

TECHNICAL REPORT

Guidance on how to conduct round robin tests for household and similar electrical appliances





THIS PUBLICATION IS COPYRIGHT PROTECTED

Copyright © 2016 IEC, Geneva, Switzerland

All rights reserved. Unless otherwise specified, no part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and microfilm, without permission in writing from either IEC or IEC's member National Committee in the country of the requester. If you have any questions about IEC copyright or have an enquiry about obtaining additional rights to this publication, please contact the address below or your local IEC member National Committee for further information.

IEC Central Office
3, rue de Varembe
CH-1211 Geneva 20
Switzerland

Tel.: +41 22 919 02 11
Fax: +41 22 919 03 00
info@iec.ch
www.iec.ch

About the IEC

The International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) is the leading global organization that prepares and publishes International Standards for all electrical, electronic and related technologies.

About IEC publications

The technical content of IEC publications is kept under constant review by the IEC. Please make sure that you have the latest edition, a corrigenda or an amendment might have been published.

IEC Catalogue - webstore.iec.ch/catalogue

The stand-alone application for consulting the entire bibliographical information on IEC International Standards, Technical Specifications, Technical Reports and other documents. Available for PC, Mac OS, Android Tablets and iPad.

IEC publications search - www.iec.ch/searchpub

The advanced search enables to find IEC publications by a variety of criteria (reference number, text, technical committee,...). It also gives information on projects, replaced and withdrawn publications.

IEC Just Published - webstore.iec.ch/justpublished

Stay up to date on all new IEC publications. Just Published details all new publications released. Available online and also once a month by email.

Electropedia - www.electropedia.org

The world's leading online dictionary of electronic and electrical terms containing 20 000 terms and definitions in English and French, with equivalent terms in 15 additional languages. Also known as the International Electrotechnical Vocabulary (IEV) online.

IEC Glossary - std.iec.ch/glossary

65 000 electrotechnical terminology entries in English and French extracted from the Terms and Definitions clause of IEC publications issued since 2002. Some entries have been collected from earlier publications of IEC TC 37, 77, 86 and CISPR.

IEC Customer Service Centre - webstore.iec.ch/csc

If you wish to give us your feedback on this publication or need further assistance, please contact the Customer Service Centre: csc@iec.ch.

TECHNICAL REPORT

Guidance on how to conduct round robin tests for household and similar electrical appliances

INTERNATIONAL
ELECTROTECHNICAL
COMMISSION

ICS 97.030

ISBN 978-2-8322-3488-4

Warning! Make sure that you obtained this publication from an authorized distributor.

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| FOREWORD..... | 3 |
| INTRODUCTION..... | 5 |
| 1 Scope..... | 6 |
| 2 Normative references..... | 6 |
| 3 Terms and definitions | 6 |
| 4 Process and responsibilities..... | 7 |
| 4.1 Process | 7 |
| 4.1.1 Product to be tested..... | 7 |
| 4.1.2 Parameters to be tested | 7 |
| 4.1.3 Measurement procedure..... | 8 |
| 4.1.4 RRT procedure | 8 |
| 4.2 Responsibilities..... | 9 |
| 4.2.1 Contracting body..... | 9 |
| 4.2.2 Coordinator..... | 9 |
| 4.2.3 Subcontractor | 9 |
| 4.2.4 Financing of RRT | 9 |
| 5 Testing laboratories | 9 |
| 5.1 Potential laboratories | 9 |
| 5.2 Announcement..... | 9 |
| 5.2.1 General | 9 |
| 5.2.2 Questionnaire | 9 |
| 5.2.3 Assessment of selection of laboratories | 10 |
| 5.3 Selection of laboratories..... | 10 |
| 5.4 Final list of laboratories | 10 |
| 6 Transportation of the product | 10 |
| 6.1 Logistics | 10 |
| 6.2 Packaging..... | 10 |
| 7 Test | 10 |
| 7.1 Execution of test | 10 |
| 7.2 Laboratory visit | 11 |
| 7.3 Transmission of result | 11 |
| 8 Analysis, report and termination..... | 11 |
| 8.1 Analysis..... | 11 |
| 8.2 Report | 11 |
| 8.2.1 Draft report | 11 |
| 8.2.2 Content of the internal report..... | 11 |
| 8.3 Termination and publication of final external report | 11 |
| Bibliography | 13 |

