (r. April 19, 2005–), was born April 16, 1927, and grew up in a small village in Bavaria in a deeply religious home.

- **A.** At 14, he was perforce enrolled in the Hitler Youth but took no active part in any of its activities.
- **B.** From 1946 to 1951, he studied theology at Munich.
  - **1.** In 1951, he was ordained a priest.
  - **2.** His later doctoral studies on Augustine and Bonaventure marked him as different in a world where official theology still revolved around Thomas Aquinas.
- **C.** For more than 20 years, he was a professor of theology in Freising, Münster, Bonn, Tübingen, and Regensburg.
- **D.** In 1977, Paul VI named him archbishop of Munich and, later that year, cardinal.
- **E.** At Vatican II, he was a *peritus* (expert) for Cardinal Frings of Cologne, and his increasingly distinguished academic reputation began to earn him wider recognition.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

F. In 1981, John Paul II named him prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, then repeatedly renewed his five-year terms in that office.

G. By 2005, his reputation and age (77 when John Paul died; he celebrated his 78th birthday during the interregnum) were thought to stand against him. Why, then, was he elected?

1. The events surrounding the death and funeral of John Paul II profoundly moved the cardinals.

2. His moving homily at John Paul's funeral gave him a public face more like the warm, generous, kind, attentive, responsive one recognized by all those who had worked with him.

3. Many cardinals were concerned about the Curia and perhaps believed that only someone with Ratzinger's experience could tame the beast.

4. There was no effective alternative.

IV. What sort of a pope will he be? Predictions are risky, but there are more than a few hints in the long public record and voluminous writings of this man.

A. The student rebellion of the 1960s, the sexual revolution, and academic secularism, skepticism, and rationalistic Postmodernism affected him deeply.

B. He says that he chose the name Benedict for two reasons.

1. St. Benedict (480–543) created a new, dynamic spirituality at the time when the ordered Roman world was passing away. He created a new history for Europe.

2. Pope Benedict XV was a tireless struggler for peace.

3. One may assume that Benedict XVI will wish to re-evangelize Europe and to work for peace in the world.

C. During the run-up to the conclave, he apparently reassured many people of his commitment to dealing with the problems of the Church in the Southern Hemisphere.

D. He is deeply committed to ecumenism but only in carefully restricted ways.

1. Like John Paul, he has a particular concern for healing the breach with the Orthodox.

2. He is likely to take a go-slow approach with Protestant denominations over such issues as gay rights and the ordination of women.

E. He thinks that the Church may need to be smaller and holier in order to be an effective witness in the world.

F. Early signs and many published comments suggest that he will listen and be more open and consultative than his predecessor.

G. He may curb the size of the Vatican.

H. Above all, he will be a teacher but not in the traveling mode of his predecessor.

V. The time has come to bring these lectures to a close and to reflect a little on the path we have traveled.

A. This has been a *history*, but perhaps this is the time to mention a remarkable *pseudo-history* of the popes, the "Prophecies of St. Malachy."

1. Malachy was a 12th-century Irish bishop who traveled to Rome, allegedly had visions, transcribed them, and gave them to Pope Innocent II.

2. The materials were supposedly undiscovered until 1590, when they were found and published. Actually, no one knows where this material came from.

3. The "prophecies" pertain to 112 popes, beginning with Innocent II (elected 1130). Each is given a cryptic motto that supposedly predicts who will be elected.

4. Benedict XVI is number 111 on this list. His motto is *gloria olivae* ("the glory of the olive"), which has led to all sorts of amusing speculation.

5. More intriguing is that number 112 will be Petrus Romanus, who will oppress the Church and usher in the end of the world.

B. From pseudo-history, let us return to the real thing and pass in review the four themes that I marked out at the beginning as ways to both organize our material and explain the sheer longevity of the papacy.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

1. I said that the papacy is, first of all, the history of an idea, the Petrine idea.
    a. We have seen the first faint hints of that idea in the Bible, the earliest articulations of that idea, and the solemn expressions of the Petrine ideal from late antiquity down to John Paul II.
    b. The steadfastness of the idea itself and of the popes' adherence to it is one key marker of papal longevity.
2. In the second place, I said that the papal history is the serial biography of 265 men.
    a. But, we may ask, was there not a woman pope, Pope Joan?
    b. No, but it is a tale that has been told and retold and is a barometer of just how important that papacy has always been.
    c. Continuity is another sign of durability, and the popes have been there, generation after generation, through politics, wars, revolutions, and schisms.
3. In the third place, the papacy is an institution.
    a. We have paused often to reflect in some detail on the papacy as an institution, and this aspect of the story has never been far from our thoughts.
    b. Institutions are important in ways that men cannot be.
4. Fourth and finally, the papacy is the history of Western civilization in microcosm.
    a. Popes have been promoters of and participants in virtually every significant movement of Western culture.
    b. Sometimes, popes have stood athwart the culture, as in the Modernist crisis.
    c. The 265th pope stands primed to take on what he perceives as the ills of contemporary culture, and the kind of papacy built by the popes since John XXIII will give him a privileged "bully pulpit."

C. No other figure on the world stage has the "reach," the prestige, or the influence of the pope. One cannot help but wonder what St. Peter would think of these 264 men who have succeeded him during almost two millennia.

Recommended Reading:

Allen, *The Rise of Benedict XVI*.

Ratzinger, *Salt of the Earth*.

Questions to Consider:

1. Reflecting on Benedict's life and thought, why do you think he has been such a controversial figure?
2. Now that you have studied the papacy's past, what sort of a future do you envision for the institution?

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Biographical Notes

The biographical sketches in this appendix cover nonpapal personages who figure prominently in the history of the papacy. Individual popes spotlighted in various course lectures are listed below. For further information, refer to http://www.newadvent.org/cathen/12272b.htm, a website that provides links to details about most of the popes.

Peter, Lecture One
St. Leo I (the Great), Lecture Two
Gregory I (the Great), Lecture Three
Hadrian I, Lecture Four
Sylvester II, Lecture Six
Gregory VII, Lecture Seven
Pius II, Lecture Thirteen
Julius II, Lecture Thirteen
Paul III, Lecture Fourteen
Paul IV, Lecture Fifteen
Paul V, Lecture Fifteen
Urban VIII, Lecture Sixteen
Benedict XIV, Lecture Sixteen
Pius IX, Lecture Seventeen
Leo XIII, Lecture Eighteen
Pius X, Lecture Eighteen
Benedict XV, Lecture Eighteen
Pius XI, Lecture Eighteen
Pius XII, Lecture Nineteen
John XXIII, Lecture Twenty
Paul VI, Lecture Twenty-One
John Paul I, Lecture Twenty-Three
John Paul II, Lecture Twenty-Three
Benedict XVI, Lecture Twenty-Four

Alberic II (d. 954): A son of Marozia and Alberic I; on his deathbed, he insisted that his 18-year-old son, Octavian, be elected pope.

Albornoz, Gil (1310–1367): Cardinal noted for his administrative genius and often reckoned the "Second Founder" of the Papal States.

Anacletus II (d. 1138) Antipope supported by the Pierleoni family, who had been the papacy's bankers since the 11th century. Discord over whether he or Innocent II should hold the papal office forced Innocent to flee Rome temporarily.

Aquinas, Thomas (1225–1274): Italian Dominican, trained at Paris and Cologne, taught in Paris and Rome, produced *Summa theologiae* and *Summa contra gentiles*. Greatest scholastic philosopher and theologian.

Arius (c. 250–336): Priest of Alexandria who, in an attempt to preserve absolute monotheism, taught that Jesus Christ was slightly subordinate to God the Father. Condemned by the Council of Nicaea in 325 but influential among Germanic peoples who were converted to Arianism.

Athenagoras I (1886–1972): Patriarch of Constantinople (1948–1972). In December 1965, he and Pope Paul VI issued a joint resolution regretting the mutual excommunications of 1054.

Augustine (354–430): Prolific Christian theologian and greatest of the Latin Church fathers. One of the most influential writers in Christian history.

Benedict XII (r. 1394–1409): The second of four antipopes (paralleling the legitimate Boniface XI [r. 1389–1404], Innocent VII [r. 1404–1406], and Gregory XII [r. 1406–1415]) during the Great Schism.

Benedict XIV (r. 1425–1430): The last of four antipopes (paralleling the legitimate Martin V [r. 1417–1431]) during the Great Schism.

Bonaparte, Napoleon (1769–1821): French emperor (1796–1815) whose dictatorship ended the French Revolution, while consolidating the reforms it had brought about.

Cajetan, St. (1480–1547): With Giovanni Pietro Caraffa (later Pope Paul IV), formed the Theatine order of priests, explicitly aimed at reforming the Church.

Calvin, John (1509–1564): French scholar and theologian, author of *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, founder of the "reformed" tradition of Christianity, and leader of the reform of the Church in French Switzerland.