INTERNATIONAL ELECTROTECHNICAL COMMISSION

**GUIDANCE ON HOW TO CONDUCT ROUND ROBIN TESTS
FOR HOUSEHOLD AND SIMILAR ELECTRICAL APPLIANCES****FOREWORD**

- 1) The International Electrotechnical Commission (IEC) is a worldwide organization for standardization comprising all national electrotechnical committees (IEC National Committees). The object of IEC is to promote international co-operation on all questions concerning standardization in the electrical and electronic fields. To this end and in addition to other activities, IEC publishes International Standards, Technical Specifications, Technical Reports, Publicly Available Specifications (PAS) and Guides (hereafter referred to as "IEC Publication(s)"). Their preparation is entrusted to technical committees; any IEC National Committee interested in the subject dealt with may participate in this preparatory work. International, governmental and non-governmental organizations liaising with the IEC also participate in this preparation. IEC collaborates closely with the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) in accordance with conditions determined by agreement between the two organizations.
- 2) The formal decisions or agreements of IEC on technical matters express, as nearly as possible, an international consensus of opinion on the relevant subjects since each technical committee has representation from all interested IEC National Committees.
- 3) IEC Publications have the form of recommendations for international use and are accepted by IEC National Committees in that sense. While all reasonable efforts are made to ensure that the technical content of IEC Publications is accurate, IEC cannot be held responsible for the way in which they are used or for any misinterpretation by any end user.
- 4) In order to promote international uniformity, IEC National Committees undertake to apply IEC Publications transparently to the maximum extent possible in their national and regional publications. Any divergence between any IEC Publication and the corresponding national or regional publication shall be clearly indicated in the latter.
- 5) IEC itself does not provide any attestation of conformity. Independent certification bodies provide conformity assessment services and, in some areas, access to IEC marks of conformity. IEC is not responsible for any services carried out by independent certification bodies.
- 6) All users should ensure that they have the latest edition of this publication.
- 7) No liability shall attach to IEC or its directors, employees, servants or agents including individual experts and members of its technical committees and IEC National Committees for any personal injury, property damage or other damage of any nature whatsoever, whether direct or indirect, or for costs (including legal fees) and expenses arising out of the publication, use of, or reliance upon, this IEC Publication or any other IEC Publications.
- 8) Attention is drawn to the Normative references cited in this publication. Use of the referenced publications is indispensable for the correct application of this publication.
- 9) Attention is drawn to the possibility that some of the elements of this IEC Publication may be the subject of patent rights. IEC shall not be held responsible for identifying any or all such patent rights.

The main task of IEC technical committees is to prepare International Standards. However, a technical committee may propose the publication of a Technical Report when it has collected data of a different kind from that which is normally published as an International Standard, for example "state of the art".

IEC TR 62970, which is a Technical Report, has been prepared by IEC technical committee 59: Performance of household and similar electrical appliances.

This Technical Report is based on EN TR 50619:2014.

The text of this Technical Report is based on the following documents:

| | |
|---------------|------------------|
| Enquiry draft | Report on voting |
| 59/627/DTR | 59/652/RVC |

Full information on the voting for the approval of this Technical Report can be found in the report on voting indicated in the above table.

This publication has been drafted in accordance with the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2.

The committee has decided that the contents of this publication will remain unchanged until the stability date indicated on the IEC website under "<http://webstore.iec.ch>" in the data related to the specific publication. At this date, the publication will be

- reconfirmed,
- withdrawn,
- replaced by a revised edition, or
- amended.

A bilingual version of this publication may be issued at a later date.

INTRODUCTION

It is the responsibility of each standardization committee testing household and similar electrical appliances to establish the repeatability and reproducibility of the measurement standards developed.