Caraffa, Giovanni Pietro (Gianpietro) (1476–1559): With St. Cajetan, formed the Theatine order of priests, explicitly aimed at reforming the Church. Later elected pope, taking the name Paul IV.

Cavour, Camillo (1810–1861): Sardinian statesman and chief architect of Italy's unification.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Charlemagne (747–814): Greatest member of the Carolingian dynasty. King from 768 to 800; emperor from 800 to 814. Secured the frontiers of the Frankish kingdom, promoted cultural and institutional reform, and formulated the ideology of Christendom.

Charles V (1500–1558): The last Holy Roman Emperor crowned by a pope (Clement VII).

Clement VI (r. 1378–1394): The first of four antipopes (paralleling the legitimate Urban VI [r. 1378–1389] and Boniface XI [r. 1389–1404]) during the Great Schism.

Clement VII (r. 1409–1417): The third of four antipopes (paralleling the legitimate Gregory XII [r. 1406–1415]) during the Great Schism.

Conrad III of Hohenstaufen (1093–1152): Succeeded Lothar of Supplinburg as king in Germany (1138–1152) but never secured the imperial crown. Excommunicated by German bishops.

Constantine I (228?–337): Roman emperor (306–337) who continued the reforms of Diocletian, restructured the Roman army, granted toleration to Christianity, and became Christian himself.

Constantine IV (652–685): Roman emperor (668–685) who held the Sixth Ecumenical Council, which repudiated Monothelitism.

Constantius II (317–361): Roman emperor (337–361) who pushed the Arianist philosophy.

de Cramaud, Simon (1360–1422): Patriarch of Alexandria and administrator of the diocese of Avignon. With Peter Philarghi, the archbishop of Milan, oversaw the meeting of a council of the majority of Avignonese and Roman cardinals in Pisa in 1409.

Donatus (d. 355?): Bishop of Carthage in north Africa; founder of the Donatist sect.

Elizabeth I (1533–1603): Protestant Queen of England (1558–1603); excommunicated by Pope Pius V in 1570.

Febronius, Justinus (1701–1790): Pseudonym for Johann Nikolaus von Hontheim, auxiliary bishop of Trier, who published a proposed politico-ecclesiastical system featuring diminished papal power in an attempt to reconcile Protestants with the Catholic Church.

Francis of Assisi (1181/1182–1226): Founder of the Franciscan monastic order; devoted himself completely to a life of poverty.

Frederick (I) Barbarossa (1123–1190): The German king (1152–1190) and Roman emperor (1155–1190) whose efforts to control northern Italy called into being the Lombard League. The league's forces dealt Frederick a humiliating defeat at Legnano.

Frederick II of Hohenstaufen (1194–1250): Ward of the pope; elevated by Innocent III to the throne of Germany in 1212. His rule was marked by poor relations with Rome.

Galilei, Galileo (1564–1642): Scientist and astronomer; demonstrated mathematically that the Earth moves; was censured by the Church.

Garibaldi, Giuseppe (1807–1882): Italian nationalist revolutionary and leader in the struggle for Italian unification and independence.

Henry III (1017–1056): The German king (1039–1056) and Holy Roman emperor (1046–1056) who, in 1046, rode triumphantly into Italy; at Sutri, he deposed three rival contenders for the papacy and imposed a choice of his own.

Henry IV (1050–1106): The German king (1056–1105) and Holy Roman emperor (1084–1105) with whom Pope Gregory VII battled regarding whether clergymen could be invested by a layman.

Henry VIII (1491–1547): King of England (1509–1547) whose marriages and divorces led to a break with the Roman Catholic Church and creation of the Anglican Church.

Hostiensis (d. 1271): Thirteenth-century canonist known for saying that priestly dignity is exactly 7,644½ times greater than the royal, based, no doubt, on Ptolemy's claim that the Sun is 7,644½ times brighter than the Moon.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Jansen, Cornelius (1510–1576): In his intensive study of St. Augustine, Bishop Jansen came to a series of theological positions contrary to the customary teachings of the Catholic Church and close, in many ways, to the ideal of John Calvin. In 1640, his *Augustinus* was posthumously published but soon condemned, by the Sorbonne in 1649 and by Pope Innocent X in 1653.

Joseph II of Austria (1741–1790): German emperor (1765–1790) who developed religious reforms centered on reduction of the pope's authority.

Justin I (c. 450–527): Devout Catholic Roman emperor (518–527) who worked with Pope Hormisdas (r. 514–523) on the "Formula of Hormisdas," meant to achieve unity among different factions of the Church.