Results from inter-laboratory comparisons are important for

- a) identification of interlaboratory differences;
- b) establishment of the effectiveness and comparability of test or measurement methods;
- c) validation of uncertainties;
- d) evaluation of the performance of laboratories for specific tests or measurements and monitoring laboratories' continuing performance;
- e) identification of problems in laboratories and initiation of actions for improvement which, for example, may be related to inadequate test or measurement procedures, effectiveness of staff training and supervision, or calibration of equipment; and
- f) education of participating laboratories based on the outcomes of such comparisons.

The need for ongoing confidence in laboratory performance is not only essential for laboratories and their contractors but also for other interested parties, such as regulators, laboratory accreditation bodies and other organizations that specify requirements for laboratories. ISO/IEC 17011 requires accreditation bodies to take account of laboratories' participation and performance in proficiency testing.

In this respect, round robin testing was widely made in the past by IEC TC 59 for the development of measurement procedures for the purpose of EU regulatory measures on Labelling and Ecodesign. Round robin test results have been widely taken into account in the establishment of regulations, in defining tolerance levels for verification of declared values and/or limits.

This document is intended to provide a consistent basis for performing round robin testing. It gives guidance to all interested parties to determine the competence among each other. It provides common ground for reliable statistical data (repeatability and reproducibility levels, etc.) as needed for regulation purposes (like for Labelling and Ecodesign).

GUIDANCE ON HOW TO CONDUCT ROUND ROBIN TESTS FOR HOUSEHOLD AND SIMILAR ELECTRICAL APPLIANCES

1 Scope

This document provides guidance for carrying out round robin tests (RRT) and hence for the determination of levels of repeatability (intra-laboratory variability) and reproducibility (inter-laboratory variability) for household and similar electrical appliances.

This document can also be used to verify the measurement methods, to improve the measurement method, and to qualify laboratories.

It is not applicable for the determination of production variation for a particular product.

General advice on proficiency testing of laboratories is given in ISO/IEC 17043. This document can be used in addition to ISO/IEC 17043.

NOTE The repeatability and reproducibility levels are important factors for the establishment of uncertainty margins of the measurement methods and for the definition of tolerance levels in verification schemes.

2 Normative references

The following documents are referred to in the text in such a way that some or all of their content constitutes requirements of this document. For dated references, only the edition cited applies. For undated references, the latest edition of the referenced document (including any amendments) applies.

ISO/IEC 17043:2010, *Conformity assessment – General requirements for proficiency testing*

IEC TR 61923, *Household electrical appliances – Method of measuring performance – Assessment of repeatability and reproducibility*

3 Terms and definitions

For the purposes of this document, the terms and definitions given in ISO/IEC 17043:2010 and the following apply.

ISO and IEC maintain terminological databases for use in standardization at the following addresses:

- IEC Electropedia: available at <http://www.electropedia.org/>
- ISO Online browsing platform: available at <http://www.iso.org/obp>

3.1

contracting body

organization or individual for which a round robin testing is provided through a contractual arrangement

[SOURCE: ISO/IEC 17043:2010, 3.3, modified – The term "customer" has been replaced by "contracting body". In the definition, "proficiency testing scheme" has been replaced by "round robin testing".]

3.2

repeatability

precision under repeatability conditions

Note 1 to entry: Repeatability can be expressed quantitatively in terms of the dispersion characteristics of the results.

[SOURCE: ISO 3534-2:2006, 3.3.5, modified – Cross-references have been deleted.]

3.3

reproducibility

precision under reproducibility conditions

Note 1 to entry: Reproducibility can be expressed quantitatively in terms of the dispersion characteristics of the results.

Note 2 to entry: Results are usually understood to be corrected results.

[SOURCE: ISO 3534-2:2006, 3.3.10, modified – Cross-references have been deleted.]

3.4

round robin testing

RRT

ring testing

process in which one or more items is tested according to a specific protocol by a number of different laboratories

Note 1 to entry: It is the intention to derive levels of repeatability and reproducibility and hence to make classifications of laboratories.