Justinian II (669–711): Roman emperor (685–695, 705–711) who called the Quinisext Council, which issued many decrees that were unacceptable in Rome.

Leo III (c. 680–741): Roman emperor (717–741) who campaigned against icons, spurring his zealous followers—Iconoclasts—to destroy them. In response to the papacy's condemnation of Iconoclasm, Leo stripped the papacy of critical revenues from southern Italy and the western Balkans.

Loisy, Alfred (1857–1940): French theologian, biblical scholar, and leader of the Modernist movement, which sought to apply the developments of modern science, philosophy, and criticism to Roman Catholic theology.

Lorenzo de' Medici (1449–1492): Financier and administrator; a virtual dictator in Florence but a great promoter of cultural life and booster of his city.

Lothar of Supplinburg (1075–1137): German king (1125–1137), favorably inclined toward the papacy, who helped Pope Innocent II wrest control of Rome from antipope Anacletus II.

Louis XIV (1638–1715): King of France (1643–1715), known as the Sun King. Louis expanded the effectiveness of the central government, increased the boundaries of France to the north and east, and placed one of his grandsons on the throne of Spain, but these successes cost the nation dearly. The economy suffered during the long years of war, taxes increased, and the countryside was left vulnerable to punishing famines.

Loyola, Ignatius (1491–1556): Spanish nobleman who founded the Society of Jesus (the Jesuits).

Luther, Martin (1483–1536): German-born Augustinian priest who became alienated from the Catholic Church over the issues of free will, good works, and indulgences. Initiated Church reform in Germany.

Machiavelli, Niccolò (1469–1527): Florentine politician and writer best known for *The Prince*, an intensely practical guide to the exercise of raw political power over a Renaissance principality. (The model for Machiavelli's *Prince* was Alexander VI's son Cesare Borgia.) Patronized by the Medici pope Leo X.

Malachy (1094–1148): Irish bishop who traveled to Rome and allegedly had visions pertaining to 112 popes, including predictions of who would be elected. He supposedly transcribed his visions—now known as the "Prophecies of St. Malachy"—and gave them to Pope Innocent II.

Marozia (c. 892–c. 937): Daughter of Theophylact and mistress of Pope Sergius III, by whom she had a son who was later elected pope as John XI. Marozia also married in succession three powerful men who, in concert with her, named and removed popes at will.

Mazzini, Giuseppe (1805–1872): Italian revolutionary, political theorist, and advocate of Italian unification. The highpoint of Mazzini's career came during the revolutions of 1848–1849, when he returned to Italy and was elected one of the leaders of the new Roman Republic.

Michelangelo Buonoratti (1475–1564): Florentine artist who mastered the techniques, styles, and influences of his time to produce breathtakingly original works of art, such as the statue of David and the ceiling of the Sistine Chapel.

Neri, Philip (1515–1595): Known as the "Apostle of Rome," a Florentine who embraced asceticism and founded the Confraternity of the Most Holy Trinity.

Otto I (912–973): German king (936–962) and Holy Roman Emperor (962–973) who confirmed the Carolingian territorial privileges for Rome.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Philarghi, Peter (1328–1423): Archbishop of Milan. With Simon de Cramaud, patriarch of Alexandria, he oversaw the meeting of a council of the majority of Avignonese and Roman cardinals in Pisa in 1409. He was elected pope, taking the name Alexander V.

Philip IV (1268–1314): King of France (1285–1314) known for his conflict with Pope Boniface VIII, which grew out of Philip's attempt to levy taxes against the clergy.

Pippin III (714–768): First Carolingian to become king (751–768). He allied with the popes, defeated the Lombards in Italy, and fostered Church and cultural reform.

Roger II of Sicily (1095–1154): Invaded and seized Apulia and Calabria, lands nominally held as papal fiefs. Pope Honorius II mounted a military expedition against Roger, but it was a dismal failure.

Savonarola, Girolamo (1452-1498): Fiery Florentine Dominical preacher who called for Church reform and was excommunicated by Pope Alexander VI.

Sigismund of Bohemia (1361–1437): King of Germany and Holy Roman Emperor responsible for the great reform councils of Constance (1414–1418) and Basel (1431).

Suleiman the Magnificent (1495–1566): Turkish sultan (1520–1566) who signed an anti-Habsburg pact with Francis I of France in 1536.

Theophylact (d. 920): A 9th-century duke and "Master of the Soldiers," as well as *vestararius*, or financial officer of the Church. Father of Marozia, who was mistress of one pope and mother of another.

Wibert of Ravenna (c. 1029–1100): Installed by Henry IV as an antipope (Clement III) after Pope Gregory VII excommunicated Henry in 1080.

Zeno (474–491): Roman emperor who bullied Pope Felix III (483–492) over Monophysitism.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Bibliography

Papal history is a vast subject with an immense bibliography, only a minor portion of which is available in English. Accordingly, the following bibliography is organized in sections that should prove helpful to those who wish to secure more information for themselves. Many of the works listed here contain rich bibliographies in European languages. Please note that some of the references are arranged chronologically by historical period rather than alphabetically. Books that themselves contain rich bibliographical information are marked with an asterisk (*).

Reference Tools:

Cross, F. L., and E. A. Livingstone, eds. *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*. 3rd ed. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1997. By far, the best brief encyclopedia of all matters Christian.

Kelly, J. N. D. *The Oxford Dictionary of Popes*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1986. By far, the best single-volume biographical dictionary.

Levillain, Philippe, ed. *The Papacy: An Encyclopedia*. New York: Routledge, 2002. An outstanding reference work with both biographical and topical entries.

**The New Catholic Encyclopedia.* New York: Thomson, Gale, 2002–. Fifteen volumes to date (replacing the *New Catholic Encyclopedia* of 1967). Excellent, reliable, and balanced.

General Histories (Large-Scale):

Creighton, Mandell. *A History of the Papacy from the Great Schism to the Sack of Rome*. 6 vols. London: Longmans Green, 1901. Sensible, reliable account by an Anglican bishop of London and formidable scholar.

———. *A History of the Papacy during the Period of the Reformation.* 5 vols. London: Longmans Green, 1892. Again, a sensible, reliable account by an Anglican bishop of London and formidable scholar.

Grisar, Hartmann, S.J. *A History of Rome and the Popes in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Luigi Cappadelta. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, and Trübner, 1911–1912. Dense but learned, based on the sources, and interesting on Rome.

Mann, Horace K. *The Lives of the Popes in the Early Middle Ages*. 18 vols. London: Kegan Paul, Trench, and Trübner, 1925–1932. Organized biographically and reliable in details if not always up to date in interpretation.

Pastor, Ludwig. *The History of the Popes from the Close of the Middle Ages*. 40 vols. London: J. Hodges, 1891–1953. Massive but judicious and readable; satisfying to browse in.

Ranke, Leopold von. *The Ecclesiastical and Political History of the Popes of Rome during the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries.* 3 vols. Translated by Sarah Austin. London: J. Murray, 1840. A masterpiece by one of the founders of modern historical scholarship, who although Lutheran, believed he could write with objectivity.

General Histories (Smaller Scale):

Baumgartner, Frederick J. *Behind Locked Doors: A History of the Papal Elections.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. Readable and fascinating.

Belitto, Christopher M. *The General Councils: A History of the Twenty-One General Councils from Nicaea to Vatican II*. New York: Paulist Press, 2002. Solid book on an important topic for papal history.

Cheetham, Nicholas. *Keepers of the Keys: A History of the Papacy from St. Peter to John Paul II*. New York: Scribners, 1982. Accessible, manageable, and balanced.

Collins, Michael. *The Fisherman's Net: The Influence of the Popes on History.* Blackrock, Ireland: Columba, 2003. More popular than scholarly, the book is true to its title.

*Duffy, Eamon. *Saints and Sinners: A History of the Popes.* 2nd ed. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002. Outstanding!

Jalland, Trevor Gervase. *The Church and the Papacy: A Historical Study.* London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1944. Balanced treatment of history and theology from a moderate Protestant point of view.

Kittler, Glenn D. *The Papal Princes: A History of the Sacred College of Cardinals.* New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1960. Perhaps the best of a small selection on this vast topic; now dated.

*La Due, William J. *The Chair of St. Peter: A History of the Papacy.* Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1999. Emphasizes the changing bases of papal authority.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Lo Bello, Nino. *The Incredible Book of Vatican Facts and Papal Curiosities: A Treasury of Trivia.* Ligouri, MO: Ligouri, 1998. Great fun!

*Maxwell-Stuart, P. G. *Chronicle of the Popes: The Reign-by-Reign Record of the Papacy from St. Peter to the Present.* London: Thames and Hudson, 1997. Lavishly illustrated with many quotations from primary sources.

Schatz, Klaus. *Papal Primacy from Its Origins to the Present.* Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1996. Comprehensive, fair, and readable.

Seppelt, Franz Xaver. *A Short History of the Popes*. St. Louis: Herder, 1932. An abridgement of his superb multivolume history in German.