Note 2 to entry: The term “proficiency testing”, defined in ISO/IEC 17043:2010, 3.7, is more general, as it covers aspects other than derivation of repeatability and reproducibility.

Note 3 to entry: Round robin testing may be used for the evaluation of laboratory performance against pre-established criteria.

4 Process and responsibilities

4.1 Process

4.1.1 Product to be tested

The product category to be tested should be clearly specified and one or more representative products should be selected. If only one product is selected, it should be representative in the sense that it reflects the typical behaviour and performance of the defined product category. It is recommended that two or more products be tested in order to get an indication of the measurement uncertainty across the range of performance that is likely to be encountered in the market (for example, one product with high and one with low energy/water consumption or performance).

The products to be used for the RRT can be selected either by pre-testing, pre-selection or special production.

Additional sample(s) should be put aside as replacements in case any RRT samples are damaged.

NOTE It may be appropriate to circulate key items of test equipment or other test objects together with the RRT samples.

4.1.2 Parameters to be tested

The parameters to be tested should be clearly defined.

Usually the full parameter set of a measurement procedure should be covered (e.g. parameters as set out in IEC 60456 washing machine like washing performance, consumption values, time, rinsing efficiency). Noise may be seen as a different measurement procedure.

If repeatability and reproducibility of the measurement standard are to be assessed, all additional materials used for the testing should be as defined in the measurement procedure, and should not be specially selected. (Examples of such materials in the case of washing machine tests would include test swatches, soils and detergent.)

If it is considered likely that the reproducibility of results could be affected by batch-to-batch variability or different suppliers within given tolerances of the test material, this can form part of the RRT. In this case, different batches or different suppliers of material would need to be included in the test design of the RRT.

4.1.3 Measurement procedure

The measurement procedure(s) to be used for testing should be clearly defined. Preferably RRTs should be based on published IEC standards. For RRTs supporting standardization work, it may be necessary to use working papers such as a Committee Draft (CD) or even Document for Comments (DC) as the measurement procedure. Alternatively, national, international and/or industrial standards may be used and, where necessary, combinations of more than one measurement method can be used. It is essential therefore that clear instructions are given on which version of a measurement standard the RRT is based. If deviations between the standard used for the RRT and a later published standard exist, care should be taken in the interpretation of the results of the RRT in relation to the final published standard.

4.1.4 RRT procedure

The RRT procedure is based on sending one or more products to different laboratories to be tested according to the defined measurement procedure(s). Therefore, the same sample of the product(s) should be forwarded from laboratory to laboratory (serial procedure).

Care should be taken to ensure no damage or change (e.g. aging) occurs to the product during this process. Damage can be limited by ensuring the sample is properly packaged and that it is transported from laboratory to laboratory by a carrier with a proven track record of transporting delicate items.

The aging effect may be reduced using the parallel procedure described below but in any case, the extent of any aging should wherever possible be determined by re-testing the same product again in the first laboratory after it has gone through all the testing in the other laboratories. If severe changes are observed, the issue should be addressed by the coordinator to the contracting body.

As a second best alternative, more than one sample of the product selected is sent in parallel to the laboratories (parallel procedure). In this case, before the RRT begins, it should be demonstrated that all samples show similar behaviour under test. Again, the samples should wherever possible, be re-tested by the same laboratory at the end of the RRT to check for any change in behaviour under test.

For calculating reliable figures of the repeatability and reproducibility, a minimum of five laboratories should participate in an RRT. If more than 10 laboratories take part in an RRT, a parallel procedure combined with a serial procedure may be advisable for time reasons (e.g. samples showing similar behaviour are each sent to five laboratories).

4.2 Responsibilities

4.2.1 Contracting body

The body(ies) which is (are) running and/or financing the RRT should operate in a transparent manner towards all involved parties.

The contracting body should appoint an individual or a team to coordinate the RRT.

4.2.2 Coordinator

The coordinator should be on call throughout the testing phase.

The selection of coordinator should be fair, just and transparent. If only one person is coordinating the RRT, he/she should be neutral and independent. For example, he/she should not be employed by a product manufacturer or a test house involved in the RRT. Deviations from this rule may be necessary in individual cases.

Deviations from the recommendations should be documented by the coordinator and included in the final internal report.

4.2.3 Subcontractor

Subcontractors (collaborators) in RRT should inform the coordinator regularly about the progress. The coordinator should be informed about unforeseeable proceedings without any delay.

4.2.4 Financing of RRT

The coordinator should establish and agree with the contracting body the financing of the RRT. All costs (e.g. coordinator, subcontractor, product samples to be tested, logistics, test materials, testing) for the RRT should be defined and agreed before recruiting participant laboratories.

5 Testing laboratories

5.1 Potential laboratories

A list of potential laboratories should be prepared by the coordinator, in consultation with the contractor and relevant standardization bodies.

5.2 Announcement

5.2.1 General

The RRT should be announced publicly together with the qualification criteria as defined in document “Qualification of laboratories for verification procedures” (e.g. tender procedure, IEC TC 59 working group procedure) so that all laboratories that might be interested have the chance to apply to take part in the RRT.

Potential laboratories may be contacted directly.

5.2.2 Questionnaire

The announcement should be accompanied by a questionnaire where the general qualification of the laboratory (equipment, experience, certification, qualification) should be assessed. The laboratories are asked to answer within a fixed time frame.

If there are minimum qualification criteria given to take part in the RRT, interested laboratories should confirm fulfilling these qualification criteria as well as their agreement to the financial conditions. (See also Clause 8)

5.2.3 Assessment of selection of laboratories

An assessment scheme for selecting the laboratories, including a defined scoring and minimum requirements for selecting a laboratory, should be defined by the organizers before the announcement is sent out.

5.3 Selection of laboratories

All laboratories which comply with the minimum requirements and which have confirmed their interest should be allowed to take part in the RRT. If, for practical reasons, participation has to be limited, those laboratories should be chosen which have got the highest ranking according to the replies on their questionnaire. If laboratories express their interest in participating, but do not fulfil some minimum requirements, they may take part in the RRT as a learning exercise, but their test results should not be included in the final evaluation. They may be also excluded from any financial benefits.

5.4 Final list of laboratories

Based on the result of the assessment, the coordinator prepares a list of laboratories which are to participate in the RRT. In consultation with the laboratories, the coordinator establishes a sequence of testing and a timescale so that each laboratory knows when it will receive the RRT samples and when it will have to forward the samples to the next participating laboratory.

6 Transportation of the product

6.1 Logistics

The coordinator may contract a specialist company to transport the RRT samples from laboratory to laboratory.

Alternatively, once a laboratory has concluded the test, the product will be sent to the next one by this laboratory.

Whatever logistical system is used, it should be emphasized that special care in handling the samples is essential to avoid compromising their performance.

6.2 Packaging

Special care should be taken with packaging in order to reduce the chance of damage during the transportation. At least the same protection level as given by the packaging of normal production should be ensured, e.g. by using the same packaging material.

Packaging instructions should be defined if needed. It is recommended to make use of robust wooden boxes. The appliances could be fixed inside the box by the use of soft corner elements (e.g. polystyrene).

7 Test

7.1 Execution of test

Laboratories should execute the test in accordance with the measurement procedure. They should inform the coordinator immediately if any problems arise.

The coordinator should provide a format in which the test results should be reported.

7.2 Laboratory visit

If possible/affordable, the coordinator should visit each laboratory while RRT testing is in progress. During the visit, the following should be checked or verified:

- data given in the questionnaire, especially regarding the test equipment;
- calibration procedure documents relating to the test equipment;
- personal qualifications of persons involved in testing;
- compliance with the measurement procedure as specified for the RRT; and
- laboratory qualification or accreditation.