Walsh, Michael J. *An Illustrated History of the Popes: St. Peter to John Paul II*. New York: St. Martin's, 1960. Readable and accessible.

———. *Conclave: A Sometimes Secret and Occasionally Bloody History of Papal Elections.* London: Sheed and Ward, 2003. Informative and a good read.

Wills, Garry. *Papal Sin: Structures of Deceit.* New York: Doubleday, 2000. Relentlessly negative but thought-provoking.

Primary Sources (Selective):

Carlen, Claudia. *Papal Encyclicals*. 5 vols. Wilmington, NC: McGrath, 1981. A rich source for the period from 1740 through Paul VI. For information on John Paul II, consult the Internet Resources listed at the end of this section.

Davis, Raymond. *Liber Pontificalis*: Translated as: *The Book of Pontiffs.* Rev. ed. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2000; *The Lives of the Eighth-Century Popes.* Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1992; *The Lives of the Ninth-Century Popes.* Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1995. Well-translated and helpfully annotated version of the crucial source for early papal history.

Flannery, Austin, O.P. *Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post-Conciliar Documents*. Northport, NY: Costello, 1975. The standard English translation of the Latin texts with only limited commentary and annotation.

Gregory the Great. *The Letters of Gregory the Great*. 3 vols. Translated by John R. C. Martyn. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2004. Papal letters are always valuable sources, and no pope is more interesting than Gregory I.

Shotwell, James T., and Louise Ropes Loomis. *The See of Peter.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1927; reprinted, 1991. Outstanding collection of documents from the first four centuries.

Tanner, Norman P., S.J., ed. *The Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*. 2 vols. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 1990. Convenient edition of a major source for papal and Church history.

Tierney, Brian. *The Crisis of Church and State, 1050–1300*. 1964. Reprinted, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1988. Excellent on the historical and ideological dimensions of the Investiture Controversy and its aftermath.

Studies of Particular Periods or Topics (Chronologically Arranged):

Weltin, Edward George. *The Ancient Popes.* Westminster, MD: Newman Press, 1964. Good on the neglected early period.

Guarducci, Margherita. *The Tomb of St. Peter: New Discoveries in the Sacred Grottoes of the Vatican.* New York: Hawthorn, 1960. Aggressively positive in its interpretation of the finds.

*O'Connor, Daniel William. *Peter in Rome: The Literary, Liturgical, and Archaeological Evidence.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1969. Reliable, readable, and balanced.

Brown, Raymond E., Karl P. Donfried, and John Reumann, eds. *Peter in the New Testament*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1973. A collaborative ecumenical treatment of a controversial topic.

Richards, Jeffrey. *The Popes and the Papacy in the Early Middle Ages*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979. Detailed account of the papacy's traverse from antiquity to the Middle Ages.

Llewellyn, Peter. *Rome in the Dark Ages.* 2nd ed. New York: Barnes and Noble, 1996. A solid narrative history of Rome and Italy from the 6th century to the 10th.

Ullmann, Walter. *A Short History of the Papacy in the Middle Ages*. London: Methuen, 1972. Excellent, manageable account by a major scholar.

 ©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Ullmann, Walter. *The Growth of Papal Government in the Middle Ages*. 3rd ed. London: Methuen, 1970. Standard but controversial account of papal institutions and ideology.

*Schimmelpfennig, Bernhard. *The Papacy.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1992. Poorly translated but a good history down to 1534.

*Noble, Thomas F. X. *The Republic of St. Peter: The Birth of the Papal State, 680–825*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1984. The origins of papal temporal rule and the early papal government.

Partner, Peter. *The Lands of St. Peter*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972. Comprehensive treatment of the Papal States to the end of the Middle Ages.

*Blumenthal, Uta Renate. *The Investiture Controversy: Church and Monarchy from the Ninth to the Twelfth Centuries*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988. Fine treatment of an important and difficult subject.

Tellenbach, Gerd. *Church, State, and Christian Society at the Time of the Investiture Controversy.* New York: Harper, 1970. Brilliant and penetrating.

*Morris, Colin. *The Papal Monarchy: The Western Church from 1050 to 1300*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1989. Emphasizes the papacy within a remarkable period.

Robinson, Ian S. *The Papacy, 1073–1198: Continuity and Innovation*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1990. Clear, comprehensive, and detailed.

Tierney, Brian. *The Origins of Papal Infallibility, 1150–1350: A Study in the Concepts of Infallibility, Sovereignty, and Tradition in the Middle Ages.* Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 1972. Fundamental.

Gill, Joseph. *Byzantium and the Papacy, 1198–1400.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1979. Informative on an important topic.

Mollat, Guillaume. *The Popes at Avignon, 1305–1378.* London: T. Nelson, 1963. One of the two standard studies on the topic (see below).

Renouard, Yves. *The Avignon Papacy, 1305–1403.* Hamden, CT: Archon Books, 1970. The second major study; treats the period after the restoration of the Roman line.

Smith, John Holland. *The Great Schism*. London: Hamish Hamilton, 1970. Still the only single-volume treatment.

Tierney, Brian. *Foundations of the Conciliar Theory.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1955. Seminal study now only slightly dated.

*Oakley, Francis. *The Conciliarist Tradition: Constitutionalism in the Catholic Church, 1300–1870.* Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2003. Learned and impressive history of a crucial topic.

Stinger, Charles. *The Renaissance in Rome.* Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1985. Essential and readable.

*Prodi, Paolo. *The Papal Prince: One Body and Two Souls—The Papal Monarchy in Early Modern Europe.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1987. Fascinating study of the princely papacy.

Thomson, John A. F. *Popes and Princes, 1417-1517: Politics and Polity in the Late Medieval Church.* Boston: Allen & Unwin, 1980. This book complements Prodi's (above) in giving a solid account of the nature of late medieval politics in general, with papal politics always in focus.

Signorotto, Gianvittorio, and Maria Antonietta Visceglia, eds. *Court and Politics in Papal Rome, 1492–1700.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Wide-ranging essays by major scholars.

*Wright, A. D. *The Early Modern Papacy: From the Council of Trent to the French Revolution.* Harlow, UK: Longman, 2000. Excellent brief survey.

Jedin, Hubert. *A History of the Council of Trent.* 2 vols. London: Nelson, 1957–1961. The standard history of this major council.

O'Connell, Marvin. *The Counter-Reformation: 1559–1610.* New York: Harper, 1974. Superseded in details but still the best survey.

Evennett, Henry O. *The Spirit of the Counter Reformation*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1970. Dated now in some details but a brilliant book.

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Gross, Hanns. *Rome in the Age of Enlightenment: The Post-Tridentine Syndrome and the Ancien Regime.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1990. Treats both the Roman scene in the Enlightenment period and the papal response to a changing intellectual culture.

*Coppa, Frank J. *The Modern Papacy since 1798*. Harlow, UK: Longman, 1998. An excellent introduction.

Hales, Edward Elton Young. *Revolution and Papacy, 1769–1846.* Garden City, NY: Hanover House, 1960. Fine account of a difficult period for the popes.

*Chadwick, Owen. *The Popes and European Revolution.* Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1981. Brilliant and readable by a major scholar.

*Chadwick, Owen. *A History of the Popes, 1830–1914*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1998. The best overall book on the 19th century.

Holmes, J. Derek. *The Triumph of the Holy See: A Short History of the Papacy in the Nineteenth Century.* London: Burns and Oates, 1978. Readable but half as long as Chadwick and less acute in judgment.

Butler, Edward Cuthbert. *The Vatican Council*. 2 vols. London: Longmans Green, 1930. Insider's account based on the letters of a participant.

Mondin, Battista. *The Popes of the Modern Age: From Pius IX to John Paul II.* Vatican City: Urbaniana University Press, 2004. Brief, lively, and informed by an Italian perspective.

Holmes, J. Derek. *The Papacy in the Modern World, 1914–1978.* New York: Crossroad, 1981. Readable and informative on the same scale as Mondin.

Falconi, Carlo. *The Popes in the Twentieth Century from Pius X to John XXIII*. Boston: Little Brown, 1968. Solid book by a major Italian scholar.

Vidler, Alexander Roper. *The Modernist Movement in the Roman Church*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1934. Still the best overall book on an important subject.

Jemolo, Arturo Carlo. *Church and State in Italy, 1850–1950.* Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1960. Unbiased account of an important and much-contested subject.

Hebblethwaite, Peter. *1978: The Year of Three Popes.* New York: Collins, 1979. Fascinating account of the two elections of 1978.

Tentler, Leslie Woodcock. *Catholics and Contraception: An American Story.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2004. An outstanding discussion of the background to and aftermath of *Humanae Vitae*.

Noonan, John T. *Contraception: A History of Its Treatment by the Catholic Theologians and Canonists.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1986. Fundamental treatment of the most controversial subject in modern Catholicism.