7.3 Transmission of result

Once a laboratory has concluded their tests, they send their measurement results to the coordinator. The coordinator stores the results in an anonymous form. At this stage, the coordinator should conduct a preliminary analysis of the results to assess the consistency of the data. If inconsistencies are encountered, these may be resolved through discussion with the laboratory concerned. The other participants should not be informed about the results at this stage.

8 Analysis, report and termination

8.1 Analysis

The coordinator or a subcontractor analyses the results following IEC TR 61923.

Special care should be taken on handling of outliers. Obvious outliers may be corrected (e.g. typing errors) after consultation with the laboratory concerned. When no clear reason can be assigned to an outlier result, it should be kept in the data files. Final evaluation should be done with and without outlying results.

8.2 Report

8.2.1 Draft report

A draft internal report should be prepared by the coordinator. The draft internal report should include the items described in 8.2.2. This report should be disseminated to all participating laboratories. The laboratories should be given the opportunity to respond to the draft report.

After this, the coordinator prepares the final internal report incorporating the feedback from the laboratories and disseminates it to all participating laboratories.

8.2.2 Content of the internal report

The report should include:

- results from individual laboratories (made anonymous if appropriate);
- discussion of outliers (if needed);
- standard deviations for each parameter (with and without outliers);
- repeatability and reproducibility levels for each parameter (with and without outliers);
- learning on possible or necessary improvements of standard.

8.3 Termination and publication of final external report

The coordinator should submit a statement to all participants informing them that the RRT has been completed.

Elementary results should be made available for third party scrutiny in an anonymous way at least within IEC TC 59. RRT data should not be made available to other non-participating parties without the agreement of all participating parties. It is helpful if the coordinator obtains agreement from the participants for this kind of disclosure before starting the RRT.

The final external report should be made public with only general results included so that competitive and sensitive information is not disclosed. The coordinator should report the results to the relevant technical committee of IEC TC 59.

Bibliography

IEC 60456, *Clothes washing machines for household use – Methods for measuring the performance*

ISO/IEC 17000, *Conformity assessment – Vocabulary and general principles*

ISO/IEC 17011, *Conformity assessment – General requirements for accreditation bodies accrediting conformity assessment bodies*

ISO/IEC 17025, *General requirements for the competence of testing and calibration laboratories*

ISO 3534-2:2006, *Statistics – Vocabulary and symbols – Part 2: Applied statistics*

ISO 5725-2, *Accuracy (trueness and precision) of measurement methods and results – Part 2: Basic method for the determination of repeatability and reproducibility of a standard measurement method*

ISO 5725-4, *Accuracy (trueness and precision) of measurement methods and results – Part 4: Basic methods for the determination of the trueness of a standard measurement method*

ISO 13528, *Statistical methods for use in proficiency testing by interlaboratory comparison*

Beer H., Stamminger R., Pozzi D., *How accurate can we measure dishwasher performance*, Third International Conference on Energy Efficiency in Domestic Appliances and Lighting (EEDAL'03), Turin, Italy, 2003

Czyzewski G., Hilgers T., *Updating the European performance standard for washing machines*, Fourth International Conference on Energy Efficiency in Domestic Appliances and Lighting (EEDAL'06), London, UK, 2006

Ennen G., *Household dishwashers energy consumption reduction – A success story*, Fourth International Conference on Energy Efficiency in Domestic Appliances and Lighting (EEDAL'06), London, UK, 2006

Czyzewski G., Hilgers T., *Energy efficiency of washing machines – A harmonized standard for a diversified market*, Fifth International Conference on Energy Efficiency in Domestic Appliances and Lighting (EEDAL'09), Berlin, Germany, 2009

ATLETE Project, *Guidelines for the verification of washing machines compliance to energy labelling and ecodesign requirements (revised version)* [viewed 2016-05-31]. Available at: <http://www.atlete.eu/2/doc/D8.3>

INTERNATIONAL
ELECTROTECHNICAL
COMMISSION

3, rue de Varembé
PO Box 131
CH-1211 Geneva 20
Switzerland

Tel: + 41 22 919 02 11
Fax: + 41 22 919 03 00
info@iec.ch
www.iec.ch