Reese, Thomas J. *Inside the Vatican: The Politics and Organization of the Catholic Church*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996. Sensitive account of *how* things work.

Ratzinger, Joseph Cardinal. *The Salt of the Earth: The Church at the End of the Millennium. An Interview with Peter Seewald.* San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1997. Keen insights into the mind of the man who was elected Pope Benedict XVI.

Allen, John L., Jr. *All the Pope's Men: The Inside Story of How the Vatican Really Thinks.* New York: Doubleday, 2003. Perhaps the best starting point for "Vaticanology."

Allen, John L., Jr. *The Rise of Benedict XVI.* New York: Doubleday, 2005. An "instant book" but excellent nevertheless.

Selected Biographies (Chronologically Arranged):

Jalland, Trevor Gervase. *The Life and Times of St. Leo the Great*. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1941. The only reasonably full study of this key pope.

*Markus, Robert. *Gregory the Great and His World*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Of the many books on Gregory, this one is the best.

*Cowdrey, H. E. J. *Pope Gregory VII, 1073–1085*. Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press, 1998. The fruit of a life's work by a major historian.

*Sayers, Jane. *Innocent III: Leader of Europe, 1198–1216.* London: Longman, 1994. Readable, intelligent, and comprehensive in a modest scope.

 ©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership

Boase, T. S. R. *Boniface VIII.* London: Constable, 1933. Still worthwhile.

Boureau, Alain. *The Myth of Pope Joan.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001. Brilliant, riveting, and important; the one book to read on the subject.

Wood, Diana. *Clement VI: The Pontificate and Ideas of an Avignon Pope*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1989. Difficult but an entrée into the Avignon period.

Mitchell, Rosamond Joscelyne. *The Laurels of the Tiara: Pope Pius II, 1458–1564.* London: Harvill Press, 1962. More popular than scholarly, this book is nonetheless valuable.

Shaw, Christine. *Julius II: The Warrior Pope.* Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1993. A good book and a great read.

Bainton, Roland. *Here I Stand: A Life of Martin Luther*. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1950. Dated, perhaps, but still the most readable biography of the Great Reformer.

Hales, Edward Elton Young. *Pio Nono*. New York: P.J. Kenedy, 1954. Still the best book in English.

Soderini, Eduardo. *The Pontificate of Leo XIII.* London: Burns and Oates, 1934. Old but not superseded on a crucial pope.

Giordani, Igino. *Pius X: A Country Priest*. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1954. Perhaps the best of a bad lot of ultra-pious books.

Rope, Henry Edward George. *Benedict XV: The Pope of Peace*. London: J. Gifford, 1941. Uncritical but solid on details.

Fontenelle, René. *His Holiness Pius XI.* Cleveland: Sherwood, 1939. Still serves in the absence of a scholarly book.

Halecki, Oskar. *Eugenio Pacelli: Pope of Peace.* New York: Creative Age Press, 1951. Written well before Pius died, this book provides a conventionally positive view.

Falconi, Carlo. *The Silence of Pius XII*. London: Faber, 1970. Critical but not harsh.

Cornwell, John. *Hitler's Pope: The Secret History of Pius XII.* New York: Penguin Books, 2000. The more one despises Pius, the more one will like this book.

*Sánchez, José M. *Pius XII and the Holocaust: Understanding the Controversy.* Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2002. Fair on a subject for which there has been only passion recently.

Hebblethwaite, Peter. *John XXIII*. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1984. Well-crafted book by a major interpreter of the recent papacy.

Johnson, Paul. *Pope John XXIII*. Boston: Little, Brown, 1974. Solid book by a popular writer.

Hebblethwaite, Peter. *Paul VI: The First Modern Pope.* New York: Paulist Press, 1993. Excellent and likely to remain the standard book for a long time.

Szulc, Tad. *Pope John Paul II: The Biography.* New York: Scribner, 1995. In fact, an interim report, very good on the early life and background.

Weigel, George. *Witness to Hope: The Biography of John Paul II*. New York: Cliff Street Books, 1999. Another interim report, with the active collaboration of its subject, and uncritical in a scholarly sense.

Internet Resources:

Catholic-Pages.com. www.catholic-pages.com. This is a Catholic website with a wide array of information and a rather pious orientation.

The Holy See. www.vatican.va/index.htm. This is the official website for the Vatican. With a little navigation, it will yield vast stores of information.

New Advent. www.newadvent.org. This is also a Catholic website with a great deal of useful information, including an online version of the "old" *New Catholic Encyclopedia.*

©2006 The Teaching Company Limited Partnership